

Minutes of the 49th meeting of the State Level Expert Appraisal Committee, West Bengal (2023-2026) held on September 25, 2024 at 14:00 hr at the Conference Room, Paribesh Bhawan, Bidhannagar.

The 49th meeting of the State Level Expert Appraisal Committee (SEAC), West Bengal (2023-2026) was held on Wednesday the 25th September, 2024 at 14:00 hr at the Conference Room, Paribesh Bhawan, Bidhannagar. The following members participated:

1)	Dr. Rajesh Kumar, IPS	Secretary, SEAC	Present
2)	Prof. Anirban Gupta	Chairman, SEAC	Present
3)	Prof. Pradip Kumar Sikdar	Member, SEAC	Present
4)	Prof. Sampa Chakrabarti	Member, SEAC	Present
5)	Prof. Suchandra Bardhan	Member, SEAC	Present
6)	Prof. Aniruddha Mukhopadhyay	Member, SEAC	Present
7)	Shri Shubhendu Bandyopadhyay	Member, SEAC	Present

1) Technical Presentation :-

1.1) Environmental Clearance :

1.1.1) Construction Sector :

- I. **Proposed Expansion cum Modification of Residential cum Commercial Complex “Godrej Prakriti” at 187 F/1 (Old-150), B.T. Road, Sodepur, Mouza - Rambhadrabati & Sukhchar, JL No. 7 & 9, Ward No. 14 of Panihati Municipality, Dist. North 24 Parganas, Kolkata 700115, West Bengal.**

Proposal No.:	SIA/WB/INFRA2/440642/2023
Project Proponent:	M/s. Godrej Properties Ltd.
Environmental Consultant:	M/s. Ultra-Tech.

Activities:

- This is a proposal for expansion and modification of Q Block (from B+G+19 to B+G+21), R Block (from B+G+19 to B+G+21), new MLCP Block (B+G+4) and a hospital (G+2) in B+G+18 instead of day care in this project.

Salient Features of the project:

- Salient features of the proposed project as uploaded by the PP in the PARIVESH portal is as below –

	As per Environmental Clearance vide memo no. 1317/EN/T-II-1/026/2018, dated 07.10.2020 [A]	Expanded/Modified part [B]	Total (As per sanctioned building plan) [A+B]
Land Area as per Deed	108091.98 sqm (26.71 Acres)	108091.98 sqm (26.71 Acres)	108091.98 sqm (26.71 Acres)

	As per Environmental Clearance vide memo no. 1317/EN/T-II-1/026/2018, dated 07.10.2020 [A]	Expanded/Modified part [B]	Total (As per sanctioned building plan) [A+B]
Land Area Vested (Under 14Z Rule)	10157.53 sqm (2.51 Acres)	10157.53 sqm (2.51 Acres)	10157.53 sqm (2.51 Acres)
Land Transferred to Municipality	5260.93 sqm (1.30 Acres)	5260.93 sqm (1.30 Acres)	5260.93 sqm (1.30 Acres)
Remaining Total Site Area	92673.39 sqm (22.90 Acres)	92673.39 sqm (22.90 Acres)	92673.39 sqm (22.90 Acres)
Building Profile	Club House – G+1, Community Hall – G+2, Retail Block – G+3 Block A,B,C,D,E – G+14 Block F,G,H,I – G+19, Block J & L – G+4 Block K,N,O,P,Q,R- B+G+19 Block M – B+G+4 Block S+MLCP – G+19 Day Care cum Residential – B+G+18	2 floors added in Block Q (From B+G+19 to B+G+21) 2 floors added in Block R (From B+G+19 to B+G+21) 1 new MLCP Block – B+G+4 Hospital – G+2 in B+G+18	Club House – G+1, Community Hall – G+2, Retail Block – G+3 Block A,B,C,D,E – G+14 Block F,G,H,I – G+19, Block J & L – G+4 Block K,N,O,P- B+G+19 Block M – B+G+4 Block Q, R – B+G+21 Block S+MLCP – G+19 Hospital cum Residential – B+G+18 MLCP Block – B+G+4
Total no of Building (Nos)	23	1	24
No. of Residential / Business Units	2618 Flats	57 Flats, No. of beds for hospital - 150	2675 Flats and Hospital beds – 150 nos.
Expected Population	12004 Persons (Fixed), 3929 Persons (Floating)	750 Persons (Fixed), 300 Persons (Floating), 15 Persons (Service)	17592 persons [13342 Persons (Fixed), 4229 Persons (Floating), 21 Persons (Service)]
Total Water Requirement	2298.84 KLD (Operation stage)	168 KLD	2466.84 KLD
Fresh water requirement	1160 KLD	133 KLD	1293 KLD
Waste water generated	1506.98 KLD	79 KLD (other than patient unit), 55 KLD (patient unit)	1585.98 KLD (other than patient unit- treated in STP), 55 KLD (patient unit – treated in ETP)
Wastewater recycled	1139 KLD	35 KLD (other than patient unit)	1174 KLD
Waste water discharged	330 KLD	44 KLD (other than patient unit)	374 KLD
Solid Waste Generation	7.43 TPD	528 kg/day (MSW), 56.25 kg/day (BMW)	7958 kg/day (MSW), 56.25 kg/day (BMW)
Total Built-up Area (as per FSI)	248037.87 sqm	3397.8 sqm	251435.67 sqm
Non FSI Area	59722.81 sqm	221.19 sqm	59944 sqm
Total Built-up Area (as per Construction)	307760.67 sqm	3619 sqm	311379.67 sqm
Ground Coverage	20031.569 sqm (21.62%)	--	22076.67 sqm (23.82%)
Existing Water Bodies	11116.63 sqm (12.00%)	--	11116.63 sqm (12.00%)
Total Paved Area	22515 sqm (24.29%)	--	24716.45 sqm (26.67%)
Exclusive Green Area	19110.375 sqm (20.62%)	--	18945.72 sqm (20.44%)

	As per Environmental Clearance vide memo no. 1317/EN/T-II-1/026/2018, dated 07.10.2020 [A]	Expanded/Modified part [B]	Total (As per sanctioned building plan) [A+B]
Other Green Area (Semi - Green Area)	10674 sqm (11.52%)	--	2785.69 sqm (3.01%)
Total Open Parking Area	Not Mentioned	--	10730.16 sqm (11.58%)
Service Area	Not Mentioned	-	2302.07 sqm (2.48%)
No. of parking spaces proposed	2468 nos.	64 nos.	2532 nos.
No. of Trees proposed	1400 nos.	---	1767 nos. As per EIA report 1400 nos. as per project report
Daily power requirement	13300 KVA	300 KVA	13600 KVA
Backup Power	DG Sets – 275 KVAX1, 320 KVAX1, 250 KVAX3, 500 KVA X 3 (proposed)	500 KVA X 1 and 125 KVA X 1	DG Sets – 275 KVA X 1, 320 KVAX1, 250 KVA X 3, 500 KVA X 4 and 125 KVA X 1
Project cost (Rs.)	686.45 Cr. (As per EC),	755 Lakhs (Expanded / modified part)	--

Chronology of the Events:

- The project already received EC vide memo no. 1317/EN/T-II-1/026/2018, dated 07.10.2020.
- Now the PP has applied for expansion and modification of Q Block (from B+G+19 to B+G+21), R Block (from B+G+19 to B+G+21), new MLCP Block (B+G+4) and a hospital (G+2) instead of day care in B+G+18 in this project.
- The proponent applied in prescribed format for Terms of Reference and uploaded the application in the PARIVESH portal on 05.05.2022.
- The project obtained ToR issued by SEIAA, WB vide No. 632/EN/T-II-1/036/2022 dated 27.03.2023.
- The PP applied in prescribed format for Environmental Clearance and uploaded final EIA report for the proposed project in the PARIVESH portal on 07.12.2023.
- The PP has submitted Certified Compliance Report (CCR) from Sub-Regional Office of MoEF&CC as directed in the Notification issued vide F No. IA3-22/10/2022-IA.III[E 177258] dated 08.06.2022. In the CCR it has been mentioned that the project is operating a hospital instead of a day care centre.
- The PP was called for the EC presentation in the 22nd meeting of the SEAC, WB (2023-2026) held on 20.12.2023.
- The SEAC noted that the SEIAA in its meeting held on 01.12.2023 decided that :
 - a) the project proponent should stop the functioning of the hospital with immediate effect.
 - b) The proposal for expansion and modification of the project (proposal no. SIA/WB/INFRA2/440642/2023) would henceforth be dealt at SEIAA/SEAC as per the

provisions of SOP as violation cases issued by MoEF&CC vide F No. 22-21/2020-IA.III dated 07.07.2021.

The above direction was communicated to the PP by the Member Secretary, SEIAA vide letter No. 2767/EN/T-II-1/026/2016 dated 07.12.2023.

- The PP did not appear before the SEAC for EC presentation. The SEAC decided that the PP should comply with the observation of SEIAA in its meeting held on 01.12.2023 and further communicated to the PP by the above-mentioned letter and comply accordingly.

The SEAC decided that the PP should explain the reasons for its absence. If the reasons are only found to be acceptable and satisfactory, the PP may be allowed to present its case in a subsequent meeting.

- The PP submitted their reply on 18.09.2024 in the PARIVESH portal requesting to present their proposal before SEAC and the PP was called for presentation in the 49th meeting held on 25.09.2024.
- The PP presented their proposal in this meeting.

SEAC Observations and Recommendations:

- Based on the application made, documents uploaded / submitted, and the presentation made by the PP/Consultant, the SEAC made the following observations:

Mandatory documents:

- 1) Permission / concurrence from the competent authority for establishment of hospital having 150 no. beds.
- 2) Valid agreement with CBWTF for disposal of bio-medical waste.

Greenbelt

- 3) No. of trees mentioned in the EIA report is 1767 while in the project report it is mentioned as 1400. Necessary clarification to be provided.

Water and waste water

- 4) Break up of water supply from bore well and Panihati Municipality.
- 5) Concurrence from Panihati Municipality for water supply and other services.
- 6) Flow diagram of WTP.
- 7) Additional water demand for kitchen and laundry as per NBC 2016 has not been included in the water demand calculation. Hence, an Undertaking stating that no washing / kitchen will be applicable for the hospital has to be submitted.
- 8) Additional water demand for clinical water for the hospital as per actual requirement has to be computed as per NBC 2016, table 1, clause 4.1.2 and included in the water balance diagram.
- 9) Water efficient plumbing fixtures and fittings to be installed in the hospital.
- 10) No. of recharge wells to be provided for the MLCP block and two new towers. Litholog and design of piezometer and recharge wells should be submitted. A route diagram for the flow of the water from rooftop to the pond.
- 11) No recharge from the hospital is allowed. A clarification should be provided why no recharge wells were provided for the previous phase of the project.
- 12) A report on the impact of basement on shallow groundwater should be provided.
- 13) Plan for installation of piezometer with automatic groundwater level measurement and recording system connected to display board.

- 14) Water for the construction phase must be arranged from the treated wastewater of the operational STP/s of the completed part of the project.
- 15) An As-built layout plan showing the rooftop rainwater pipe network connections with the water bodies has to be submitted. The overflow connections of the water-bodies with the storm water drainage system shall also be marked.

Energy

- 16) Solar water heating system of capacity commensurate with the hot water requirement of the hospital must be installed.
- 17) Solar net meter consumption details with total units exported for the operational solar PV system to be submitted.

Need-based EMP

- 18) Compliance of earlier need-based activities given in the EC issued dated 07.10.2020. Evidence should be provided by photograph and/or certificate from the beneficiaries.
- 19) Specific need-based activities for the proposed expansion part of the project indicating the beneficiaries involved. The proposal should match with the requirements by the beneficiaries.

SEAC further recommends that the PP should submit compliance report and credible documents from competent authorities with respect to observations made by SEIAA vide letter No. 2767/EN/T-II-1/026/2016 dated 07.12.2023.

The SEAC recommended that the above documents may be submitted in the PARIVESH portal for further consideration of the application.

All the documents should be duly signed both by the project proponent and the environmental consultant.

The SEAC will further consider the case on submission of satisfactory reply on the above-mentioned queries only through "PARIVESH" portal.

2) Reconsideration Proposal :-

2.1) Environmental Clearance:

2.1.1) Mining of Minerals (Other than sand):

- I. **Proposed Upardanga Granite Stone Quarry over an area of 1.0 ha (2.471 Acres) of capacity 19564.36 MT/year at Mouza - Talsankra, J.L. No. - 163, Plot No. – 3310, P.S. - Raghunathpur, Dist. – Purulia, Pin – 723101, West Bengal.**

Proposal No.:	SIA/WB/MIN/442652/2023
Project Proponent:	M/s. Todi Minerals Private Limited.
Environmental Consultant:	M/s. Ultra-Tech.

Activities:

- This is a proposal for Upardanga Granite Stone Quarry over an area of 1.0 ha (2.471 Acres) at Mouza - Talsankra, J.L. No. - 163, Plot No. – 3310, P.S. - Raghunathpur, Dist. – Purulia, Pin – 723101, West Bengal.
- **The Lease Deed has been executed on 28.07.2005 for a period of 20 years. Therefore, the lease period is valid only upto 27.07.2025.**

- As required under the West Bengal Minor Mineral Concession Rules, 2016, the PP got a composite 'Mining Plan' prepared for proposed Granite Mine at the site by an RQP. The Plan has been approved by the State Government on 07.02.2023 and the approved plan has been uploaded at the PARIVESH portal by the PP.
- The year wise development and production for five years as mentioned in the Mining Plan is given below :-

YEAR	Avg. Length	Avg. Width	Avg. Height	Top RL	Bottom RL	Volume	Gross Volume	40% granite extractable volume	60% granite waste volume
	In (m.)	In (m.)	In (m.)	In (m.)	In (m.)	In (cum)	In (cum)	In (cum)	In (cum)
2022-23 (from May 2022)	36	32	4	172	168	4608	7056	2822	4234
	24	17	6	168	162	2448			
2023-24	74	16	6	168	162	7104	7104	2842	4262
2024-25	22	14	4	176	172	1232	7112	2845	4267
	74	9	4	172	168	2664			
	67	12	4	168	162	3216			
2025-26 (upto July 2025)	40	11	6	162	156	2640	2640	1056	1584
Total						23912	23912	9565	14347

- The PP has uploaded pre-feasibility report for the proposed project.

Chronology of the Events:

- The project proponent had already obtained Environmental Clearance vide No. 966/EN/T-II-1/008/2013 dated 17.04.2015 issued by SEIAA and Consent to Operate from WBPCB vide No. CO134679, Memo No. 290-WPBA/Red/Pol/Cont/192/05 dated 17.07.2023 which is valid upto 31.05.2028.
- The PP applied in prescribed format for Environmental Clearance for the expansion of production capacity and uploaded the application in the PARIVESH portal on 14.09.2023.
- The PP was called for the EC presentation in the 17th meeting of SEAC, WB (2023-2026) held on 18.10.2023 and the PP presented their proposal in this meeting.
- Based on the submission and presentation made by the PP, the committee made the following observations/ additional conditions:
 - The PP should submit Certified Compliance Report (CCR) from the MoEF&CC as directed in the Notification issued vide F No. IA3-22/10/2022-IA.III[E 177258] dated 08.06.2022.
 - The geo-coordinates of the project plot as mentioned in the Mine Plan and PFR does not match.
 - Site layout plan with green belt does not show the road access into the quarry area, while the existing road is clearly visible in the Google map. Thus, green belt area

needs to be adjusted accordingly. The waste dump site connectivity w.r.t. the quarry site is not clear. Is it the adjacent one? But then the profile does not match. Needs to be marked in a single Google map image with accessibility shown. Will there be another road at the back for waste dumping? Then greenbelt area will be further reduced. Haul road layout, storage area, Garland drain layout settling tank, and Rainwater harvesting Tank should be shown in a map/diagram. A revised map with the roads needs to be shown.

4. 'Road side green area' as shown in plantation plan- not clear if PP is committing to implement this. If yes, agreement with local body (panchayat?) for protection after mine closure and specific management plan to be proposed. Compliance report should also include on the progress of all in-situ and ex-situ plantation health/ progressive plantation.
5. Need-based activities to be more specific. Consents from the beneficiaries should be furnished.
6. Photographs of existing condition of the site (geotagged with date) should be submitted.

The SEAC recommended that the above documents may be submitted in the PARIVESH portal for further consideration of the application.

- The project proponent uploaded their reply in PARIVESH Portal on 19.03.2024, which was considered in the 34th meeting of SEAC, WB (2023-2026) held on 03.04.2024.
- The SEAC scrutinized the documents submitted by the PP in the 34th meeting of SEAC, WB (2023-2026) held on 03.04.2024 and after careful consideration and detailed deliberation the committee noted that the PP has not submitted any specific and proper reply to the query raised. The PP is requested to submit specific and proper reply to the above and the documents may be submitted in the PARIVESH portal for further consideration of the application.
- The project proponent uploaded their reply in PARIVESH Portal on 24.06.2024, which was considered in the 43rd meeting of SEAC, WB (2023-2026) held on 10.07.2024.
- The SEAC scrutinized the documents submitted by the PP in the 43rd meeting of SEAC, WB (2023-2026) held on 10.07.2024 and after careful consideration and detailed deliberation the committee observed the following :-
 - 1) The waste dump of 0.5 ha lies in Plot No. 3251 and the quarry area of 0.606 ha lies in Plot No. 3310. This is neither reflected in the approved mine plan or the Lease Deed granted to the PP. The lease area granted is of 1 ha in Plot No. 3310. Necessary clarification should be provided.
 - 2) The certificate by the RQP in the mine plan mentions that the Upardanga Granite Stone Quarry is over an area of 3.504 ha, while the mine plan and the Lease Deed mentions the area to be 1 ha. Necessary clarification should be provided.
 - 3) The afforestation programme given in the mine and mine closure plan do not match with the plantation plan submitted by the project proponent. Necessary clarification should be provided.
 - 4) Salient features of the project should be submitted.
 - 5) The Certified Compliance Report for the project mentions that the rate of survival of trees planted by the PP is less. The PP has to do tree plantation in an area equivalent to 33% of the lease area @2500 trees / ha within first two years from the starting of the mining operation. A Progressive Greenbelt Plan may be prepared. To enhance success/ survival rate the plantation shall be attempted during the first two years of

the project life and the plantation so done shall be taken care of during the rest of the project life. Species of the plant selected should be self-sustaining in that particular region. Spatial year wise progressive plantation programme to be submitted.

- 6) Compliance of earlier need-based activities given in the EC issued vide EC vide No. 966/EN-T-II-1008/2013 dated 17.04.2015. Evidence should be provided by photograph and/or certificate from the beneficiaries.

The SEAC recommended that the above documents may be submitted in the PARIVESH portal for further consideration of the application.

- The project proponent uploaded their reply in PARIVESH Portal, which was considered in the 45th meeting SEAC, WB (2023-2026) held on 07.08.2024.
- The SEAC scrutinized the documents submitted by the PP in the 45th meeting SEAC, WB (2023-2026) held on 07.08.2024 and after careful consideration and detailed deliberation the committee observed that the PP has not submitted any reply to the queries raised. The PP is requested to submit specific reply to the queries raised by the SEAC.
- The project proponent uploaded their reply in PARIVESH Portal on 18.09.2024, which was considered in the 49th meeting SEAC, WB (2023-2026) held on 25.09.2024.
- **The project is falling within the DSR potential zone code PUR_GR_ZONE_15.**
- Salient features of the proposed project as submitted by the PP as follows :-

Location	Plot No. 3310 Mouza - Talsankra, J.L No. - 163, P.S – Raghunathpur, PIN – 723101 Dist. – Purulia, West Bengal		
Coordinate of the project area	Point	Latitude	Longitude
	P1	23°32'48.11"	86°42'40.07"
	P2	23°32'50.05"	86°42'39.45"
	P3	23°32'49.92"	86°42'36.02"
	P4	23°32'47.29"	86°42'35.71"
	P5	23°32'46.37"	86°42'37.25"
	B1	23°32'45.72"	86°42'37.81"
	P6	23°32'45.86"	86°42'38.04"
	P7	23°32'46.72"	86°42'37.55"
	B2	23°32'46.90"	86°42'37.91"
	P8	23°32'46.49"	86°42'38.04"
P9	23°32'46.06"	86°42'39.31"	
P10	23°32'47.25"	86°42'40.01"	
Toposheet No.	73I/15		
Name of the Mineral to be mined	Granite Stone		
Capacity of Proposed Production per annum	19564.36 MT per year Production in 3.3 Years – 64562.40 MT		
Drilling Blasting	The mining does not require any drilling and blasting in mining activities.		
Method of Mining	Open cast Mechanized method of mining with Loader cum Excavator and Dumper		
Date of Grant of Lease	05.05.2003		
Date of Expiry of Lease	27.07.2025		
Lease Period	20 Years		
Lease Area	1.0 Hectares (2.471Acres)		
Greenbelt area	0.606 ha		

Mineable Reserve	Total Movable Reserves is estimated – 99,760 cum Proposed Production during the Plan – 23,912 cum
Manpower to be involved	25
Water requirements and source	5 KLD Source: Hired Tank
Solid Waste Generation	As the complete area is mineralized and outside dumping areas are re - handling if remains if unsold. Otherwise, the rejects block able granite will be targeted for selling in other forms like Cobles, Boulders, Granite dusts etc. Any specific dumping ground thus has not been considered for the project.
Cost of the Project	Rs.100 Lacks (Approx.)

SEAC Observations and Recommendations:

- The SEAC scrutinized the documents submitted by the PP in the 49th meeting SEAC, WB (2023-2026) held on 25.09.2024 and after careful consideration and detailed deliberation the SEAC recommended that the PP should submit the following :-
 1. Non-Cluster Certificate from the competent authority.
 2. Two sets of coordinates are given in the mine plan under 2.2.b. – Boundary pillar corner point coordinate in Universal Transverse Mercator (UTM) with Topo Sheet - PP is requested to clarify.

The SEAC recommended that the above documents may be submitted in the PARIVESH portal for further consideration of the application.

All the documents should be duly signed both by the project proponent and the environmental consultant.

The SEAC will further consider the case on submission of satisfactory reply on the above-mentioned queries only through “PARIVESH” portal.

3) Miscellaneous :-

I. Discussion on revised DSR of Darjeeling District.

- The revised DSR for the district Darjeeling was considered in the meeting. The SEAC decided that the revised DSR may be sent to SEIAA for their consideration and approval.

Table-1 : List of the projects which were placed before the SEAC, WB (2023-2026) in the forth-ninth meeting held on 25.09.2024 and the Summary Decisions / Recommendations thereon:

Sl. No.	Name of the unit and Project address	Summary Decision
1.	Technical Presentations	
1.1)	Environmental Clearance	
1.1.1)	Construction Sector	

Sl. No.	Name of the unit and Project address	Summary Decision
I.	M/s. Godrej Properties Ltd. Proposed Expansion cum Modification of Residential cum Commercial Complex "Godrej Prakriti" at 187 F/1 (Old-150), B.T. Road, Sodepur, Mouza - Rambhadrabati & Sukhchar, JL No. 7 & 9, Ward No. 14 of Panihati Municipality, Dist. North 24 Parganas, Kolkata 700115, West Bengal. (Proposal No.: SIA/WB/INFRA2/440642/2023)	Additional Details Sought
2. Reconsideration Proposals		
2.1) Environmental Clearance		
2.1.1) Mining of Minerals (other than sand)		
I.	M/s. Todi Minerals Private Limited. Proposed Upardanga Granite Stone Quarry over an area of 1 ha (2.471 Acres) at Mouza - Talsankra, J.L. No. - 163, Plot No. - 3310, P.S. - Raghunathpur, Dist. - Purulia, Pin - 723101, West Bengal. (Proposal No.: SIA/WB/ MIN/442652/2023)	Additional Details Sought
3. Miscellaneous		
I.	Discussion on revised DSR of Darjeeling District.	The revised DSR of Darjeeling district is recommended to SEIAA for approval.

There being no other agenda the Chair thanked the members present for their fruitful participation and deliberations. The meeting ended with a vote of thanks to the Chair.

Sd/-

(Anirban Gupta)
Chairman
S E A C, West Bengal

Sd/-

(Pradip Kumar Sikdar)
Member
S E A C, West Bengal

Sd/-

(Suchandra Bardhan)
Member
S E A C, West Bengal

Sd/-

(Sampa Chakrabarti)
Member
S E A C, West Bengal

Sd/-

(Aniruddha Mukhopadhyay)
Member
S E A C, West Bengal

Sd/-

(Shubhendu Bandyopadhyay)
Member
S E A C, West Bengal

Sd/-

(Rajesh Kumar, IPS)
Secretary
S E A C, West Bengal