

Minutes of the 51st meeting of the State Level Expert Appraisal Committee, West Bengal (2023-2026) held on October 30, 2024 at 14:00 hr at the Conference Room, Paribesh Bhawan, Bidhannagar.

The 51st meeting of the State Level Expert Appraisal Committee (SEAC), West Bengal (2023-2026) was held on Wednesday the 30th October, 2024 at 14:00 hr at the Conference Room, Paribesh Bhawan, Bidhannagar. The following members participated:

1)	Dr. Rajesh Kumar, IPS	Secretary, SEAC	Present
2)	Prof. Anirban Gupta	Chairman, SEAC	Present
3)	Prof. Pradip Kumar Sikdar	Member, SEAC	Present
4)	Prof. Suchandra Bardhan	Member, SEAC	Present through VC
5)	Prof. Aniruddha Mukhopadhyay	Member, SEAC	Present
6)	Prof. Indranath Sinha	Member, SEAC	Present
7)	Shri Shubhendu Bandyopadhyay	Member, SEAC	Present

1) Reconsideration Proposals :-

1.1) Environmental Clearance :

1.1.1) Construction Sector :

- I. **Proposed development of a residential & resort complex project comprising of villas, guest rooms along with recreational and hospitality facilities at Dag No. - 155, 161 – 164, 210, 399 – 401, 403 - 414, 418 – 420, 422 – 442, 454, 455, 458 - 460, 462 – 505, 513, 578 – 580, 583 – 586, 588 – 597, 604, 605, Mouza – Somsara & Srirampur, P.S. – Dadpur, P.O. – Hanral, Dadpur Gram Panchayat, Dist.- Hooghly, PIN – 712149, West Bengal.**

Proposal No.: SIA/WB/INFRA2/446647/2023

Project Proponent: M/s. Purti Hotels And Resorts Private Limited.

Environmental Consultant: M/s. Centre for Sustainable Development.

Activities:

- This is a proposal for development of a residential & resort complex project comprising of villas, guest rooms along with recreational and hospitality facilities. Total land area 1,81,704.01 sqm. (as per land deed) and 1,81,056.82 sq.m (As per physical survey). Total built up area is 57,792.93 sq.m.

Chronology of Events:

- The SEAC recommended the proposed project for Environmental Clearance in the 30th meeting of SEAC (2023-2026) held on 28.02.2024 and forwarded the proposal to SEIAA.
- SEIAA considered the recommendation of SEAC in its 45th meeting held on 05.07.2024 and ADS replies submitted by the PP on 29.04.2024 and 27.05.2024. PP could not justify in the ADS reply permission for extraction of 2160 KLD groundwater against its

present requirement of 361 KLD. PP attended the hearing before the SEIAA and submitted a different justification (from ADS reply to SEIAA in PARIVESH portal) for having the preset permission of ground water extraction of 2160 KLD.

- PP has replied in ADS to do plantation in additional area however, approved plantation plan of DFO has not been submitted.
- SEIAA in its 45th meeting held on 05.07.2024 referred back the proposal to SEAC for reappraisal since the project has acquired ground water abstraction permission of 2160 KLD which is of industrial nature against requirement of 361 KLD. SEIAA observed that as per the present nature of the project, hence a detail assessment and justification of such huge abstraction permission of industrial nature need to be done.
- The proposal was discussed in the 44th SEAC meeting held on 24.07.2024. Considering the decision taken by the SEIAA in its 45th meeting held on 05.07.2024, the SEAC decided that the PP should submit reasoned justification to the observation made by SEIAA. The PP should also submit fresh DFO plantation plan for the project as mentioned by SEIAA in its meeting.
- The project proponent uploaded their reply in PARIVESH Portal on 06.08.2024, which was considered in the 46th meeting of SEAC, WB (2023-2026) held on 14.08.2024.
- The SEAC scrutinized the documents submitted by the PP in the 46th meeting of SEAC, WB (2023-2026) held on 14.08.2024.
- As per the submission made by the PP dated 06.08.2024, the revised salient features of the project are as follows :

Total Land Area (as per deed)	1,81,704.01 sqm.
Total Land Area (as per physical survey)	1,81,056.82 sqm.
Ground Coverage Area	38,002.35 sqm. (20.99% of Land Area)
Proposed Waterbody	24,474.07 sqm. (13.52%)
Exclusive Tree Plantation Area	38,034.06 sqm. (21.00%)
Other Green Area	2,658.327 sqm. (1.47%)
Service Area	1,765.44 sqm. (0.98%)
Paved Area	35,276.53 sqm. (19.48%)
Semi - Paved Area	3,584.191 sqm. (1.98%)
Amenities	3,732.98 sqm. (2.06%)
Villa Plot Open Area	33,528.87 sqm. (18.52%)
Building Profile	Resort Complex: Main Resort Block - G+1 storied - 1 no. 2 BR Block – Single storied - 4 nos. 1 BR Block - Single storied - 10 nos. Staff Block - G+3 storied - 1 no. Spa Block - Single storied - 1 no. Family Block - G+1 storied - 1 no. Sarai Block - G+1 storied - 2 no. East End Suite - G+1 storied - 1 no. Pool Pavilion - Single storied - 1 no. Specialty Restaurant - Single storied - 1 no. Club Block - G+1 storied - 1 no. Residential Complex: Villas - G+1 storied - 62 nos.

Block usage	Residential & Resort Complex
Total Built-up area	57,792.93 sqm.
No. of villas	62 Nos.
Source of Water	Ground Water
Quantum of Water required (operation stage)	553 kLD
Quantum of Fresh Water required	361 kLD
Quantity of Wastewater Generation	196 kLD (to be treated in STP)
Treated Wastewater Recycled	192 kLD
Quantity of Wastewater Discharge	00 KLD
Quantity of Solid Waste Generation	617.6 kg/day
Total Population	Total - 2,101 persons (Resort Boarders - 332 persons, Villa Residents-388 persons, Residing staff - 57 persons, Non – residing staff - 179 persons, Floating population - 150 persons, Restaurant Users - 995 persons)
Electrical Load	7,062 kW (3,044 kW for resort and 4,018 kW for villa) by WBSEDCL
Solar Power Utilization	73.4 kWp
D.G. Sets	2X 1000 kVA for resort and 5 X320 kVA for villa
Parking Provided	453 nos. (open parking for resort complex = 157, open parking for villa complex = 296)
Total no. of Trees	2378 nos.
Max. Height of the Building	13.8 m
Project cost (Rs.)	Rs.145.09 crores

- After careful consideration and detailed deliberation, the committee recommended that the PP should submit the following clarification in the PARIVESH portal :
 - a) An undertaking that the withdrawal of ground water should be limited to the estimated fresh water demand submitted.
 - b) The permission from SWID for the borewells are given in the name of Nateshwar Tradelink Private Limited, whereas the PP is M/s. Purti Hotels and Resorts Private Limited. Reasons for the above should be submitted. The purpose indicated in the application is 'Industrial' for which reasons should be submitted.
 - c) Revised salient features of the project considering the changes in the land use according to the revised DFO approved plantation plan.

The SEAC recommended that the above documents may be submitted in the PARIVESH portal for further consideration of the application.

- The project proponent uploaded their reply in PARIVESH Portal on 24.09.2024, which was considered in the 51st meeting SEAC, WB (2023-2026) held on 30.10.2024.

SEAC Observations and Recommendations:

- The SEAC scrutinized the documents submitted by the PP in the 51st meeting SEAC, WB (2023-2026) held on 30.10.2024 and after careful consideration and detailed deliberation the committee accepted the submission of the PP and **recommended the project for Environmental Clearance** with the additional condition that the PP should limit the abstraction of ground water to a maximum of 361 KLD and get it regularized from the State Water Investigation Directorate. Necessary compliance shall be submitted along with six-monthly compliance report.

1.1.2) Mining of Minerals (other than sand):

- I. **Proposed Kharia China Clay Mine at J.L. No.- 145, Plot No. - 4412 to 4418, 4420 to 4427, 5056 to 5064, 5066, 5067, 5071, 5072, 5074 to 5081, 5083 to 5092, 5095, 5096, 5098 to 5106, 5109 to 5118, 5122 to 5136, Mouza- Kharia, PO & PS- Md. Bazar, District- Birbhum, West Bengal.**

Proposal No.

SIA/WB/MIN/41581/2019

Project Proponent -

M/s. N.P. Minerals.

Environmental Consultant -

M/s. Pacific Scientific Consultancy Pvt. Ltd.

Activity:

- This is a proposal for Kharia China Clay and Fire Clay Mine project (19349 TPA of China Clay and 8687 TPA of Fire clay) over an area of 7.22 ha (17.38 acres) at J.L. No.- 145, Plot No. - 4412 to 4418, 4420 to 4427, 5056 to 5064, 5066, 5067, 5071, 5072, 5074 to 5081, 5083 to 5092, 5095, 5096, 5098 to 5106, 5109 to 5118, 5122 to 5136, Mouza- Kharia, PO & PS- Md. Bazar, District- Birbhum, West Bengal.
- As required under the West Bengal Minor Mineral Concession Rules, 2016, the PP got a composite 'Mining Plan with Progressive Mine Closure Plan' prepared for china clay mine and fire clay mine at the site by an RQP. The Plan has been approved by the State Government on 29.12.2017 and the approved plan has been uploaded at the PARIVESH portal by the PP.
- The PP has uploaded pre-feasibility report for the proposed project.
- The PP has uploaded the copy of lease deed.
- The PP has submitted the requisite EC processing fees as required under Notification No 924/T-II-1/021/2022 dated 23.05.2022 issued by Department of Environment, Government of West Bengal.

Chronology of the event:

- The PP applied in prescribed format for Terms of Reference and uploaded the application in the PARIVESH portal on 08.11.2019 (Proposal No. SIA/WB/MIN/41581/2019).
- The PP presented their Terms of Reference presentation in the 14th SEAC meeting held on 07.04.2021.
- As per recommendation of SEAC, SEIAA issued ToR vide letter No. 1211/EN/T-II-1/078/2019 dated 19.07.2021.
- PH was conducted by the WBPCB on 20.06.2022.

- The PP applied in prescribed format for Environmental Clearance and uploaded final EIA report in the PARIVESH portal on 05.12.2022.
- The PP was called for the EC presentation in the 66th SEAC meeting held on 15.02.2023 and the PP presented their proposal in this meeting.
- It is observed that the proposed project is not included in the DSR of Birbhum district. The committee mentioned that unless the project is included in the DSR, the proposal cannot be considered further.
- Based on the presentation made by the PP, the committee also recommended that the following submission / clarifications should be uploaded in the PARIVESH portal by the project proponent:-
 - 1) Salient features of the project including the portion for which mining will take place and EC is applied for.
 - 2) Depth of ground water level in observation well within 5 km radius of the project site.
 - 3) Impact of pumping of groundwater on the aquifer within 5 km radius of the project site.
 - 4) Commitment to install a piezometer for regular water level and quality monitoring and submission of the results to WBPCB.
 - 5) Domestic water requirement.
 - 6) Progressive greenbelt plantation plan.
 - 7) Height of ambient air quality monitoring stations from GL.
 - 8) Need-based EMP as per Office Memorandum of MoEF & CC vide F. No. 22-65/2017.IA.III dated 30.09.2020.
 - 9) Compliance report on chapter 5 (Environment) of the Minor Mineral Concession Rules.
- The project proponent uploaded their reply in PARIVESH Portal on 07.08.2023, which was considered in the 11th meeting SEAC, WB held on 09.08.2023.
- **The project is falling within the DSR potential zone code BH_MB_CC_ZONE_09.**
- Based on the submission made by the PP, the SEAC noted that the plot nos. 4409 and 5107 which are mentioned in approved Mine Plan are not included within the lease hold area, as uploaded by the PP. The plot nos. 4429 to 4447 are not mentioned in the approved DSR. Therefore, there is a clear mismatch of plot nos. mentioned in the lease document, approved Mine Plan and approved DSR.
- Also, it is observed that the total geological reserves of China Clay and Fire Clay which is about 4,05,098 MT as uploaded by the PP in reply to the ADS dated 07.08.2023, does not match with the reserves mentioned in the approved Mine Plan.
- Hence the PP is requested to submit the necessary clarification to the above accordingly.
- The project proponent uploaded their reply in PARIVESH Portal on 04.10.2024 **along with the revised Mine Plan dated 12.11.2021**, which was considered in the 51st meeting SEAC, WB (2023-2026) held on 30.10.2024.

Year wise production program for next five years as given in the revised approved
Mine Plan

Period /YEAR	BLOCK	PIT SIZE IN M3	OVER BURDEN IN M3	TONNAGE FACTOR/ CONVERSION FACTOR	MINING LOSS + GEOLOGICAL LOSS	GROSS FIRE CLAY IN M.T	NET MINEABLE F.C IN M.T	GROSS CHINA CLAY IN M.T	NET MINERAL C.C IN M.T	NET Ore F.C + C.C IN M.T	Ore : OB
2022-23	"1"	105(L) x 15(B) x 21(H) = 33075	105(L) x 15(B) X 6(H) = 9450	1.3	15%	99(L) X15(B) X 4.5(H) X 1.3 = 8687	8687 X 85% = 7384	94.5(L) X15(B) X 10.5(H) X 1.3 = 19349	19349 X 85% = 16447	7384 + 16447 = 23831	23831 : 9450 = 2.52:1
2023-24	"1"	33075	9450	1.3	15%	8687	7384	19349	16447	23831	2.52:1
2024-25	"1"	33075	9450	1.3	15%	8687	7384	19349	16447	23831	2.52:1
2025-26	"1"	33075	9450	1.3	15%	8687	7384	19349	16447	23831	2.52:1
2026-27	"1"	33075	9450	1.3	15%	8687	7384	19349	16447	23831	2.52:1
In Five Years 2022-23 to 2026-27	"1"	165375	47250	1.3	15%	43435	36920	96745	82235	119155	2.52:1

SEAC Observations and Recommendations:

- The SEAC scrutinized the documents submitted by the PP in the 51st meeting SEAC, WB (2023-2026) held on 30.10.2024 and accepted the submission made by the PP. After careful consideration and detailed deliberation, the committee observed that :
 - The PP has not uploaded Cluster Certificate from the competent authority.
 - Some of the coordinates mentioned in the Mine Plan for the project do not fall within the project area as per the documents uploaded or falls outside the approved DSR of Birbhum district.
- Therefore, the SEAC recommended that the above documents may be submitted in the PARIVESH portal for further consideration of the application.

All the documents should be duly signed both by the project proponent and the environmental consultant.

Table-1 : List of the projects which were placed before the SEAC, WB (2023-2026) in the fifty-first meeting held on 30.10.2024 and the Summary Decisions / Recommendations thereon:

Sl. No.	Name of the unit and Project address	Summary Decision
1. Reconsideration proposals		
1.1) Environmental Clearance		
1.1.1) Construction Sector		
I.	M/s. Purti Hotels and Resorts Private Limited Proposed Residential Complex and Resort Complex at	Recommended for Environmental Clearance

Sl. No.	Name of the unit and Project address	Summary Decision
	Village - Dadpur Gram Panchayat, Dag No. - 155, 161 – 164, 210, 399 – 401, 403 - 414, 418 – 420, 422 – 442, 454, 455, 458 - 460, 462 – 505, 513, 578 – 580, 583 – 586, 588 – 597, 604, 605, Mouza - Somsara & Srirampur, P.S. - Dadpur, P.O. – Hanral, Dist.- Hooghly, Pincode – 712149, West Bengal. (Proposal No. SIA/WB/INFRA2/446647/2023)	
1.1.2) Mining of Minerals (other than sand)		
I.	M/s. N.P. Minerals Proposed Kharia China Clay Mine at J.L. No.- 145, Plot No. - 4412 to 4418, 4420 to 4427, 5056 to 5064, 5066, 5067, 5071, 5072, 5074 to 5081, 5083 to 5092, 5095, 5096, 5098 to 5106, 5109 to 5118, 5122 to 5136, Mouza- Kharia, PO & PS- Md. Bazar, District- Birbhum, West Bengal. (Proposal No.: SIA/WB/MIN/41581/2019)	Additional Details Sought

There being no other agenda the Chair thanked the members present for their fruitful participation and deliberations. The meeting ended with a vote of thanks to the Chair.

Sd/-

(Anirban Gupta)
Chairman
S E A C, West Bengal

Sd/-

(Pradip Kumar Sikdar)
Member
S E A C, West Bengal

Sd/-

(Suchandra Bardhan)
Member
S E A C, West Bengal

Sd/-

(Aniruddha Mukhopadhyay)
Member
S E A C, West Bengal

Sd/-

(Indranath Sinha)
Member
S E A C, West Bengal

Sd/-

(Shubhendu Bandyopadhyay)
Member
S E A C, West Bengal

Sd/-

(Rajesh Kumar, IPS)
Secretary
S E A C, West Bengal