

Minutes of the twenty-sixth meeting of the reconstituted State Level Expert Appraisal Committee, West Bengal held on 15.12.2021 at 12:30 p.m. at the Conference Room, Paribesh Bhawan, Bidhannagar.

Name of the members who were present in the meeting are as follows: -

1)	Dr. Ashit Kumar Mukherjee	Chairman, SEAC	Present
2)	Dr. Pradip Kumar Sikdar	Member, SEAC	Present
3)	Dr. Anirban Gupta	Member, SEAC	Present
4)	Prof. (Dr.) Aniruddha Mukhopadhyay	Member, SEAC	Present
5)	Dr. Indranath Sinha	Member, SEAC	Present
6)	Prof. (Dr.) Sampa Chakrabarti	Member, SEAC	Present
7)	Dr. Nilangshu Bhusan Basu	Member, SEAC	Present through VC
8)	Shri Shubhendu Bandyopadhyay	Member, SEAC	Present through VC
9)	Roshni Sen, IAS	Secretary, SEAC	Present through VC

The 26th meeting of the reconstituted State Expert Appraisal Committee (SEAC), was held on 15.12.2021 at 12:30 p.m. through both physical and online modes in the Conference Room at Paribesh Bhawan, Bidhan Nagar. At the outset, the Secretary, SEAC welcomed all the members. After the introductory session, the technical presentations were made by applicants. Two applicants were requested to make their presentation before the committee. One applicant could not appear before the SEAC. One applicant presented before the committee on their respective project proposal. One case was placed for reconsideration and two cases were discussed under 'Miscellaneous' section.

A. Note on Technical presentations:-

For Terms of Reference :

Construction Sector

- 1. Proposed expansion of Residential Complex “Siddha Waterfront” by M/s. Power Point Buildcon Pvt. Ltd. at Old Calcutta Road, Mouza – Patulia, Patulia Gram Panchayet, JL No. 4, Dist – 24 Parganas (North), West Bengal. (VIOLATION CASE) (Proposal No. SIA/WB/NCP/19950/2016). Name of the Environmental Consultant is M/s. Centre for Sustainable Development.**

Activity:

- This is a proposal for expansion consisting of vertical expansion of existing 5 blocks (of Phase-I) from G+11 to G+14 storied alongwith construction of 11 nos. of G+14 storied residential towers, B+G+7 storied car parking (MLCP), 1 no. of single storied service block, G+2 storied club block and a single storied podium.

Minutes of the twenty-sixth meeting of the reconstituted State Level Expert Appraisal Committee, West Bengal held on 15.12.2021 at 12:30 p.m. at the Conference Room, Paribesh Bhawan, Bidhannagar.

Chronology of the event:

- Salient features of the proposed project are –

	As per Environmental Clearance of Phase – I	Proposed Expansion of Phase – II	As per Stipulated Conditions of Phase – I +II	As per Sanction & Construction Plan of Phase – I +II
Land Area	As per Deed – 22,650.003 sq.m. As per Survey – 22,746.42sqm	Additional Land area : As per Deed – 47,316.7102 sq.m As per Survey – 47,130.46 sq.m	As per Deed – 69,966.7132 sq. m. As per Survey – 69,876.88 sq. m. Land gifted to Municipality – 208.134 sq. m Land available for Development - 69,668.746 sq.m.	As per Deed – 69,966.7132 sq. m. As per Survey – 69,876.88 sq. m. Land gifted to Municipality – 208.134 sq. m Land available for Development - 69,668.746 sq.m.
Population (in person)	Resident = 2070 Floating = 200 Staff = 20 Total = 2290	Resident = 5072 Floating = 507 Staff = 150 Total = 5729	Resident = 7142 Floating = 707 Staff = 170 Total = 8019	Resident = 7142 Floating = 707 Staff = 170 Total = 8019
No. of Flat	435 nos.	1313 nos.	1,748 nos.	1,748 nos.
No. of Blocks	Residential blocks – 5 nos. (G+11) Podium – 1 no.(G)	Residential blocks - 11 nos. (G+14) , MLCP - 1 no. (B+G+7), Service Block – 1 no. (G), Club block - 1 no. (G+2) Podiums – 1 no. (G), and vertical expansion of existing 5 residential blocks (Phase I) from G+11 to G+14	Residential blocks - 16 nos. (G+14), MLCP - 1 no. (B+G+7), Service Block – 1 no. (G), Club block - 1 no. (G+2) Podiums – 2 nos. (G).	Residential blocks - 16 nos. (G+14), MLCP - 1 no. (B+G+7), Service Block – 1 no. (G), Club block - 1 no. (G+2) Podiums – 2 nos. (G).
Total Water Requirement	388 KLD (Operation stage)	860 KLD (Operation stage)	1248 KLD (Operation stage)	1248 KLD (Operation stage)
Freshwater Requirement	209 KLD (groundwater)	517 KLD (groundwater)	726 KLD (groundwater)	726 KLD (groundwater)
Wastewater Generated	251 KLD	621 KLD	872 KLD	872 KLD
Treated Wastewater from STP	226 KLD	559 KLD	785 KLD	785 KLD
Treated Wastewater Recycled	174 KLD	329 KLD	503 KLD (to be used for toilet flushing, landscaping, car washing, etc.)	503 KLD (to be used for toilet flushing, landscaping, car washing, etc.)
Treated Wastewater Discharged	52 KLD	230 KLD	282 KLD	282 KLD
Solid Waste Disposal	1.18 Tonne/day	2.92 Tonne/day	4.1 Tonne/day (to be disposed through onsite compost plant and local	4.1 Tonne/day (to be disposed through onsite compost plant and local

Minutes of the twenty-sixth meeting of the reconstituted State Level Expert Appraisal Committee, West Bengal held on 15.12.2021 at 12:30 p.m. at the Conference Room, Paribesh Bhawan, Bidhannagar.

	As per Environmental Clearance of Phase – I	Proposed Expansion of Phase – II	As per Stipulated Conditions of Phase – I +II	As per Sanction & Construction Plan of Phase – I +II
			body)	body)
Total Built Up Area	43,275.50 sq. m	1,29,058.37 sq. m	1,72,333.87 sq. m	1,72,333.87 sq. m
Ground coverage	4,957.15 sq. m (21.79 %)	11,749.58 sq. m	16,706.73 sq. m (23.98 %)	16,706.73 sq.m (23.98%)
Internal road & pavement area	4,027.83 sq. m (17.71 %)	-	12,642.95 sq. m (18.15 %)	12,642.95 sq.m (18.15%)
Semi paved area	2,981.26 sq. m(13.11 %)	-	9,348.96 sq. m (13.42 %)	9,348.96 sq. m (13.42%)
Tree Plantation area	4,947.96 sq. m (21.75 %)	-	14,550.5 sq. m (20.89 %)	14,550.5 sq. m (20.89%)
Soft area	5,222.29 sq. m (22.95 %)	-	7,824.46 sq. m (11.23 %)	7,824.46 sq. m (11.23%)
Services & Amenities Area	401.80 sq. m(1.77 %)	-	1,652.883 sq. m (2.37 %)	1,652.883 sq. m (2.37%)
Proposed Compensatory Waterbody Area	-	6,942.268 sq. m	6,942.268 sq. m (9.96 %)	6,942.268 sq. m (9.96%)
Area gifted to municipality	208.134 sq. m (0.92 %)	-	208.134 sq. m	208.134 sq. m
No. of Parking Space Proposed	264 (Covered = 94, podium = 34, Open = 136)	965 (Covered = 226, Open = 370, MLCP = 369)	1229 (Covered = 354, Open = 506, MLCP = 369)	1229
Total No. of Plantation	350 Nos.	626 Nos.	976 Nos.	976 Nos.
No. of Solar Street Lights	27 Nos.	118 Nos.	145 Nos.	145 Nos.
Total Power Requirement	1150 KW	5180 KW	6330 KW	6330 KW
Back up Power	2 X 380 KVA D.G. Sets	2 X 500 KVA + 1X 380 KVA + 1X200 KVA D.G. Sets	2 X 500 KVA + 3X 380 KVA + 1X200 KVA D.G. Sets	2 X 500 KVA + 3X 380 KVA + 1X200 KVA D.G. Sets

- The project proponent has already obtained Environmental Clearance for Phase I for construction of a residential complex comprising of 5 nos. G+11 storied residential towers having 435 residential flats, retail shops and community facilities.
- The project proponent presented their proposal for Terms of Reference in the 128th SEAC meeting held on 27/08/2016.
- The SEAC recommended the ToR vide Memo no.656-2N-51/2014(E) dated 04.10.2016.
- The project proponent submitted the final EIA/EMP report and came up with their presentation on final EIA study in the 147th SEAC meeting held on 15/09/2017.

Minutes of the twenty-sixth meeting of the reconstituted State Level Expert Appraisal Committee, West Bengal held on 15.12.2021 at 12:30 p.m. at the Conference Room, Paribesh Bhawan, Bidhannagar.

- The project proponent received stipulated conditions for environmental clearance from SEIAA vide letter no. 1036/EN/T-II-1/049/2016 dated 27/04/2018.
- The SEAC recommended EC in the 158th SEAC meeting held on 13/07/2018 and forwarded the proposal to SEIAA.
- A field inspection was conducted by WBPCB on 18.01.2021.
- SEIAA in its 37th meeting held on 09.11.2021 considered the proposal and referred back the same to SEAC through PARIVESH portal for reappraisal as violation category on the following observations :
 - a) EC conditions have not been complied with as per field inspection report by WBPCB dated 18.01.2021.
 - b) The validity of the sanction plan for Phase-II of the project is already over on 28.02.2021. In order to process the said application, the sanction plan needs to be revalidated.
 - c) The project proponent has already undertaken construction activities for their Phase-II project without obtaining EC which amounts to violation of the EIA Notification, 2006 and its subsequent amendments.
- The project proponent through letter dated 09.12.2021 requested the SEAC to consider their case as violation category.
- The project proponent was called for ToR presentation for their violation case in the 26th reconstituted SEAC meeting held on 15.12.2021 but the project proponent could not appear before the SEAC.

After detailed discussion, SEAC recommended the unit to make presentation in the next SEAC meeting.

Industry Sector

For Environmental Clearance

- 2. Proposed Black Stone Mining project by M/s. Aryan Stone Quarry at Mouza – Tarachua, JL No. 36, Plot No. 3943(P), 3944, 3045, 3946(P), PS – Rampurhat, Dist – Birbhum, West Bengal. (Proposal No. SIA/WB/MIN/189700/2020). Name of the Environmental Consultant is M/s. RSP Green Development and Laboratories Pvt. Ltd.**

Activity:

- This is a proposal for black stone mining project (O.C.) of mining capacity 63616.2 cum/annum in area- 1.46 Hectare at Village- Tarachua, P.S. - Rampurhat, District- Birbhum (WB) of Partner: Sk. Tojammel.

Chronology of the event:

- The project proponent presented their EC application in the 26th reconstituted SEAC meeting held on 15.12.2021 and based on the submission and presentation made by the project proponent, the committee noted and decided the following:-
 - i. The information presented at times were incorrect and confusing. Data/ information in their presentation are grossly incorrect- should be completely revised before

Minutes of the twenty-sixth meeting of the reconstituted State Level Expert Appraisal Committee, West Bengal held on 15.12.2021 at 12:30 p.m. at the Conference Room, Paribesh Bhawan, Bidhannagar.

presentation under any category of application.

- ii. It was observed that the project proponent has applied for 'Fresh EC' application. However, from documents presented by the project proponent it was noticed that they have a valid EC for existing project. Therefore, it was decided that this application will be recommended for rejection.
- iii. Project proponent may apply for their expansion project through PARIVESH portal.

B. Reconsideration Proposals :-

Construction Sector

1. **Proposed Chaitanya Chandrodaya Mandir & Indian Educational and Cultural Centre (a.k.a. Temple of Vedic Planetarium – TOVP) by International Society for Krishna Consciousness (ISKCON) at Mayapur, Dist – Nadia, West Bengal. (Violation Case) (Proposal No. SIA/WB/MIS/54814/2018). Name of the Environmental Consultant is M/s. EQMS India Pvt Ltd.**

Activity:

- This is a proposal for construction of a Temple consisting of 3 domed buildings (3 wings) and each of the building will have 6 stories (S+5+Terrace). Land area is 31039.39 sqm. and total built up area is 55448.15 sqm.

Chronology of the event:

- The project proponent applied on 29.08.2017 as violation case and ToR was issued on 05.12.2018 by SEAC.
- The SEAC recommended Environmental Clearance for the proposed project in the 13th meeting held on 12.03.2021 and forwarded the proposal to SEIAA on 30.04.2021.
- SEIAA considered the proposal in their 29th meeting held on 03.08.2021 and referred back to SEAC for reappraisal as per the MoEF&CC O.M. vide F No. 22-21/2020-IA.III dated 07.07.2021.
- SEAC considered the observation and recommendation of the SEIAA vide letter no. 1408/EN/T-II-045/2018 dated 17.08.2021 in the 20th reconstituted SEAC meeting held on 08.09.2021. It was noted that the above mentioned OM of MoEF&CC has been stayed by the Madurai Bench of Hon'ble Madras High Court. In view of the above the SEAC reviewed the entire issue and forwards the proposal to SEIAA for taking further action.
- SEIAA considered the proposal in their meeting held on 09.11.2021 and noted that the project proponent has applied for EC for a part of the entire project area. It is found from the documents that the total land area of the project is 1,69,196.12 sqm., whereas the application is made on an area of 31039.39 sqm. The EC application should be made for the entire project area. In case the project is undertaken in phases, the same should be mentioned fulfilling all the environmental parameters within the project area. The said project has been completed and operational without obtaining EC.

Minutes of the twenty-sixth meeting of the reconstituted State Level Expert Appraisal Committee, West Bengal held on 15.12.2021 at 12:30 p.m. at the Conference Room, Paribesh Bhawan, Bidhannagar.

SEIAA recommended that a site visit to assess the present status of the project is required to be done and requested SEAC to appraise the project afresh after the site visit.

The matter was considered in the 26th reconstituted SEAC meeting held on 15.12.2021 and after detailed discussion the committee recommended that

- i. Entire document like site plan, land documents, sanction plan, remediation plan etc. to be uploaded by the project proponent in PARIVESH Portal.
- ii. SEAC further decided that as requested by SEIAA a field verification of the project site has to be conducted for further consideration of the case.

C. Miscellaneous

1. **Validity extension of Environmental Clearance for the proposed Residential Complex Siddha Eden Lakeville (formerly Bonhooghly Tenement Scheme) by Refugee Relief & Rehabilitation Department, Govt. of West Bengal at Premises No. 561, Bonhooghly Arable Land, PS – Belghoria, Baranagar Municipality Ward No. 15 (old 31/29), Holding No. – 4 (old No. 1290), Kolkata – 700035, Dist – 24 Parganas (North), West Bengal. (Proposal No. SIA/WB/MIS/236421/2021). Name of the Environmental Consultant is M/s. Ultra Tech.**

Activity:

- This was a proposal for Residential Complex composing of 25 (G+15) blocks, 50 (G+3) blocks, 2 community halls and underground car parking with 2412 no. dwelling units.
- The project proponent had obtained Environmental Clearance vide no. 2579/EN/T-II-1/011/2014 dated 16.10.2014 issued by SEIAA for the project.
- Now the project proponent applied in PARIVESH portal for extension of validity period for the EC dated 16.10.2014.
- Project proponent submitted six-monthly compliance report for EC to WBPCB.

Chronology of the event:

- The matter was considered in the 26th reconstituted SEAC meeting held on 15.12.2021 and after detailed discussion the committee noted that as per notifications of the MoEF&CC the present EC is still valid.
- SEAC recommends that the project proponent should submit documents regarding the present status of the project with dated photographs and documents regarding power of attorney.

The SEAC will consider the case on submission of the above-mentioned documents.

2. **Letter vide No. 2137/EN/T-II-1/077/2012(Pt.I) dated 06.12.2021 from SEIAA regarding DSR received from the Dept. of Industry Commerce & Enterprise for Purulia, Purba Bardhaman, Uttar Dinajpur, Paschim Bardhaman and Murshidabad District.**

SEAC considered the above-mentioned letter dated 06.12.2021 of MS, SEIAA. During the meeting, SEAC deliberated the various provisions of Sustainable Sand Mining Management Guidelines,

Minutes of the twenty-sixth meeting of the reconstituted State Level Expert Appraisal Committee, West Bengal held on 15.12.2021 at 12:30 p.m. at the Conference Room, Paribesh Bhawan, Bidhannagar.

2016 and Enforcement & Monitoring Guidelines for sand Mining, 2020. Further, SEAC discussed the DSR of Murshidabad district as sent by Dept. of Industry Commerce & Enterprise. Above-mentioned DSRs will be reviewed by SEAC members for further comments on the reports. It was also decided that the agency who had been entrusted to prepare the DSR of each of the district shall be requested to present their findings to the SEAC in a special meeting. Also Dept. of Industry Commerce & Enterprise should remain present during the meeting.

Table-1 : List of the projects which were placed before the reconstituted SEAC in the twenty-sixth meeting held on 15.12.2021 and the Summary Decisions thereof:

Sl. No.	Name of the unit & Project address	Summary Decision
A. Cases placed for technical presentation		
Construction Sector		
1.	M/s. Power Point Buildcon Pvt. Ltd. Proposed expansion of Residential Complex "Siddha Waterfront" at Old Calcutta Road, Mouza – Patulia, Patulia Gram Panchayet, JL No. 4, Dist – 24 Parganas (North), West Bengal. (VIOLATION CASE).	Absent
Industry Sector		
2.	M/s. Aryan Stone Quarry Proposed Black Stone Mining project at Mouza – Tarachua, JL No. 36, Plot No. 3943(P), 3944, 3045, 3946(P), PS – Rampurhat, Dist – Birbhum, West Bengal.	Recommended for rejection
B. Cases placed for reconsideration		
Construction Sector		
1.	International Society for Krishna Consciousness (ISKCON) Proposed Chaitanya Chandrodaya Mandir & Indian Educational and Cultural Centre (a.k.a. Temple of Vedic Planetarium – TOVP) at Mayapur, Dist – Nadia, West Bengal. (Violation Case).	Asked for additional submission & Site Visit by SEAC
C. Miscellaneous		
1.	Refugee Relief & Rehabilitation Department, Govt. of West Bengal Validity extension of Environmental Clearance for the proposed Residential Complex Siddha Eden Lakeville (formerly Bonhooghly Tenement Scheme) at Premises No. 561, Bonhooghly Arable Land, PS – Belghoria, Baranagar Municipality Ward No. 15 (old 31/29), Holding No. – 4 (old No. 1290), Kolkata – 700035, Dist – 24 Parganas (North), West Bengal.	Asked for additional submission
2.	Letter vide No. 2137/EN/T-II-1/077/2012(Pt.I) dated 06.12.2021 from SEIAA regarding DSR received from the Dept. of Industry Commerce & Enterprise for Purulia, Purba Bardhaman, Uttar Dinajpur, Paschim Bardhaman and Murshidabad District.	To be reviewed by SEAC

Minutes of the twenty-sixth meeting of the reconstituted State Level Expert Appraisal Committee, West Bengal held on 15.12.2021 at 12:30 p.m. at the Conference Room, Paribesh Bhawan, Bidhannagar.

The meeting ended with a vote of thanks to the Chair.

Sd/-

(Dr. Ashit Kumar Mukherjee)
Chairman
State Expert Appraisal Committee, West Bengal

Sd/-

(Dr. Nilangshu Bhusan Basu)
Member
State Expert Appraisal Committee, West Bengal

Sd/-

(Dr. Pradip Kumar Sikdar)
Member
State Expert Appraisal Committee, West Bengal

Sd/-

(Prof. (Dr.) Aniruddha Mukhopadhyay)
Member
State Expert Appraisal Committee, West Bengal

Sd/-

(Dr. Anirban Gupta)
Member
State Expert Appraisal Committee, West Bengal

Sd/-

(Prof. (Dr.) Sampa Chakrabarti)
Member
State Expert Appraisal Committee, West Bengal

Sd/-

(Shri Subhendu Bandhopadhyay)
Member
State Expert Appraisal Committee, West Bengal

Sd/-

(Dr. Indranath Sinha)
Member
State Expert Appraisal Committee, West Bengal

Sd/-

(Roshni Sen, IAS)
Secretary
State Expert Appraisal Committee, West Bengal