

Minutes of the 43rd meeting of the State Level Expert Appraisal Committee, West Bengal (2023-2026) held on July 10, 2024 at 14:00 hr at the Conference Room, Paribesh Bhawan, Bidhannagar.

The 43rd meeting of the State Level Expert Appraisal Committee (SEAC), West Bengal (2023-2026) was held on Wednesday the 10th July, 2024 at 14:00 hr at the Conference Room, Paribesh Bhawan, Bidhannagar. The following members participated:

1)	Dr. Rajesh Kumar, IPS	Secretary, SEAC	Present
2)	Prof. Anirban Gupta	Chairman, SEAC	Present
3)	Prof. Pradip Kumar Sikdar	Member, SEAC	Present
4)	Prof. Sampa Chakrabarti	Member, SEAC	Present
5)	Prof. Suchandra Bardhan	Member, SEAC	Present
6)	Prof. Aniruddha Mukhopadhyay	Member, SEAC	Present
7)	Prof. Indranath Sinha	Member, SEAC	Present
8)	Shri Shubhendu Bandyopadhyay	Member, SEAC	Present

1) Reconsideration proposals :-

1.1) Environmental Clearance:

1.1.1) Mining of Minerals (Other than sand):

- I. Proposed Upardanga Granite Stone Quarry over an area of 1 ha (2.471 Acres) of capacity 19564.36 MT/year at Mouza - Talsankra, J.L. No. - 163, Plot No. – 3310, P.S. - Raghunathpur, Dist. – Purulia, Pin – 723101, West Bengal.**

Proposal No.:	SIA/WB/MIN/442652/2023
Project Proponent:	M/s. Todi Minerals Private Limited.
Environmental Consultant:	M/s. Ultra-Tech.

Activities:

- This is a proposal for Upardanga Granite Stone Quarry over an area of 1.0 ha (2.471 Acres) at Mouza - Talsankra, J.L. No. - 163, Plot No. – 3310, P.S. - Raghunathpur, Dist. – Purulia, Pin – 723101, West Bengal.
- **The Lease Deed has been executed on 28.07.2005 for a period of 20 years. Therefore, the lease period is valid only upto 27.07.2025.**
- As required under the West Bengal Minor Mineral Concession Rules, 2016, the PP got a composite 'Mining Plan' prepared for proposed Granite Mine at the site by an RQP. The Plan has been approved by the State Government on 07.02.2023 and the approved plan has been uploaded at the PARIVESH portal by the PP.
- The year wise development and production for five years as mentioned in the Mining Plan is given below :-

YEAR	Avg. Length	Avg. Width	Avg. Height	Top RL	Bottom RL	Volume	Gross Volume	40% granite extractable volume	60% granite waste volume
	In (m.)	In (m.)	In (m.)	In (m.)	In (m.)	In (cum.m)	In (cum.m)	In (cum.m)	In (cum.m)
2022-23 (from May 2022)	36	32	4	172	168	4608	7056	2822	4234
	24	17	6	168	162	2448			
2023-24	74	16	6	168	162	7104	7104	2842	4262
2024-25	22	14	4	176	172	1232	7112	2845	4267
	74	9	4	172	168	2664			
	67	12	4	168	162	3216			
2025-26 (upto July 2025)	40	11	6	162	156	2640	2640	1056	1584
Total						23912	23912	9565	14347

- The PP has uploaded pre-feasibility report for the proposed project.

Chronology of the Events:

- The project proponent had already obtained Environmental Clearance vide No. 966/EN/T-II-1/008/2013 dated 17.04.2015 issued by SEIAA and Consent to Operate from WBPCB vide No. CO134679, Memo No. 290-WPBA/Red/Pol/Cont/192/05 dated 17.07.2023 which is valid upto 31.05.2028.
- The PP applied in prescribed format for Environmental Clearance for the expansion of production capacity and uploaded the application in the PARIVESH portal on 14.09.2023.
- The PP was called for the EC presentation in the 17th meeting of SEAC, WB (2023-2026) held on 18.10.2023 and the PP presented their proposal in this meeting.
- Based on the submission and presentation made by the PP, the committee made the following observations/ additional conditions:
 - The PP should submit Certified Compliance Report (CCR) from the MoEF&CC as directed in the Notification issued vide F No. IA3-22/10/2022-IA.III[E 177258] dated 08.06.2022.
 - The geo-coordinates of the project plot as mentioned in the Mine Plan and PFR does not match.
 - Site layout plan with green belt does not show the road access into the quarry area, while the existing road is clearly visible in the Google map. Thus, green belt area needs to be adjusted accordingly. The waste dump site connectivity w.r.to the quarry site is not clear. Is it the adjacent one? But then the profile does not match. Needs to be marked in a single Google map image with accessibility shown. Will there be another road at the back for waste dumping? Then greenbelt area will be further reduced. Haul road layout, storage area, Garland drain layout settling tank, and Rainwater harvesting Tank should be shown in a map/diagram. A revised map with the roads needs to be shown.
 - 'Road side green area' as shown in plantation plan- not clear if PP is committing to implement this. If yes, agreement with local body (panchayet?) for protection after

mine closure and specific management plan to be proposed. Compliance report should also include on the progress of all in-situ and ex-situ plantation health/ progressive plantation.

5. Need-based activities to be more specific. Consents from the beneficiaries should be furnished.
6. Photographs of existing condition of the site (geotagged with date) should be submitted.

The SEAC recommended that the above documents may be submitted in the PARIVESH portal for further consideration of the application.

- The project proponent uploaded their reply in PARIVESH Portal on 19.03.2024, which was considered in the 34th meeting of SEAC, WB (2023-2026) held on 03.04.2024.
- The SEAC scrutinized the documents submitted by the PP in the 34th meeting of SEAC, WB (2023-2026) held on 03.04.2024 and after careful consideration and detailed deliberation the committee noted that the PP has not submitted any specific and proper reply to the query raised. The PP is requested to submit specific and proper reply to the above and the documents may be submitted in the PARIVESH portal for further consideration of the application.
- The project proponent uploaded their reply in PARIVESH Portal on 24.06.2024, which was considered in the 43rd meeting of SEAC, WB (2023-2026) held on 10.07.2024.

SEAC observations and recommendations:

- The SEAC scrutinized the documents submitted by the PP in the 43rd meeting of SEAC, WB (2023-2026) held on 10.07.2024 and after careful consideration and detailed deliberation the committee observed the following :-
 - 1) The waste dump of 0.5 ha lies in Plot No. 3251 and the quarry area of 0.606 ha lies in Plot No. 3310. This is neither reflected in the approved mine plan or the Lease Deed granted to the PP. The lease area granted is of 1 ha in Plot No. 3310. Necessary clarification should be provided.
 - 2) The certificate by the RQP in the mine plan mentions that the Upardanga Granite Stone Quarry is over an area of 3.504 ha, while the mine plan and the Lease Deed mentions the area to be 1 ha. Necessary clarification should be provided.
 - 3) The afforestation programme given in the mine and mine closure plan do not match with the plantation plan submitted by the project proponent. Necessary clarification should be provided.
 - 4) Salient features of the project should be submitted.
 - 5) The Certified Compliance Report for the project mentions that the rate of survival of trees planted by the PP is less. The PP has to do tree plantation in an area equivalent to 33% of the lease area @2500 trees / ha within first two years from the starting of the mining operation. A Progressive Greenbelt Plan may be prepared. To enhance success/ survival rate the plantation shall be attempted during the first two years of the project life and the plantation so done shall be taken care of during the rest of the project life. Species of the plant selected should be self-sustaining in that particular region. Spatial year wise progressive plantation programme to be submitted.
 - 6) Compliance of earlier need-based activities given in the EC issued vide EC vide No. 966/EN-T-II-1008/2013 dated 17.04.2015. Evidence should be provided by photograph and/or certificate from the beneficiaries.

The SEAC recommended that the above documents may be submitted in the PARIVESH portal for further consideration of the application.

All the documents should be duly signed both by the project proponent and the environmental consultant.

The SEAC will further consider the case on submission of satisfactory reply on the above-mentioned queries only through “PARIVESH” portal.

1.1.2) Mining of Minerals :

- I. **Proposed Sarugaon Sand Mine (MIN_APD_9) over an area of 1.48 ha (3.65 Acres) on Khanavarti River at J. L. No. – 04, Plot No. 528, Mouza – Sarugaon, Village – Sarugaon, Police Station – Madarihat, District – Alipurduar, West Bengal.**

Proposal No.:	SIA/WB/MIN/422859/2023
Project Proponent:	M/s. West Bengal Mineral Development and Trading Corporation Limited.
Environmental Consultant:	M/s. Crystal Consultants.

Activities:

- This is a proposal for riverbed sand mining of MIN_APD_9 Sand Block over an area of 1.48 ha (3.65 Acres) on Khanavarti River at J. L. No. – 04, Plot No. 528, Mouza – Sarugaon, Village – Sarugaon, Police Station – Madarihat, District – Alipurduar, West Bengal.
- The project is falling within the potential zone code **AD_MD_AG_01**.

Chronology of Events:

- The PP applied in prescribed format for Environmental Clearance and uploaded the application in the PARIVESH portal on 21.03.2023.
- SEAC had recommended the project for Environmental Clearance in the 37th meeting (2023-2026) held on 04.05.2024 and forwarded the proposal to SEIAA.
- SEIAA in its 41st meeting held on 27.05.2024 referred back the proposal to SEAC for reappraisal and to confirm whether the project falls within 10 km. of National Park / Sanctuary / Eco-Sensitive Zone / Protected Area and provide its recommendation accordingly.

SEAC observations and recommendations:

- Considering the decision taken by the SEIAA in its 41st meeting held on 27.05.2024, the SEAC decided that the project proponent should submit a letter from PCCF (WL) to confirm whether the project falls within 10 km. of National Park / Sanctuary / Eco-Sensitive Zone / Protected Area.

The SEAC recommended that the above documents may be submitted in the PARIVESH portal for further consideration of the application.

The SEAC will further consider the case on submission of satisfactory reply on the above-mentioned queries only through “PARIVESH” portal.

Table-1 : List of the projects which were placed before the SEAC, WB (2023-2026) in the forth-third meeting held on 10.07.2024 and the Summary Decisions / Recommendations thereon:

Sl. No.	Name of the unit and Project address	Summary Decision
1. Reconsideration proposals		
1.1) Environmental Clearance		
1.1.1) Mining of Minerals (other than sand)		
I.	M/s. Todi Minerals Private Limited. Proposed Upardanga Granite Stone Quarry over an area of 1 ha (2.471 Acres) at Mouza - Talsankra, J.L. No. - 163, Plot No. – 3310, P.S. - Raghunathpur, Dist. – Purulia, Pin – 723101, West Bengal. (Proposal No.: SIA/WB/ MIN/442652/2023)	Additional Details Sought
1.1.2) Mining of Minerals		
I.	M/s. West Bengal Mineral Development and Trading Corporation Limited Proposed Sarugaon Sand Mine (MIN_APD_9) over an area of 1.48 ha (3.65 Acres) on Khanavarti River at J. L. No. – 04, Plot No. 528, Mouza – Sarugaon, Village – Sarugaon, Police Station – Madarihat, District – Alipurduar, West Bengal. (Proposal No. SIA/WB/MIN/422859/2023)	Additional Details Sought

There being no other agenda the Chair thanked the members present for their fruitful participation and deliberations. The meeting ended with a vote of thanks to the Chair.

Sd/-

(Anirban Gupta)
Chairman
S E A C, West Bengal

Sd/-

(Pradip Kumar Sikdar)
Member
S E A C, West Bengal

Sd/-

(Suchandra Bardhan)
Member
S E A C, West Bengal

Sd/-

(Sampa Chakrabarti)
Member
S E A C, West Bengal

Sd/-

(Indranath Sinha)
Member
S E A C, West Bengal

Sd/-

(Aniruddha Mukhopadhyay)
Member
S E A C, West Bengal

Sd/-

(Shubhendu Bandyopadhyay)
Member
S E A C, West Bengal

Sd/-

(Rajesh Kumar, IPS)
Secretary
S E A C, West Bengal