

Minutes of the 168th Meeting of Goa State Expert Appraisal Committee (Goa - SEAC) held on the 11th January 2023 at 03.30 p.m. in the conference hall, 4th Floor, Dempo Towers, Patto - Panaji, Goa.

The 168th meeting of the Goa-SEAC was held on 11th January 2023 in the Conference room 4th floor of the Dempo Towers, Patto - Panaji at 03.30 p.m. under the Chairmanship of Shri. Gautam Desai. The list of members who attended the meeting is at "Annexure - 1".

The Chairman welcomed the members and requested to proceed as per the agenda items (refer Annexure - 2).

1. To decide on application for Environmental Clearance for Sand Extraction in Chapora river Zone 3A received from Directorate of Mines & Geology Panaji Goa.

The representative of Directorate of Mines & Geology shri. Roshell Fernandes appeared before the Committee and explained the details of sand extraction in Goa as available in the records in their department.

Deliberation: After Scrutinizing the application submitted by the Directorate of Mines & Geology the Committee has noted that the proposal is for extraction of sand from the river Chapora village Agarvada Pernem North Goa & Parse Pernem North Goa by using traditional method i.e use of Canoes which has history even prior to Goa liberation during erstwhile Portuguese regime.

As referred to the notification issued by the MoEF&CC dated 1st January 2016, it is mandatory to prepare District Survey Report (DSR) & proper mining plan before obtaining prior Environmental clearance for the projects with respect to mining of minor minerals, however the Committee has not found such reports in the application submitted by the Directorate of Mines & Geology.

And further after scrutinizing the order passed by the Honble NGT in the matter title "**Sudarsan Das V/s Sate of West Bengal & Ors**" and "**Satendra Pandey V/s Ministry of of Environment and Climate Change and Anr** dated 4 September 2018 and 13th September 2018 respectively, the Committee has come to the Conclusion as follows

1. Providing EIA /EMP and therefore, Public Hearing for all areas more then 5 ha with respect to mining proposals following under category B2 at par B1 by SEIAA/ SEAC as well as for cluster situation where ever it is not provided in

h 5/20

h 5/20
h 5/20
Bital
Zorv
X

the EIA notification 2006

2. If an individual lease with an area of 0-5 ha then the respective project proposal falls under category B2

As referred to the Office memorandum issued by the MoEF&CC dated 12 December 2018 it is noted that the Ministry has also has given compliance to the said order.

AND WHEREAS, since the proposed area is more than 5 ha i.e 21.738 ha for the extraction of the sand it is be considered as B1 category as per the EIA notification 2006.

As per the EIA notification 2006 issued by MoEF&CC, procedure to grant EC for the project falls under B1 projects, comprise obtaining of ToR & preparation of the draft EIA report and Public hearing has to be conducted. However, as referred to the 138th Minutes of the meeting of Goa State Expert Appraisal Committee, Member Secretary has given justification that why should we consider as B2.

Decision: In view of above, the Committee has unanimously decided to seek clarification from Goa State Environment Impact Assessment Authority, whether the said proposal is to be treated as B1 or B2.

2. **To decide on application for Environmental Clearance for Sand Extraction in Chapora river Zone 4 received from Directorate of Mines & Geology Panaji Goa.**

The representative of Directorate of Mines & Geology shri. Roshell Fernandes appeared before the Committee and explained the details of sand extraction in Goa as available in the records in their department.

Deliberation: After Scrutinizing the application submitted by the Directorate of Mines & Geology the Committee has noted that the proposal is for extraction of sand from the river Chapora village Agarvada, Pernem North Goa & Parse, Pernem North Goa, by using traditional method i.e use of Canoes which has history even prior to Goa liberation during erstwhile Portuguese regime.

As referred to the notification issued by the MoEF&CC dated 1st January 2016, it is mandatory to prepare District Survey Report (DSR) & proper mining plan before obtaining prior Environmental clearance for the projects with respect to mining of minor minerals, however the Committee has not found such reports in

Handwritten signatures and initials at the bottom of the page.

Handwritten signature and initials on the right side of the page.

the application submitted by the Directorate of Mines & Geology.

And further after scrutinizing the order passed by the Honble NGT in the matter title “Sudarsan Das V/s Sate of West Bengal & Ors” and “ Satendra Pandey V/s Ministry of Environment and Climate Change and Anr dated 4 September 2018 and 13th September 2018 respectively, the Committee has come to the Conclusion as follows

1. Providing EIA /EMP and therefore, Public Hearing for all areas more then 5 ha with respect to mining proposals following under category B2 at par B1 by SEIAA/ SEAC as well as for cluster situation where ever it is not provided in the EIA notification 2006
2. If an individual lease with an area of 0-5 ha then the respective project proposal falls under category B2

As referred to the Office memorandum issued by the MoEF&CC dated 12 December 2018 it is noted that the Ministry has also has given compliance to the said order.

AND WHEREAS, since the proposed area is more then 5 ha i.e 16.388 ha for the extraction of the sand it is be considered as B1 category as per the EIA notification 2006.


As per the EIA notification 2006 issued by MoEF&CC, procedure to grant EC for the project falls under B1 projects, comprise obtaining of ToR & preparation of the draft EIA report and Public hearing has to be conducted. However, as referred to the 138th Minutes of the meeting of Goa State Expert Appraisal Committee, Member Secretary has given justification that why should we consider as B2.


Decision: In view of above the Committee has unanimously decided to seek clarification from Goa State Environment Impact Assessment Authority, whether the said proposal to be treated as B1 or B2.

The meeting ended with a vote of thanks to the chair.

Dr. Benjamin Braganca


Shri. Sanjay Amonkar









Dr. Dipak C.S. Gaitonde



Dr. Chandrashekher U. Rivonker



Dr. Subhash H. Bhosale



Shri Sujeetkumar Dongre





Shri. Gautam Vikas Desai
(Chairman Goa-SEAC)



Shri. Sanjeev Joglekar
(Member Secretary Goa-SEAC)

Place: Patto-Panaji

Date: 11th January 2023

Annexure – 1

The list of members who attended the meeting

Shri Gautam Vikas Desai	Chairman (Goa –SEAC)
Shri. Sanjeev Joglekar	Member Secretary (Goa –SEAC)
Shri. Sanjay Amonkar	Expert Member (Goa –SEAC)
Dr. Benjamin Braganca	Expert Member (Goa –SEAC)
Dr. Dipak C.S. Gaitonde	Expert Member (Goa –SEAC)
Dr. Chandrashekher U. Rivonker	Expert Member (Goa –SEAC)
Dr. Subhash H. Bhosale	Expert Member (Goa –SEAC)
Shri Sujeetkumar Dongre	Expert Member (Goa –SEAC)

Annexure - 2

1. To decide on application for Environmental Clearance for Sand mining in Chapora river Zone 3A received from Directorate of Mines & Geology Panaji Goa.
2. To decide on application for Environmental Clearance for Sand Mining in Chapora river Zone 4 received from Directorate of Mines & Geology Panaji Goa.
3. Any other matter with permission of the chair.