

Minutes of the 39th meeting of the State Level Expert Appraisal Committee, West Bengal (2023-2026) held on May 29, 2024 at 14:00 hr at the Conference Room, Paribesh Bhawan, Bidhannagar.

The 39th meeting of the State Level Expert Appraisal Committee (SEAC), West Bengal (2023-2026) was held on Wednesday the 29th May, 2024 at 14:00 hr at the Conference Room, Paribesh Bhawan, Bidhannagar. The following members participated:

1)	Dr. Rajesh Kumar, IPS	Secretary, SEAC	Present
2)	Prof. Anirban Gupta	Chairman, SEAC	Present
3)	Prof. Sampa Chakrabarti	Chairman, SEAC	Present
4)	Prof. Suchandra Bardhan	Member, SEAC	Present
5)	Prof. Pradip Kumar Sikdar	Member, SEAC	Present
6)	Prof. Indranath Sinha	Member, SEAC	Present
7)	Prof. Aniruddha Mukhopadhyay	Member, SEAC	Present
8)	Shri Shubhendu Bandyopadhyay	Member, SEAC	Present

1) Reconsideration proposals :-

1.1) Environmental Clearance:

1.1.1) Mining of Minerals :

- I. Proposed River Bed Sand Mine of Bournivitar Chhat over an area of 4.32 ha (10.67 Acres) on Balason River at J.L No.- 82, Plot No.- 6, Mouza- Bournivitar Chhat, P.S.- Naxalbari, District: - Darjeeling, West Bengal.**

Proposal No.	SIA/WB/MIN/424158/2023
Project Proponent -	Shri Ajay Sharma
Environmental Consultant -	M/s. RSP Green Development & Laboratories Pvt. Ltd.

Activities:

- This is a proposal for riverbed sand mining at the Bournivitar Chhat Sand Block over an area of 4.32 ha (10.67 Acres) on Balason River at J.L No.- 82, Plot No.- 6, Mouza- Bournivitar Chhat, P.S.- Naxalbari, District: - Darjeeling, West Bengal.
- **The project is falling within the DSR potential zone code DR_KS_BS_15.**
- As required under the West Bengal Minor Mineral Concession Rules, 2016, the PP got a composite 'Mining Plan with Progressive Mine Closure Plan' prepared for riverbed sand mining at the site by an RQP. The Plan has been approved by the State Government on 24.03.2023 and the approved plan has been uploaded at the PARIVESH portal by the PP.
- The production details as mentioned in the revised Mining Plan is given below :-

Considerations for resource and reserve calculation of the area

Total Area (Ha)	Safety Zone (Ha)	Production Area (Ha)	Thickness (m)
4.32	1.15	3.1616	3

Geological Reserves of the sand, Pebbles/Gravel and boulder deposit

Year	Total Area (ha)	Thickness (m)	Geological Resource (Cum)
1	4.32	3	129600.00
2	4.32	2.30	99364.32
3	4.32	2.30	99364.32
4	4.32	2.30	99364.32
5	4.32	2.30	99364.32
Total Geological Resource (Cum)			527057.28

Considering 76.67% (As per DSR, Darjeeling, Table No. 7.11) replenishment rate for the river from the second year on wards.

Mineable Reserves of the sand deposit

Year	Total Area (ha)	Thickness (m)	Mineable Reserve (Cum)
1	3.1616	3.0000	94848.00
2	3.1616	2.3001	72719.96
3	3.1616	2.3001	72719.96
4	3.1616	2.3001	72719.96
5	3.1616	2.3001	72719.96
Total Mineable Reserve (Cum)			385727.8

Considering 76.67%, replenishment rate for the river from the second year onwards.

- The PP has uploaded the pre-feasibility report for the proposed project.
- The PP has uploaded the copy of original and valid Lol.
- The PP has uploaded cluster certificate from the competent authority for Plot No. 6 & 8. **But in the 'Mining Plan with Progressive Mine Closure Plan' the Plot No. is mentioned as 6.**
- The PP has informed that there is no litigation pending against the project.
- The PP has submitted the requisite EC processing fees as required under Notification No 924/T-II-1/021/2022 dated 23.05.2022 issued by Department of Environment, Government of West Bengal.

Chronology of the Events:

- The PP applied in prescribed format for Environmental Clearance and uploaded the application in the PARIVESH portal on 30.03.2022.
- The PP was called for the EC presentation in the 74th SEAC meeting held on 29.03.2023 and the PP presented their proposal in this meeting.
- Although the plot area for the proposed project as per the geo-coordinates mentioned in the approved 'Mining cum Progressive Mine Closure Plan' **falls within the potential mining zone** as recorded in the approved District Survey Report (DSR) of Darjeeling district, **this application for EC was noted to be a duplicate one.** An earlier application (Proposal No. SIA/WB/MIN/408658/2022) for the same project was considered in the 61st meeting of SEAC held on 04.01.2023 and another application (Proposal No.

SIA/WB/MIN/265040/2022) for the same project was considered in the 69th meeting of SEAC held on 11.03.2023.

- Considering the above, the committee (SEAC), decided that earlier two applications (Proposal No. SIA/WB/MIN/408658/2022 & SIA/WB/MIN/265040/2022) should be withdrawn by the PP and necessary corrections should be made regarding mismatch in the Plot Nos. mentioned earlier.
- The SEAC also recommended that the following submission / clarifications should be uploaded in the PARIVESH portal by the project proponent for further consideration :-
 - 1) Taking into consideration the replenishment rates reported in the approved DSR for Darjeeling, both geological and mining reserves for second year (of production) onwards may be re-estimated and the annual production levels may be modified accordingly.
 - 2) Means of access and egress between the embankment and the sand quarry may be clearly earmarked. The Project Proponent must commit that no hard topping or paving of any haulage route within the riverbed will be attempted.
 - 3) A plan on management and handling of sand during the period of intermediate stock piling should be submitted.
 - 4) A Progressive Greenbelt Plan may be prepared. The project being a riverbed project afforestation/ vegetation should be attempted alongside the village roads or other public land. This may be done with prior approval of the local self governing bodies. If no public land is available for the purpose the Project Proponent shall arrange for land with his personal means. To enhance success/ survival rate the plantation shall be attempted during the first two years of the project life and the plantation so done shall be taken care of during the rest of the project life. Species of the plant selected should be self-sustaining in that particular region.
 - 5) A need-based EMP may be prepared in accordance with the MoEF&CC Office Memorandum vide F. No. 22-65/2017.IA.III dated 30.09.2020. Record of communications made in this regard with the identified/ intended beneficiaries (schools/ institutions etc) may also be uploaded.
 - 6) A study report on base flow level measured at 5 points with date and supporting photographs may be submitted. It should be committed that mining will be done at least 1m above the base flow level. Accordingly, if required, the excavation plan may also be revised.
- The project proponent uploaded their reply in PARIVESH Portal on 22.05.2024, which was considered in the 39th meeting SEAC, WB (2023-2026) held on 29.05.2024.

SEAC observations and recommendations:

- The SEAC scrutinized the documents submitted by the PP in the 39th meeting of SEAC, WB (2023-2026) held on 29.05.2024. Based on the submission made by the PP, the committee after careful consideration and detailed deliberation observed that **the DSS report in the PARIVESH portal mentions that the project is falling within the Eco-Sensitive Zone of the Mahananda Wildlife Sanctuary.**
- Therefore, the SEAC decided that the PP should submit a certificate from the competent authority regarding the distance of the project from the Eco-Sensitive Zone of the Mahananda Wildlife Sanctuary.
The SEAC will further consider the case on submission of satisfactory reply on the above-mentioned queries only through “PARIVESH” portal.

All the documents should be duly signed both by the project proponent and the environmental consultant.

2) Miscellaneous :-

I. Discussion on revised DSRs of Alipurduar and Birbhum District.

- The revised DSRs for the district Alipurduar and Birbhum were considered in the meeting. The SEAC decided that the revised DSRs may be sent to SEIAA for their consideration and approval.

Table-1 : List of the projects which were placed before the SEAC, WB (2023-2026) in the thirty-ninth meeting held on 29.05.2024 and the Summary Decisions thereof:

Sl. No.	Name of the unit and Project address	Summary Decision
1.	Reconsideration proposals	
1.1)	Terms of Reference	
1.1.1)	Mining of Minerals	
I.	Shri Ajay Sharma. Proposed River Bed Sand Mine of Bournivitar Chhat over an area of 4.32 ha (10.67 Acres) on Balason River at J.L No.- 82, Plot No.- 6, Mouza- Bournivitar Chhat, P.S.- Naxalbari, District:- Darjeeling, West Bengal. (Proposal No. SIA/WB/MIN/424158/2023)	Additional Details Sought
2.	Miscellaneous	
I.	Discussion on revised DSRs of Alipurduar and Birbhum District.	The revised DSRs of Alipurduar and Birbhum district is recommended to SEIAA for approval.

There being no other agenda the Chair thanked the members present for their fruitful participation and deliberations. The meeting ended with a vote of thanks to the Chair.

Sd/-

(Anirban Gupta)
Chairman
S E A C, West Bengal

Sd/-

(Pradip Kumar Sikdar)
Member
S E A C, West Bengal

Sd/-

(Suchandra Bardhan)
Member
S E A C, West Bengal

Sd/-

(Sampa Chakrabarti)
Member
S E A C, West Bengal

Sd/-

Sd/-

(Indranath Sinha)
Member
S E A C, West Bengal

(Aniruddha Mukhopadhyay)
Member
S E A C, West Bengal

Sd/-

Sd/-

(Shubhendu Bandyopadhyay)
Member
S E A C, West Bengal

(Rajesh Kumar, IPS)
Secretary
S E A C, West Bengal