

Minutes of the 57th meeting of the State Level Expert Appraisal Committee, West Bengal (2023-2026) held on December 26, 2024 at 14:00 hr at the Conference Room, Paribesh Bhawan, Bidhannagar.

The 57th meeting of the State Level Expert Appraisal Committee (SEAC), West Bengal (2023-2026) was held on Thursday the 26th December, 2024 at 14:00 hr at the Conference Room, Paribesh Bhawan, Bidhannagar. The following members participated:

1)	Dr. Rajesh Kumar, IPS	Secretary, SEAC	Present
2)	Prof. Indranath Sinha	Vice Chairman, SEAC	Present
3)	Prof. Pradip Kumar Sikdar	Member, SEAC	Present online
4)	Prof. Sampa Chakrabarti	Member, SEAC	Present
5)	Prof. Aniruddha Mukhopadhyay	Member, SEAC	Present
6)	Shri Shubhendu Bandyopadhyay	Member, SEAC	Present

1) Reconsideration Proposal :-

1.1) Environmental Clearance :

1.1.1) Construction Sector :

- I. Proposed Expansion cum Modification of Residential cum Commercial Complex “Godrej Prakriti” at 187 F/1 (Old-150), B.T. Road, Sodepur, Mouza - Rambhadrabati & Sukhchar, JL No. 7 & 9, Ward No. 14 of Panihati Municipality, Dist. North 24 Parganas, Kolkata 700115, West Bengal.**

Proposal No.:	SIA/WB/INFRA2/440642/2023
Project Proponent:	M/s. Godrej Properties Ltd.
Environmental Consultant:	M/s. Ultra-Tech.

Activities:

- This is a proposal for expansion and modification of Q Block (from B+G+19 to B+G+21), R Block (from B+G+19 to B+G+21), new MLCP Block (B+G+4) and a hospital (G+2) in B+G+18 instead of day care in this project.

Salient Features of the project:

- Salient features of the proposed project as uploaded by the PP in the PARIVESH portal is as below –

	As per Environmental Clearance vide memo no. 1317/EN/T-II-1/026/2018, dated 07.10.2020 [A]	Expanded/Modified part [B]	Total (As per sanctioned building plan) [A+B]
Land Area as per Deed	108091.98 sqm (26.71 Acres)	108091.98 sqm (26.71 Acres)	108091.98 sqm (26.71 Acres)

	As per Environmental Clearance vide memo no. 1317/EN/T-II-1/026/2018, dated 07.10.2020 [A]	Expanded/Modified part [B]	Total (As per sanctioned building plan) [A+B]
Land Area Vested (Under 14Z Rule)	10157.53 sqm (2.51 Acres)	10157.53 sqm (2.51 Acres)	10157.53 sqm (2.51 Acres)
Land Transferred to Municipality	5260.93 sqm (1.30 Acres)	5260.93 sqm (1.30 Acres)	5260.93 sqm (1.30 Acres)
Remaining Total Site Area	92673.39 sqm (22.90 Acres)	92673.39 sqm (22.90 Acres)	92673.39 sqm (22.90 Acres)
Building Profile	Club House – G+1, Community Hall – G+2, Retail Block – G+3 Block A,B,C,D,E – G+14 Block F,G,H,I – G+19, Block J & L – G+4 Block K,N,O,P,Q,R- B+G+19 Block M – B+G+4 Block S+MLCP – G+19 Day Care cum Residential – B+G+18	2 floors added in Block Q (From B+G+19 to B+G+21) 2 floors added in Block R (From B+G+19 to B+G+21) 1 new MLCP Block – B+G+4 Hospital – G+2 in B+G+18	Club House – G+1, Community Hall – G+2, Retail Block – G+3 Block A,B,C,D,E – G+14 Block F,G,H,I – G+19, Block J & L – G+4 Block K,N,O,P- B+G+19 Block M – B+G+4 Block Q, R – B+G+21 Block S+MLCP – G+19 Hospital cum Residential – B+G+18 MLCP Block – B+G+4
Total no of Building (Nos)	23	1	24
No. of Residential / Business Units	2618 Flats	57 Flats, No. of beds for hospital - 150	2675 Flats and Hospital beds – 150 nos.
Expected Population	12004 Persons (Fixed), 3929 Persons (Floating)	750 Persons (Fixed), 300 Persons (Floating), 15 Persons (Service)	17592 persons [13342 Persons (Fixed), 4229 Persons (Floating), 21 Persons (Service)]
Total Water Requirement	2298.84 KLD (Operation stage)	168 KLD	2466.84 KLD
Fresh water requirement	1160 KLD	133 KLD	1293 KLD
Waste water generated	1506.98 KLD	79 KLD (other than patient unit), 55 KLD (patient unit)	1585.98 KLD (other than patient unit- treated in STP), 55 KLD (patient unit – treated in ETP)
Wastewater recycled	1139 KLD	35 KLD (other than patient unit)	1174 KLD
Waste water discharged	330 KLD	44 KLD (other than patient unit)	374 KLD
Solid Waste Generation	7.43 TPD	528 kg/day (MSW), 56.25 kg/day (BMW)	7958 kg/day (MSW), 56.25 kg/day (BMW)
Total Built-up Area (as per FSI)	248037.87 sqm	3397.8 sqm	251435.67 sqm
Non FSI Area	59722.81 sqm	221.19 sqm	59944 sqm
Total Built-up Area (as per Construction)	307760.67 sqm	3619 sqm	311379.67 sqm
Ground Coverage	20031.569 sqm (21.62%)	--	22076.67 sqm (23.82%)
Existing Water Bodies	11116.63 sqm (12.00%)	--	11116.63 sqm (12.00%)
Total Paved Area	22515 sqm (24.29%)	--	24716.45 sqm (26.67%)
Exclusive Green Area	19110.375 sqm (20.62%)	--	18945.72 sqm (20.44%)

	As per Environmental Clearance vide memo no. 1317/EN/T-II-1/026/2018, dated 07.10.2020 [A]	Expanded/Modified part [B]	Total (As per sanctioned building plan) [A+B]
Other Green Area (Semi - Green Area)	10674 sqm (11.52%)	--	2785.69 sqm (3.01%)
Total Open Parking Area	Not Mentioned	--	10730.16 sqm (11.58%)
Service Area	Not Mentioned	-	2302.07 sqm (2.48%)
No. of parking spaces proposed	2468 nos.	64 nos.	2532 nos.
No. of Trees proposed	1400 nos.	---	1767 nos. As per EIA report 1400 nos. as per project report
Daily power requirement	13300 KVA	300 KVA	13600 KVA
Backup Power	DG Sets – 275 KVAX1, 320 KVAX1, 250 KVAX3, 500 KVA X 3 (proposed)	500 KVA X 1 and 125 KVA X 1	DG Sets – 275 KVA X 1, 320 KVAX1, 250 KVA X 3, 500 KVA X 4 and 125 KVA X 1
Project cost (Rs.)	686.45 Cr. (As per EC),	755 Lakhs (Expanded / modified part)	--

Chronology of the Events:

- The project already received EC vide memo no. 1317/EN/T-II-1/026/2018, dated 07.10.2020 under violation category.
- Now the PP has applied for expansion and modification of Q Block (from B+G+19 to B+G+21), R Block (from B+G+19 to B+G+21), new MLCP Block (B+G+4) and a hospital (G+2) instead of day care in B+G+18 in this project.
- The proponent applied in prescribed format for Terms of Reference under 8(b) category (Proposal No. SIA/WB/MIS/76606/2022) and uploaded the application in the PARIVESH portal on 05.05.2022.
- The project obtained ToR issued by SEIAA, WB vide No. 632/EN/T-II-1/036/2022 dated 27.03.2023.
- The PP applied in prescribed format for Environmental Clearance and uploaded final EIA report for the proposed project in the PARIVESH portal on 07.12.2023.
- The PP has submitted Certified Compliance Report (CCR) from Sub-Regional Office of MoEF&CC as directed in the Notification issued vide F No. IA3-22/10/2022-IA.III[E 177258] dated 08.06.2022. In the CCR it has been mentioned that the project is operating a hospital instead of a day care centre.
- The PP was called for the EC presentation in the 22nd meeting of the SEAC, WB (2023-2026) held on 20.12.2023.
- The SEAC noted that the SEIAA in its meeting held on 01.12.2023 considered a letter received from MoEF&CC vide F.No. IA-Z-12011/13/2023-IA-I dated 29.11.2023 with respect to Godrej Prakriti Residential Apartments and decided that :
 - a) The project proponent should stop the functioning of the hospital with immediate effect.

- b) The proposal for expansion and modification of the project (proposal no. SIA/WB/INFRA2/440642/2023) would henceforth be dealt at SEIAA/SEAC as per the provisions of SOP as violation cases issued by MoEF&CC vide F No. 22-21/2020-IA.III dated 07.07.2021.

The above direction was communicated to the PP by the Member Secretary, SEIAA vide letter No. 2767/EN/T-II-1/026/2016 dated 07.12.2023.

- The PP did not appear before the SEAC for EC presentation in the 22nd meeting of the SEAC. The SEAC decided that the PP should comply with the observation of SEIAA in its meeting held on 01.12.2023 and further communicated to the PP by the above-mentioned letter and comply accordingly.

The SEAC decided that the PP should explain the reasons for its absence. If the reasons are only found to be acceptable and satisfactory, the PP may be allowed to present its case in a subsequent meeting.

- The PP submitted their reply on 18.09.2024 in the PARIVESH portal requesting to present their proposal before SEAC and the PP was called for presentation in the 49th meeting held on 25.09.2024.
- The PP presented their proposal in the 49th meeting.
- Based on the application made, documents uploaded / submitted, and the presentation made by the PP/Consultant, the SEAC made the following observations:

Mandatory documents:

- 1) Permission / concurrence from the competent authority for establishment of hospital having 150 no. beds.
- 2) Valid agreement with CBWTF for disposal of bio-medical waste.

Greenbelt

- 3) No. of trees mentioned in the EIA report is 1767 while in the project report it is mentioned as 1400. Necessary clarification to be provided.

Water and waste water

- 4) Break up of water supply from bore well and Panihati Municipality.
- 5) Concurrence from Panihati Municipality for water supply and other services.
- 6) Flow diagram of WTP.
- 7) Additional water demand for kitchen and laundry as per NBC 2016 has not been included in the water demand calculation. Hence, an Undertaking stating that no washing / kitchen will be applicable for the hospital has to be submitted.
- 8) Additional water demand for clinical water for the hospital as per actual requirement has to be computed as per NBC 2016, table 1, clause 4.1.2 and included in the water balance diagram.
- 9) Water efficient plumbing fixtures and fittings to be installed in the hospital.
- 10) No. of recharge wells to be provided for the MLCP block and two new towers. Litholog and design of piezometer and recharge wells should be submitted. A route diagram for the flow of the water from rooftop to the pond.
- 11) No recharge from the hospital is allowed. A clarification should be provided why no recharge wells were provided for the previous phase of the project.
- 12) A report on the impact of basement on shallow groundwater should be provided.

- 13) Plan for installation of piezometer with automatic groundwater level measurement and recording system connected to display board.
- 14) Water for the construction phase must be arranged from the treated wastewater of the operational STP/s of the completed part of the project.
- 15) An As-built layout plan showing the rooftop rainwater pipe network connections with the water bodies has to be submitted. The overflow connections of the water-bodies with the storm water drainage system shall also be marked.

Energy

- 16) Solar water heating system of capacity commensurate with the hot water requirement of the hospital must be installed.
- 17) Solar net meter consumption details with total units exported for the operational solar PV system to be submitted.

Need-based EMP

- 18) Compliance of earlier need-based activities given in the EC issued dated 07.10.2020. Evidence should be provided by photograph and/or certificate from the beneficiaries.
- 19) Specific need-based activities for the proposed expansion part of the project indicating the beneficiaries involved. The proposal should match with the requirements by the beneficiaries.

The SEAC recommended that the above documents may be submitted in the PARIVESH portal for further consideration of the application.

- The project proponent uploaded their reply in PARIVESH Portal on 13.12.2024, which was considered in the 57th meeting of SEAC, WB (2023-2026) held on 26.12.2024.

SEAC Observations and Recommendations:

- The SEAC scrutinized the documents submitted by the PP in the 57th meeting of SEAC, WB (2023-2026) held on 26.12.2024 and deliberated on the submission made by the project proponent. After careful consideration and detailed deliberation, the committee observed that PP had received EC vide No. 1317/EN/T-II-1/026/2018 dated 07.10.2020 under building and construction project category for a total built up area of 307760.67 sqm. which included day care centre. However, MoEF&CC in its inspection dated 08.09.2023 observed that the day care centre is functioning as a hospital. The PP in its application has proposed for modification and expansion of the building construction project which now includes a hospital of 150 nos. beds instead of a day care centre.
- It is noted that the existing day care centre or proposed hospital by itself does not attract the provision of EIA Notification since the built up area is well below 20000 sqm. Therefore, the SEAC decided to seek reply from the PP about the present status of functioning / usage of the existing day care centre.

The SEAC recommended that the above documents may be submitted in the PARIVESH portal for further consideration of the application.

All the documents should be duly signed both by the project proponent and the environmental consultant.

The SEAC will further consider the case on submission of satisfactory reply on the above-mentioned queries only through "PARIVESH" portal.

Table-1 : List of the projects which were placed before the SEAC, WB (2023-2026) in the fifty-seventh meeting held on 26.12.2024 and the Summary Decisions / Recommendations thereon:

Sl. No.	Name of the unit and Project address	Summary Decision
1. Reconsideration Proposals		
1.1) Environmental Clearance		
1.1.1) Construction Sector		
I.	M/s. Godrej Properties Ltd. Proposed Expansion cum Modification of Residential cum Commercial Complex "Godrej Prakriti" at 187 F/1 (Old-150), B.T. Road, Sodepur, Mouza - Rambhadrabati & Sukhchar, JL No. 7 & 9, Ward No. 14 of Panihati Municipality, Dist. North 24 Parganas, Kolkata 700115, West Bengal. (Proposal No.: SIA/WB/INFRA2/440642/2023)	Additional details sought

There being no other agenda the Chair thanked the members present for their fruitful participation and deliberations. The meeting ended with a vote of thanks to the Chair.

Sd/-

(Indranath Sinha)
Vice Chairman
S E A C, West Bengal

Sd/-

(Pradip Kumar Sikdar)
Member
S E A C, West Bengal

Sd/-

(Sampa Chakrabarti)
Member
S E A C, West Bengal

Sd/-

(Aniruddha Mukhopadhyay)
Member
S E A C, West Bengal

Sd/-

(Shubhendu Bandyopadhyay)
Member
S E A C, West Bengal

Sd/-

Secretary
S E A C, West Bengal