

Minutes of the 32nd meeting of the State Level Expert Appraisal Committee, West Bengal (2023-2026) held on March 13, 2024 at 14:00 hr at the Conference Room, Paribesh Bhawan, Bidhannagar.

The 32nd meeting of the State Level Expert Appraisal Committee (SEAC), West Bengal (2023-2026) was held on Wednesday the 13th March, 2024 at 14:00 hr at the Conference Room, Paribesh Bhawan, Bidhannagar. The following members participated:

1)	Dr. Rajesh Kumar, IPS	Secretary, SEAC	Present
2)	Prof. (Dr.) Anirban Gupta	Chairman, SEAC	Present
3)	Prof. Sampa Chakraborty	Member, SEAC	Present
4)	Prof. (Dr.) Suchandra Bardhan	Member, SEAC	Present
5)	Prof. (Dr.) Pradip Kumar Sikdar	Member, SEAC	Present
6)	Prof. (Dr.) Indranath Sinha	Member, SEAC	Present
7)	Prof. (Dr.) Aniruddha Mukhopadhyay	Member, SEAC	Present
8)	Shri Shubhendu Bandyopadhyay	Member, SEAC	Present

1) TECHNICAL PRESENTATIONS :-

1.1) Terms of Reference :

1.1.1) Mining of Minerals :

- I. **Proposed Katna Sand Mine over an area of 2.04 ha. (5.03 acres) on the Dwarakeshwar River at Mouza- Katna, J.L. No.- 79, Plot No.-1047, P.S. - Bishnupur, District – Bankura, West Bengal.**

Proposal No.	SIA/WB/MIN/74460/2022
Project Proponent -	M/s. Bose Enterprise (Shri Chanchal Basu).
Environmental Consultant -	M/s. Chaitanya Projects Consultancy Private Limited.

Activities:

- This is a proposal for Katna Sand Mine of Sand Block No.: 0117DR008 over an area of 2.04 ha. (5.03 acres) on the Dwarakeshwar River at Mouza- Katna, J.L. No.- 79, Plot No.-1047, P.S. - Bishnupur, District – Bankura, West Bengal.
- **The project is falling within the DSR potential zone code BNK_DW_BSP_16.**
- As required under the West Bengal Minor Mineral Concession Rules, 2016, the PP got a composite 'Mining Plan' prepared for proposed sand Mine at the site by an RQP. The Plan has been approved by the State Government on 24.05.2022 and the approved plan has been uploaded at the PARIVESH portal by the PP.
- The production details as mentioned in the Mining Plan is given below :-

Total Area (Ha)	Safety Zone(Ha)	Production Area (Ha)	Thickness (m)	Geological reserve in m3	Mineable reserve in m3
2.04	0.41	1.63	3.00	61200	48900

Mineable Reserve and Year wise proposed production details.

Year	Production Area (Ha)	Thickness (m)	Volume (cum)	Monthly Average production (cum)	Daily Average production (cum)
1	1.63	3.00	48900	6112.50	244.50
2	1.63	3.00	48900	6112.50	244.50
3	1.63	3.00	48900	6112.50	244.50
4	1.63	3.00	48900	6112.50	244.50
5	1.63	3.00	48900	6112.50	244.50

- The PP has uploaded cluster certificate from the competent authority. **The sand block is forming a cluster with adjacent 3 (three) no. sand blocks BID ID 2018_WB_1196/Bankura of M/s. Debraj Enterprise, BID ID 2018_WB_1198/Bankura of Shri Prasenjit Maji and BID ID 2018_WB_1199/Bankura of Shri Patit Makur.**
- The PP has uploaded pre-feasibility report for the proposed project.
- The PP has uploaded the copy of valid Lol from the competent authority.

Chronology of the Events:

- The PP applied in prescribed format for Terms of Reference and uploaded the application in the PARIVESH portal on 28.02.2024.
- The PP was called for the ToR presentation in the 32nd meeting of SEAC (2023-2026) held on 13.03.2024.

SEAC Observations and Recommendations:

- Based on the submission and presentation made by the PP, the SEAC observed that a **minor portion of the plot area** for the proposed project as per the geo-coordinates mentioned in the revised Mining Plan uploaded by the PP **falls outside the potential mining zone** recorded in the approved District Survey Report (DSR) of Bankura district.
- The estimated reserves as per the DSR have not been included in the Mining Plan.
- Based on the presentation and submission made by the PP, the SEAC **recommended** issuance of **Standard Terms of Reference** for EIA preparation for the project with the following additional conditions :-
 - 1) The plot area of the project should fall within the potential mining zone of the approved District Survey Report (DSR) of Bankura district.
 - 2) The reserves as per approved DSR should be incorporated in the revised Mine Plan.
 - 3) Photographs of the site mentioning the geo-coordinates.

- 4) Standard practice of management of the intermediate storage area should be submitted.
- 5) Means of access and egress between the embankment and the sand quarry may be clearly earmarked. The Project Proponent must commit that no hard toping or paving of any haulage route within the riverbed will be attempted.
- 6) A plan on the management and handling of sand during the period of intermediate stockpiling should be submitted.
- 7) A Progressive Greenbelt Plan may be prepared. The project area being entirely on the riverbed, afforestation/ vegetation should be attempted alongside the village roads or other public land. This may be done with prior approval of the local self-governing bodies. If no public land is available for the purpose the Project Proponent shall arrange for land with his personal means. To enhance success/ survival rate the plantation shall be attempted during the first two years of the project life and the plantation so done shall be taken care of during the rest of the project life. Species of the plant selected should be self-sustaining in that particular region. Spatial year wise progressive plantation programme to be submitted.
- 8) Plan showing spatial year wise distribution of the proposed greenbelt has to be submitted along-with supporting documents of administrative approval/s.
- 9) Being a mine in operation, the plantation created so far may be submitted with geotagged photographs.
- 10) EIA should also include detailed study of the baseline condition and impact on aquatic flora and fauna.
- 11) The project cost may include the auction bid value, estimated royalty to be paid, cost of any infrastructure built like office space, stockyard, etc. The calculation/documents to estimate the project cost should be submitted. The planned expenditure for components like need-based activities may be derived based on the project cost.
- 12) A need-based EMP may be prepared in accordance with the MoEF&CC Office Memorandum vide F. No. 22-65/2017.IA.III dated 30.09.2020. Record of communications made in this regard with the identified/ intended beneficiaries (schools/ institutions etc) may also be uploaded. Evidence of the activities already done should be provided by photographs with geo-coordinates. The activities should be completed within the first two years of the project life.
- 13) A study report on base flow level measured at 4 points with date and supporting photographs should be submitted. It should be committed that mining will be done at least 1m above the base flow level. Accordingly, if required, the excavation plan may also be revised.
- 14) Management plan including the final closure plan of haul road to be submitted.
- 15) Sieve analysis report for grain size distribution should be provided.
- 16) Study and protection plan of the aquatic life available both during the mining and non-mining seasons should be provided.

The PP shall, – while applying for environmental clearance, upload in the PARIVESH portal, the EIA/EMP report along with the documents/ submissions/ clarifications sought above.

All the documents should be duly signed both by the project proponent and environmental the consultant.

1.2) Environmental Clearance :

1.2.1) Mining of Minerals :

- I. **Proposed Riverbed Sand Mining over an area of 1.21 ha (3.00 Acre) on the Mansai River at J.L. No. 184, Plot No.- 2002(LR), Mouza- Bherbheri Manabari, Block & P.S. Mathabhanga, Dist- Coochbehar, West Bengal.**

Proposal No.: SIA/WB/MIN/265030/2022

Project Proponent: Shri Ganesh Berman.

Environmental Consultant: M/s. Ultra-Tech.

Activities:

- This is a proposal for riverbed sand mining over an area of 1.21 ha (3.00 Acre) on the Mansai River at J.L. No. 184, Plot No.- 2002(LR), Mouza- Bherbheri Manabari, Block & P.S. Mathabhanga, Dist- Coochbehar, West Bengal.
- As required under the West Bengal Minor Mineral Concession Rules, 2016, the PP got a composite 'Mining Plan with Progressive Mine Closure Plan' for riverbed sand mining at the site prepared by an RQP. The Plan has been approved by the State Government on 19.11.2018 and the approved plan has been uploaded at the PARIVESH portal by the PP.
- The PP has uploaded the pre-feasibility report for the proposed project.
- The PP has uploaded the copy of valid Lol.
- The **PP has not uploaded cluster certificate** from the competent authority.
- The **PP has not submitted the requisite EC processing fees** as required under Notification No 924/T-II-1/021/2022 dated 23.05.2022 issued by Department of Environment, Government of West Bengal.

Chronology of the Events:

- The PP applied in prescribed format for Environmental Clearance and uploaded the application in the PARIVESH portal on 31.03.2022. Thereafter, the proposal was delisted by SEIAA in its 57th meeting held on 29.04.2022. The proposal was again re-listed by the PP which was accepted by SEIAA on 28.02.2024 and forwarded to the SEAC for appraisal. SEAC accepted the proposal on 07.03.2024.
- The PP has submitted their request for withdrawal of the present EC application vide their letter dated 11.03.2024.

SEAC Observations and Recommendations:

- SEAC considered the request for withdrawal of the application by the PP in its 32nd meeting held on 13.03.2024 and decided to **recommend the proposal to SEIAA for rejection.**

II. Proposed Mahishmuri Sand Mine over an area of 0.24 ha (0.61Acre) on the Dharalar River at J.L. No. 01, Plot No. 4488(LR), Mouza- Mahishmuri, Block & P.S. Sitalkuchi, Dist- Coochbehar, West Bengal.

Proposal No.: SIA/WB/MIN/265000/2022

Project Proponent: Jahangir Alam.

Environmental Consultant: M/s. Ultra-Tech.

Activities:

- This is a proposal for Mahishmuri Sand Mine over an area of 0.24 ha (0.61Acre) on the Dharalar River at J.L. No. 01, Plot No. 4488(LR), Mouza- Mahishmuri, Block & P.S. Sitalkuchi, Dist- Coochbehar, West Bengal.
- As required under the West Bengal Minor Mineral Concession Rules, 2016, the PP got a composite 'Mining Plan with Progressive Mine Closure Plan' for riverbed sand mining at the site prepared by an RQP. The Plan has been approved by the State Government on 19.11.2018 and the approved plan has been uploaded at the PARIVESH portal by the PP.
- The PP has uploaded the pre-feasibility report for the proposed project.
- The PP has uploaded the copy of valid Lol.
- The **PP has not uploaded cluster certificate** from the competent authority.
- **The PP has not submitted the requisite EC processing fees** as required under Notification No 924/T-II-1/021/2022 dated 23.05.2022 issued by Department of Environment, Government of West Bengal.

Chronology of the Events:

- The PP applied in prescribed format for Environmental Clearance and uploaded the application in the PARIVESH portal on 31.03.2022. Thereafter, the proposal was delisted by SEIAA in its 57th meeting held on 29.04.2022. The proposal was again re-listed by the PP which was accepted by SEIAA on 28.02.2024 and forwarded to the SEAC for appraisal. SEAC accepted the proposal on 07.03.2024.
- The PP has submitted their request for withdrawal of the present EC application vide their letter dated 11.03.2024.

SEAC Observations and Recommendations:

- SEAC considered the request for withdrawal of the application by the PP in its 32nd meeting held on 13.03.2024 and decided to **recommend the proposal to SEIAA for rejection.**

III. Proposed River Bed Sand Mining over an area of 0.47 ha (1.16 Acre) on the Dharala River at J.L. No. 75, Plot No. 367(LR), Mouza – Andaran Panishala, Block & P.S. Mekhliganj, Dist- Coochbehar, West Bengal.

Proposal No. SIA/WB/MIN/264956/2022

Project Proponent - Shri Afijul Mohammad.

Environmental Consultant - M/s. Ultra-Tech.

Activities:

- This is a proposal for riverbed sand mining over an area of 0.47 ha (1.16 Acre) on the Dharala River at J.L. No. 75, Plot No. 367(LR), Mouza- Andaran Panishala, Block & P.S. Mekhliganj, Dist- Coochbehar, West Bengal.
- As required under the West Bengal Minor Mineral Concession Rules, 2016, the PP got a composite 'Mining Plan with Progressive Mine Closure Plan' for riverbed sand mining at the site prepared by an RQP. The revised Mining Plan has been approved by the State Government on 19.11.2018 and the approved plan has been uploaded at the PARIVESH portal by the PP.
- The PP has uploaded the pre-feasibility report for the proposed project.
- The PP has uploaded the copy of valid Lol.
- The **PP has not uploaded cluster certificate** from the competent authority.
- **The PP has not submitted the requisite EC processing fees** as required under Notification No 924/T-II-1/021/2022 dated 23.05.2022 issued by Department of Environment, Government of West Bengal.

Chronology of the Events:

- The PP applied in prescribed format for Environmental Clearance and uploaded the application in the PARIVESH portal on 31.03.2022. Thereafter, the proposal was delisted by SEIAA in its 57th meeting held on 29.04.2022. The proposal was again re-listed by the PP which was accepted by SEIAA on 28.02.2024 and forwarded to the SEAC for appraisal. SEAC accepted the proposal on 07.03.2024.
- The PP has submitted their request for withdrawal of the present EC application vide their letter dated 11.03.2024.

SEAC Observations and Recommendations:

- SEAC considered the request for withdrawal of the application by the PP in its 32nd meeting held on 13.03.2024 and decided to **recommend the proposal to SEIAA for rejection.**

IV. Proposed Riverbed Sand Mining over an area of 3.17 ha (7.83 Acre) on Jaldhaka River at J.L. No. 15, Plot No. 13631(P), Mouza-Fulbari, P.S. Ghoksadanga, Dist- Coochbehar, West Bengal.

Proposal No.:	SIA/WB/MIN/264046/2022
Project Proponent:	Shri Mukunda Berman.
Environmental Consultant:	M/s. Ultra-Tech.

Activities:

- This is a proposal for riverbed sand mining over an area of 3.17 ha (7.83 Acre) on Jaldhaka River at J.L. No. 15, Plot No. 13631(P), Mouza-Fulbari, P.S. Ghoksadanga, Dist- Coochbehar, West Bengal.
- As required under the West Bengal Minor Mineral Concession Rules, 2016, the PP got a composite 'Mining Plan with Progressive Mine Closure Plan' for riverbed sand mining at the site prepared by an RQP. The Plan has been approved by the State Government on 03.01.2019 and the approved plan has been uploaded at the PARIVESH portal by the PP.

- The PP has uploaded the pre-feasibility report for the proposed project.
- The PP has uploaded the copy of valid Lol.
- The **PP has not uploaded cluster certificate** from the competent authority.
- The **PP has not submitted the requisite EC processing fees** as required under Notification No 924/T-II-1/021/2022 dated 23.05.2022 issued by Department of Environment, Government of West Bengal.

Chronology of the Events:

- The PP applied in prescribed format for Environmental Clearance and uploaded the application in the PARIVESH portal on 31.03.2022. Thereafter, the proposal was delisted by SEIAA in its 57th meeting held on 29.04.2022. The proposal was again re-listed by the PP which was accepted by SEIAA on 28.02.2024 and forwarded to the SEAC for appraisal. SEAC accepted the proposal on 07.03.2024.
- The PP has submitted their request for withdrawal of the present EC application vide their letter dated 11.03.2024.

SEAC Observations and Recommendations:

- SEAC considered the request for withdrawal of the application by the PP in its 32nd meeting held on 13.03.2024 and decided to **recommend the proposal to SEIAA for rejection.**

2) Reconsideration proposals :-**2.1) Terms of Reference :****2.1.1) Mining of Minerals :**

- Proposed Kumirkola Sand Mine 3.25 Hectare (8.02 Acres) on River Damodar at Plot No.1404(P), 1405(P) & ORS., J.L. No.-9, Mouza- Kumirkola, P.S.- Khandoghosh, District- Purba Bardhaman, West Bengal.**

Proposal No.	SIA/WB/MIN/73980/2022
Project Proponent -	Shri Manik Chandra Mondal.
Environmental Consultant -	Not engaged.

Activities:

- This is a proposal for riverbed sand mining of KHANDGHOSH/KUMIRKOLA/1404(P)/1405(P) & ORS./F Sand Block over an extent of 3.25 Hectare (8.02 Acres) on River Damodar at Plot No.1404(P), 1405(P)&ORS., J.L. No.-9, Mouza- Kumirkola, P.S.- Khandoghosh, District- Purba Bardhaman, West Bengal, West Bengal.
- As required under the West Bengal Minor Mineral Concession Rules, 2016, the PP got a composite 'Mining Plan with Progressive Mine Closure Plan' for riverbed sand mining at the site prepared by an RQP. The Mine Plan has been approved by the State Government on 15.11.2018 and the approved plan has been uploaded at the PARIVESH portal by the PP.
- **The PP has uploaded the pre-feasibility report for the proposed project.**

- The PP has not uploaded the copy of valid Lol.
- The PP has not uploaded cluster certificate from the competent authority.

Chronology of the Events:

- The PP applied in prescribed format for ToR and uploaded the application in the PARIVESH portal on 22.03.2022.
- The PP was called for the EC presentation in the 67th SEAC meeting held on 22.02.2023 and the PP presented their proposal in this meeting.
- Based on the submission and presentation made by the PP, the SEAC observed that the plot area for the proposed project (geo-coordinates) as reported in the approved Mining Plan with Progressive Mine Closure Plan **overlaps with an adjacent project (proposal no. SIA/WB/MIN/262075/2022 of Ashim Panja)**. Also, the PP has not uploaded valid Lol and cluster certificate from the competent authority.
- Considering the above, the committee (SEAC), therefore, decided that the ToR for EIA study cannot be issued for the proposed project at this stage. **The project proponent is requested to submit revised and corrected proposal with all mandatory documents.**
- The project proponent uploaded their reply in PARIVESH Portal on 01.03.2024, which was considered in the 32nd meeting of SEAC (2023-2026) held on 13.03.2024.
- The SEAC observed that the PP has uploaded the revised Mining Plan, Lol, Cluster Certificate. The Mine Plan has been approved by the State Government on 09.02.2024.
- The production details uploaded by the PP is given below :-

Total Area (ha)	Safety Zone (ha)	Production Area (ha)	Thickness (m)	Geological Reserve In Cubic Meter	Mineable Reserves In Cubic Meter
3.25	0.65	2.60	2.88	93600	74880

Year wise production details as per Mine Plan

Year	Total Area (ha)	Production Area (ha)	Thickness (m)	Mineable Reserve (m3)	Geological reserve (m3)	Replenishment rate
1	3.25	2.60	2.88	74880	93600	100%
2	3.25	2.60	2.16	56160	70200	75%
3	3.25	2.60	2.16	56160	70200	75%
4	3.25	2.60	2.16	56160	70200	75%
5	3.25	2.60	2.16	56160	70200	75%
Total Reserve				299520	374400	

- The PP has uploaded cluster certificate from the competent authority. **The sand block is forming a cluster with adjacent 10 (ten) no. sand blocks.**

SEAC observations and recommendations:

- The SEAC scrutinized the documents submitted by the PP in the 32nd meeting of SEAC, WB (2023-2026) held on 13.03.2024. The SEAC observed that **the plot area** for the proposed project as per the geo-coordinates mentioned in the revised Mining Plan with Progressive Mine Closure Plan **falls within the potential mining zone** recorded in the approved District Survey Report (DSR) of Purba Bardhaman district.
- However, the SEAC noted that the lease area for the project is still **overlaps with an adjacent project (proposal no. SIA/WB/MIN/262075/2022 of Ashim Panja)**.
- Also, it is observed that the geo-coordinates mentioned in the revised Mining Plan and the Cluster Certificate uploaded in the portal do not match.
- Considering the above, the committee (SEAC), therefore, decided that the ToR for EIA study cannot be issued for the proposed project at this stage. **The project proponent is requested to submit revised and corrected proposal with all mandatory documents.**

All the documents should be duly signed by the project proponent and environmental consultant.

The SEAC will further consider the case on submission of satisfactory reply on the above-mentioned queries only through "PARIVESH" portal.

2.2) Environmental Clearance :**2.2.1) Mining of Minerals :**

- I. **Proposed Barjora Riverbed Sand Mine (MIN_BNK_11) over an area of 16.82 ha (41.56 Acres) on the Damodar River at Mouza – Pakhanna Bhairabpur, Plot No. 01, JL No. 57, PS – Barjora, Dist. – Bankura, West Bengal.**

Proposal No.	SIA/WB/MIN/455976/2023
Project Proponent -	M/s. West Bengal Mineral Development And Trading Corporation Limited.
Environmental Consultant -	M/s. Indian Mine Planners and Consultants

Activities:

- This is a proposal for Barjora Riverbed Sand Mine (MIN_BNK_11) over an area of 16.82 ha (41.56 Acres) on the Damodar River at Mouza – Pakhanna Bhairabpur, Plot No. 01, JL No. 57, PS – Barjora, Dist. – Bankura, West Bengal.
- **The project is falling within the DSR potential zone code BNK_DA_MJ_20.**
- The PP has obtained Provisional Grant Order for Sand Blocks vide Memo No. 689/ICE-12011(99)/68/2022-MINES Dated 30/11/2022.
- As required under the West Bengal Minor Mineral Concession Rules, 2016, the PP got a composite 'Mining Plan' prepared for proposed sand Mine at the site by an RQP. The Plan has been approved by the State Government on 17.02.2023 and the approved plan has been uploaded at the PARIVESH portal by the PP.
- The production details as mentioned in the Mining Plan is given below :-

Year	Total Area (ha)	Total Area (m ²)	Thickness (m)	Replenishment Rate (%)	Geological Resource (cu.m)
1 st	16.82	168200	3.00	100	504600
2 nd	16.82	168200	3.00	73.40	370376
3 rd	16.82	168200	3.00	73.40	370376
4 th	16.82	168200	3.00	73.40	370376
5 th	16.82	168200	3.00	73.40	370376
Total Geological Resource (cu.m)					1986105.6
Total Geological Resource (C.Ft.)					7.013 Cr

Leaving aside the safety berms and barriers, and taking into account the rate of replenishment, the mineable reserves are estimated as below

Year	Total Area (ha)	Thickness (m)	Replenishment Rate (%)	Mineable Reserve (cu.m)
1 st	15.58	3.000	100	4,67,400
2 nd	15.58	2.202	73.40	3,43,071.6
3 rd	15.58	2.202	73.40	3,43,071.6
4 th	15.58	2.202	73.40	3,43,071.6
5 th	15.58	2.202	73.40	3,43,071.6
Total Mineable reserves (cu.m)				1839686.4
Total Mineable reserves (c. Ft.)				6.50 Cr

- The PP has submitted the requisite EC processing fees as required under Notification No 924/T-II-1/021/2022 dated 23.05.2022 issued by Department of Environment, Government of West Bengal.
- The PP has submitted an undertaking regarding need-based EMP.

Chronology of Events

- The PP applied in prescribed format for Terms of Reference and uploaded the application in the PARIVESH portal on 21.03.2023 (proposal no. SIA/WB/MIN/422966/2023).
- The PP obtained Terms of Reference issued by SEIAA vide No. 787/EN-T-II-1/332/2023 dated 25.04.2023.
- Public Hearing was conducted by WBPCB on 12.10.2023.
- The PP applied for EC in prescribed format and uploaded final EIA report in the PARIVESH portal on 19.12.2023.
- The PP was called for the EC presentation in the 23rd meeting of SEAC, WB held on 03.01.2024 and the PP presented their proposal in this meeting.
- Based on the submission and presentation made by the PP, the committee observed that :
 - The non-cluster certificate has not been submitted in the proper format.
 - Annexure to the Grant Order has not been uploaded.

The above documents may be submitted in the PARIVESH portal for further consideration of the application.

- The project proponent uploaded their reply in PARIVESH Portal on 23.01.2024, which was considered in the 28th meeting of SEAC, WB (2023-2026) held on 07.02.2024.
- The SEAC scrutinized the documents submitted by the PP in the 28th meeting of SEAC, WB (2023-2026) held on 07.02.2024 and after careful consideration and detailed deliberation the committee observed that the PP has not submitted specific replies to the queries raised. Therefore, the PP is requested to submit specific and proper replies to the above-mentioned queries.
- The project proponent uploaded their reply in PARIVESH Portal on 01.03.2024, which was considered in the 32nd meeting of SEAC, WB (2023-2026) held on 13.03.2024.

SEAC observations and recommendations:

- SEAC noted that the PP has uploaded non-cluster certificate from the competent authority. **The sand block is not forming cluster with any adjacent sand block.**
- The SEAC scrutinized the documents submitted by the PP in the 32nd SEAC meeting held on 13.03.2024 and after careful consideration and detailed deliberation the committee **recommended the proposed project for Environmental Clearance** with the conditions that the following should be submitted along with the six monthly compliance report :-
 - a) Monthly monitoring of base flow level at four points of the project should be conducted by installing piezometer and to be reported in the six monthly compliance report.
 - b) Stipulated plantation should preferably be done adjacent to the project. If not possible due to unavailability of suitable land, plantation may be done at other location in the same block. The particular plantation area should be dedicated and marked for the particular project and to be certified by the respective BDO.
 - c) Sieve analysis report for grain size distribution should be provided along with six monthly compliance report.
 - d) Status of the need-based activities to be reported during six monthly progress report. The activities should be completed within the first two years of the project life.
 - e) Basic amenities, safety and occupational health examinations for labourers to be provided along with six monthly compliance reports.
 - f) To enhance success/ survival rate the plantation shall be attempted during the first two years of the project life and the plantation so done shall be taken care of during the rest of the project life. Species of the plant selected should be self-sustaining in that particular region. Geotagged photographs of actual plantation done to be submitted along with six monthly compliance reports.
 - g) Studies on the aquatic biota of the river in both monsoon and non-monsoon seasons as well as the impact of sand mining on the same should be done and a report should be submitted.
 - h) Bank line monitoring report should be submitted along with the six-monthly progress reports.

- II. **Proposed Bhatpara Sand Mine over an area of 2.30 ha (5.68 Acres) on the Kangshabati River at Plot No: - 172(P) & 194(P), J.L. No. - 84, Mouza: - Bhatpara, P.S. - Medinipur, District: - Paschim Medinipur, West Bengal.**

Proposal No.	SIA/WB/MIN/261603/2022
Project Proponent -	Shri Subhrangsu Kumar Ghosh.
Environmental Consultant -	M/s. Chaitanya Projects Consultancy Private Limited

Activities:

- This is a proposal for riverbed sand mining at the MSB-65 Sand Block over an extent of 2.30 ha (5.68 Acres) on the Kangshabati River at Plot No: - 172(P) & 194(P), J.L. No. - 84, Mouza: - Bhatpara, P.S. - Medinipur, District: - Paschim Medinipur, West Bengal.
- **The project is falling within the DSR potential zone code PO_PSM_MD_KS_14.**
- **The PP has not uploaded the proper pre-feasibility report (PFR) for the proposed project.** The reserves mentioned in the PFR are not in uniformity with the approved Mine Plan.
- **The PP has not uploaded the copy of valid LOI.**
- The PP has uploaded non-cluster certificate from the competent authority.
- As required under the West Bengal Minor Mineral Concession Rules, 2016, the PP got a composite 'Mining Plan' prepared for proposed sand Mine at the site by an RQP. **However, the above Mine Plan has not been endorsed by the competent authority.**
- **The PP has not submitted the requisite EC processing fees** as required under Notification No 924/T-II-1/021/2022 dated 23.05.2022 issued by Department of Environment, Government of West Bengal.

Chronology of Events

- The PP applied for EC in prescribed format in the PARIVESH portal on 15.12.2023.
- The PP was called for the EC presentation in the 24th meeting SEAC, WB held on 10.01.2024 and the PP presented their proposal in this meeting.
- Based on the submission and presentation made by the PP, the committee observed that the plot area for the proposed project as per the geo-coordinates mentioned in the approved Mining cum Progressive Mine Closure Plan **falls within the potential mining zone** recorded in the approved District Survey Report (DSR) of Paschim Medinipur district.
- The SEAC scrutinized the documents submitted by the PP in the 24th SEAC meeting held on 10.01.2024. Based on the submission and presentation made by the PP, the committee recommended that the following documents / clarifications may be uploaded in the PARIVESH portal by the project proponent for further consideration :-
 - 1) Valid Lol from the competent authority.
 - 2) Proper and corrected pre-feasibility report (PFR).
 - 3) Copy of the complete approved Mine Plan.

- 4) The copy of requisite EC processing fees as required under Notification No 924/T-II-1/021/2022 dated 23.05.2022 issued by Department of Environment, Government of West Bengal.
 - 5) A need-based EMP may be prepared in accordance with the MoEF&CC Office Memorandum vide F. No. 22-65/2017.IA.III dated 30.09.2020. Record of communications made in this regard with the identified/ intended beneficiaries (schools/ institutions etc.) may also be uploaded.
 - 6) Means of access and egress between the embankment and the sand quarry may be clearly earmarked. The Project Proponent must commit that no hard topping or paving of any haulage route within the riverbed will be attempted.
 - 7) A plan on management and handling of sand during the period of intermediate stock piling should be submitted.
 - 8) A Progressive Greenbelt Plan may be prepared. The project being a riverbed project afforestation/ vegetation should be attempted alongside the village roads or other public land. This may be done with prior approval of the local self governing bodies. If no public land is available for the purpose the Project Proponent shall arrange for land with his personal means. To enhance success/ survival rate the plantation shall be attempted during the first two years of the project life and the plantation so done shall be taken care of during the rest of the project life. Species of the plant selected should be self-sustaining in that particular region.
 - 9) Plan showing spatial distribution of the proposed greenbelt has to be submitted along-with supporting documents of administrative approval/s
 - 10) A study report on base flow level measured at 5 points with date and supporting photographs may be submitted. It should be committed that mining will be done at least 1m above the base flow level. Accordingly, if required, the excavation plan may also be revised.
- The project proponent uploaded their reply in PARIVESH Portal on 01.03.2024, which was considered in the 32nd meeting of SEAC, WB (2023-2026) held on 13.03.2024.
 - The SEAC observed that the PP has uploaded the copy of Mine Plan, Lol and other documents.
 - Year wise production details as mentioned in the Mining Plan is given below :-

Year	Total Area (ha)	Production Area (ha)	Thickness (m)	Geological Resource (cu.m)	Mineable Reserve (cu.m)	Replenishment Rate (%)
1 st	1.96	1.53	2.50	49000	38250	100
2 nd	1.96	1.53	1.88325	36911.7	28813.725	75.33
3 rd	1.96	1.53	1.88325	36911.7	28813.725	75.33
4 th	1.96	1.53	1.88325	36911.7	28813.725	75.33
5 th	1.96	1.53	1.88325	36911.7	28813.725	75.33
Total reserves				196646.8	153504.9	

SEAC observations and recommendations:

- The SEAC scrutinized the documents submitted by the PP in the 32nd SEAC meeting held on 13.03.2024 and after careful consideration and detailed deliberation the committee noted that the **coordinates mentioned in the approved Mine Plan and Cluster Certificate are in a mismatch.**

The SEAC recommended that the above documents may be submitted in the PARIVESH portal for further consideration of the application.

III. Proposed Barjora Riverbed Sand Mine (MIN_BNK_10) over an area of 9.50 ha (23.47 Acres) on the Damodar River at Mouza – Tajpur, Plot No. 1582, JL No. 56, PS – Barjora, Dist. – Bankura, West Bengal.

Proposal No.	SIA/WB/MIN/455472/2023
Project Proponent -	M/s. West Bengal Mineral Development And Trading Corporation Limited.
Environmental Consultant -	M/s. Indian Mine Planners and Consultants

Activities:

- This is a proposal for Barjora Riverbed Sand Mine (MIN_BNK_10) over an area of 9.50 ha (23.47 Acres) on the Damodar River at Mouza – Tajpur, Plot No. 1582, JL No. 56, PS – Barjora, Dist. – Bankura, West Bengal.
- The project is falling within the DSR potential zone code BNK_DA_BJ_20.**
- The PP has obtained Provisional Grant Order for Sand Blocks vide Memo No. 689/ICE-12011(99)/68/2022-MINES Dated 30/11/2022.
- The PP has uploaded non-cluster certificate from the competent authority. **The sand block does not form a cluster with any adjacent sand block.**
- As required under the West Bengal Minor Mineral Concession Rules, 2016, the PP got a composite 'Mining Plan' prepared for proposed sand Mine at the site by an RQP. The Plan has been approved by the State Government on 17.02.2023 and the approved plan has been uploaded at the PARIVESH portal by the PP.
- The production details as mentioned in the Mining Plan is given below :-

Year	Total Area (ha)	Total Area (m2)	Thickness (m)	Replenishment Rate (%)	Geological Resource (cu.m)
1 st	9.50	95000	3.00	100	285000
2 nd	9.50	95000	3.00	73.40	209190
3 rd	9.50	95000	3.00	73.40	209190
4 th	9.50	95000	3.00	73.40	209190
5 th	9.50	95000	3.00	73.40	209190
Total Geological Resource (cu.m)					1121760
Total Geological Resource (C.Ft.)					3.961 Cr

Leaving aside the safety berms and barriers, and taking into account the rate of replenishment, the mineable reserves are estimated as below:

Year	Total Area (ha)	Thickness (m)	Replenishment Rate (%)	Mineable Reserve (cu.m)
1 st	8.5272	3.000	100	255816
2 nd	8.5272	2.202	73.40	187769
3 rd	8.5272	2.202	73.40	187769
4 th	8.5272	2.202	73.40	187769
5 th	8.5272	2.202	73.40	187769
Total Mineable reserves (cu.m)				1006892
Total Mineable reserves (c. Ft.)				3.56 Cr.

- The PP has submitted the requisite EC processing fees as required under Notification No 924/T-II-1/021/2022 dated 23.05.2022 issued by Department of Environment, Government of West Bengal.

Chronology of Events

- The PP applied in prescribed format for Terms of Reference and uploaded the application in the PARIVESH portal on 20.03.2023 (proposal no. SIA/WB/MIN/422801/2023).
- The PP obtained Terms of Reference issued by SEIAA vide No. 809/EN-T-II-1/336/2023 dated 26.07.2023.
- Public Hearing was conducted by WBPCB on 11.10.2023.
- The PP applied for EC in prescribed format and uploaded final EIA report in the PARIVESH portal on 14.12.2023.
- The PP was called for the EC presentation in the 23rd meeting of SEAC, WB held on 03.01.2024 and the PP presented their proposal in this meeting.
- Based on the submission and presentation made by the PP, the committee observed that :
 - The non-cluster certificate has not been submitted in the proper format.
 - Certificate for need based EMP has not been submitted.
 - Annexure to the Grant Order has not been uploaded.

The above documents may be submitted in the PARIVESH portal for further consideration of the application.

- The project proponent uploaded their reply in PARIVESH Portal on 23.01.2024, which was considered in the 28th meeting of SEAC, WB (2023-2026) held on 07.02.2024.
- The SEAC scrutinized the documents submitted by the PP in the 28th meeting of SEAC, WB (2023-2026) held on 07.02.2024 and after careful consideration and detailed deliberation the committee observed that the PP has not submitted specific replies to the queries raised. Therefore, the PP is requested to submit specific and proper replies to the above-mentioned queries.
- The project proponent uploaded their reply in PARIVESH Portal on 01.03.2024, which was considered in the 32nd meeting of SEAC, WB (2023-2026) held on 13.03.2024.

SEAC observations and recommendations:

- SEAC noted that the PP has uploaded non-cluster certificate from the competent authority. **The sand block is not forming cluster with any adjacent sand block.**

- The SEAC scrutinized the documents submitted by the PP in the 32nd SEAC meeting held on 13.03.2024 and after careful consideration and detailed deliberation the committee **recommended the proposed project for Environmental Clearance** with the conditions that the following should be submitted along with the six monthly compliance report :-
 - a) Monthly monitoring of base flow level at four points of the project should be conducted by installing piezometer and to be reported in the six monthly compliance report.
 - b) Stipulated plantation should preferably be done adjacent to the project. If not possible due to unavailability of suitable land, plantation may be done at other location in the same block. The particular plantation area should be dedicated and marked for the particular project and to be certified by the respective BDO.
 - c) Sieve analysis report for grain size distribution should be provided along with six monthly compliance report.
 - d) Status of the need-based activities to be reported during six monthly progress report. The activities should be completed within the first two years of the project life.
 - e) Basic amenities, safety and occupational health examinations for labourers to be provided along with six monthly compliance reports.
 - f) To enhance success/ survival rate the plantation shall be attempted during the first two years of the project life and the plantation so done shall be taken care of during the rest of the project life. Species of the plant selected should be self-sustaining in that particular region. Geotagged photographs of actual plantation done to be submitted along with six monthly compliance reports.
 - g) Studies on the aquatic biota of the river in both monsoon and non-monsoon seasons as well as the impact of sand mining on the same should be done and a report should be submitted.
 - h) Bank line monitoring report should be submitted along with the six-monthly progress reports.

Table-1 : List of the projects which were placed before the SEAC, WB (2023-2026) in the thirty-second meeting held on 13.03.2024 and the Summary Decisions thereof:

Sl. No.	Name of the unit and Project address	Summary Decision
1. Technical Presentations		
1.1) Terms of Reference		
1.1.1) Mining of Minerals		
I.	M/s. Bose Enterprise (Shri Chanchal Basu). Proposed Katna Sand Mine over an area of 2.04 ha. (5.03 acres) on the Dwarakeshwar River at Mouza- Katna, J.L. No.- 79, Plot No.-1047, P.S. - Bishnupur, District – Bankura, West Bengal. (Proposal No. SIA/WB/MIN/74460/2022)	Recommended for Terms of Reference
1.1) Environmental Clearance		
1.1.1) Mining of Minerals		

Sl. No.	Name of the unit and Project address	Summary Decision
I.	Shri Ganesh Berman. Proposed Riverbed Sand Mining over an area of 1.21 ha (3.00 Acre) on the Mansai River at J.L. No. 184, Plot No.- 2002(LR), Mouza- Bherbheri Manabari, Block & P.S. Mathabhanga, Dist- Coochbehar, West Bengal. (Proposal No. SIA/WB/MIN/265030/2022)	Rejected
II.	Shri Jahangir Alam. Proposed Mahishmuri Sand Mine over an area of 0.24 ha (0.61Acre) on the Dharalar River at J.L. No. 01, Plot No. 4488(LR), Mouza- Mahishmuri, Block & P.S. Sitalkuchi, Dist- Coochbehar, West Bengal. (Proposal No. SIA/WB/MIN/265000/2022)	Rejected
III.	Shri Afijul Mohammad. Proposed River Bed Sand Mining over an area of 0.47 ha (1.16 Acre) on the Dharala River at J.L. No. 75, Plot No. 367(LR), Mouza – Andaran Panishala, Block & P.S. Mekhliganj, Dist- Coochbehar, West Bengal. (Proposal No. SIA/WB/MIN/264956/2022)	Rejected
IV.	Shri Mukunda Berman. Proposed Riverbed Sand Mining over an area of 3.17 ha (7.83 Acre) on Jaldhaka River at J.L. No. 15, Plot No. 13631(P), Mouza-Fulbari, P.S. Ghoksadanga, Dist- Coochbehar, West Bengal. (Proposal No. SIA/WB/MIN/264046/2022)	Rejected
2. Reconsideration Proposals		
2.1) Terms of Reference		
2.1.1) Mining of Minerals		
I.	Shri Manik Chandra Mondal. Proposed Kumirkola Sand Mine 3.25 Hectare (8.02 Acres) on River Damodar at Plot No.1404(P), 1405(P) & ORS., J.L. No.-9, Mouza- Kumirkola, P.S.- Khandoghosh, District- Purba Bardhaman, West Bengal. (Proposal No.: SIA/WB/MIN/73980/2022)	Additional Details Sought
2.2) Environmental Clearance		
2.2.1) Mining of Minerals		
I.	M/s. West Bengal Mineral Development And Trading Corporation Limited Proposed Barjora Riverbed Sand Mine (MIN_BNK_11) over an area of 16.82 ha (41.56 Acres) on the Damodar River at Mouza – Pakhanna Bhairabpur, Plot No. 01, JL No. 57, PS – Barjora, Dist. – Bankura, West Bengal. (Proposal No.: SIA/WB/MIN/455976/2023)	Recommended for Environmental Clearance
II.	Shri Subhrangsu Kumar Ghosh Proposed Bhatpara Sand Mine over an area of 2.30 ha (5.68 Acres) on the Kangshabati River at Plot No: - 172(P) & 194(P), J.L. No. - 84, Mouza: - Bhatpara, P.S. - Medinipur, District: - Paschim Medinipur, West Bengal.	Additional Details Sought

Sl. No.	Name of the unit and Project address	Summary Decision
	(Proposal No. SIA/WB/MIN/261603/2022)	
III.	M/s. West Bengal Mineral Development And Trading Corporation Limited Proposed Barjora Riverbed Sand Mine (MIN_BNK_10) over an area of 9.50 ha (23.47 Acres) on the Damodar River at Mouza – Tajpur, Plot No. 1582, JL No. 56, PS – Barjora, Dist. – Bankura, West Bengal. (Proposal No.: SIA/WB/MIN/455472/2023)	Recommended for Environmental Clearance

There being no other agenda the Chair thanked the members present for their fruitful participation and deliberations. The meeting ended with a vote of thanks to the Chair.

Sd/-

(Prof. (Dr.) Anirban Gupta)
Chairman

State Expert Appraisal Committee, West Bengal

Sd/-

(Dr. Pradip Kumar Sikdar)
Member

State Expert Appraisal Committee, West Bengal

Sd/-

(Prof. (Dr.) Suchandra Bardhan)
Member

State Expert Appraisal Committee, West Bengal

Sd/-

(Prof. (Dr.) Sampa Chakraborty)
Member

State Expert Appraisal Committee, West Bengal

Sd/-

(Shri Shubhendu Bandyopadhyay)
Member

State Expert Appraisal Committee, West Bengal

Sd/-

(Prof. (Dr.) Aniruddha Mukhopadhyay)
Member

State Expert Appraisal Committee, West Bengal

Sd/-

(Dr. Rajesh Kumar, IPS)
Secretary

State Expert Appraisal Committee, West Bengal