

Minutes of the 44th meeting of the State Level Expert Appraisal Committee, West Bengal (2023-2026) held on July 24, 2024 at 14:00 hr at the Conference Room, Paribesh Bhawan, Bidhannagar.

The 44th meeting of the State Level Expert Appraisal Committee (SEAC), West Bengal (2023-2026) was held on Wednesday the 44th July, 2024 at 14:00 hr at the Conference Room, Paribesh Bhawan, Bidhannagar. The following members participated:

1)	Dr. Rajesh Kumar, IPS	Secretary, SEAC	Present
2)	Prof. Anirban Gupta	Chairman, SEAC	Present
3)	Prof. Pradip Kumar Sikdar	Member, SEAC	Present
4)	Prof. Sampa Chakrabarti	Member, SEAC	Present
5)	Prof. Suchandra Bardhan	Member, SEAC	Present
6)	Prof. Aniruddha Mukhopadhyay	Member, SEAC	Present
7)	Prof. Indranath Sinha	Member, SEAC	Present
8)	Shri Shubhendu Bandyopadhyay	Member, SEAC	Present

1) Technical Presentation:-

1.1) Terms of Reference :

1.1.1) Mining of Minerals:

- I. Proposed Nekramara Sand Mine over an area of 4.99 ha (12.33 Acres) on Subarnarekha River at J.L. No.- 129, Plot No.- 230(P), 232(P), 229(P), 228(P), 176(P), 175(P), 183(P), 185(P), 187(P), 218, 182, 181(P), 178(P), 179(P), 180(P), 184(P), 174(P) & 177(P), Mouza – Nekramara, PS– Keshiary, Dist – Paschim Medinipur, West Bengal.**

Proposal No.:	SIA/WB/MIN/73404/2022
Project Proponent:	Shree Shiba Prosad Ghosh.
Environmental Consultant:	M/s. Chaitanya Projects Consultancy Private Limited.

Activities:

- This is a proposal for Nekramara Sand Mine on the MKSHB-6 sand block over an area of 4.99 ha (12.33 Acres) on Subarnarekha River at J.L. No.- 129, Plot No.- 230(P), 232(P), 229(P), 228(P), 176(P), 175(P), 183(P), 185(P), 187(P), 218, 182, 181(P), 178(P), 179(P), 180(P), 184(P), 174(P) & 177(P), Mouza – Nekramara, PS – Keshiary, Dist – Paschim Medinipur, West Bengal.
- **The project is falling within the DSR potential zone code PO_PSM_KS_SR_04_05.**
- As required under the West Bengal Minor Mineral Concession Rules, 2016, the PP got a composite 'Mining Plan with Progressive Mine Closure Plan' for sand mining at the site prepared by an RQP. The Plan has been approved by the State Government on 17.08.2023 and the approved plan has been uploaded at the PARIVESH portal by the PP.

- The production details as mentioned in the Mining Plan is given below :-

Total Area(ha)	Safety Zone (ha)	Production Area (ha)	Thickness (m)	Geological reserve in m3	Mineable Reserve in m3
4.99	0.72	4.27	2.50	492762.5	421662.5

Year	Total Area (Ha)	Production Area (ha)	Thickness in m	Geological reserve (cum)	Mineable Reserve (cum)	Replenishment Rate (%)
1	4.99	4.27	2.50	124750	106750	100
2	4.99	4.27	1.84375	92003.125	78728.125	73.75%
3	4.99	4.27	1.84375	92003.125	78728.125	73.75%
4	4.99	4.27	1.84375	92003.125	78728.125	73.75%
5	4.99	4.27	1.84375	92003.125	78728.125	73.75%
Total Reserve				492762.5	421662.5	

- The PP has uploaded pre-feasibility report for the proposed project.
- The PP has not uploaded valid Letter of Intent from the competent authority.**
- The PP has uploaded cluster certificate from the competent authority. **The sand block is forming cluster with adjacent 2 (two) no. of sand blocks of MKSHB-7 & MKSHB-8 area 5.00 ha and 4.90 ha of having BID IDs 130/SB2021 and 132/SB2021 respectively.**

Chronology of Events

- The PP applied in prescribed format for Terms of Reference and uploaded the application in the PARIVESH portal on 16.07.2024.
- The PP was called for the ToR presentation in the 44th meeting SEAC, WB (2023-2026) held on 24.07.2024 and the PP presented their proposal in this meeting.

SEAC Observations and Recommendations:

- Based on the submission and presentation made by the PP, the SEAC observed that **the plot area** for the proposed project as per the geo-coordinates mentioned in the revised Mining Plan uploaded by the PP **falls within the potential mining zone** recorded in the approved District Survey Report (DSR) of Paschim Medinipur district.
- The SEAC scrutinized the documents submitted by the PP in the 44th meeting of SEAC, WB (2023-2026) held on 24.07.2024 and after careful consideration and detailed deliberation the committee observed that the PP had made a fresh proposal and applied for ToR (SIA/WB/MIN/484274/2024) which was already considered by SEAC on 43rd meeting held on 10.07.2024. ToR was granted to the project.
- Considering the above proposal to be a duplicate application, the SEAC recommended that the proposal may be rejected.**

2) Reconsideration Proposals :-

2.1) Terms of Reference :

2.1.1) Industry Sector :

- I. **Proposed installation of Hot & Cold Rolling Mill Plant at Plot No.220 (Full), 221(P) & 222(P), Nachan Road, Mouza-Kamalpur, J.L No. 47, P.S & P.O.-Durgapur, District-Paschim Bardhaman, West Bengal.**

Proposal No.:

SIA/WB/IND1/443169/2023

Project Proponent:

M/s. Sharp Ferro Alloys Limited.

Activity:

- This is a proposal for 1,50,000 MT /Annum (TMT Bars/Flats) in **Hot Rolling Mill Plant** & 1,20,000 MT/Annum of cold rolled sheet with 6 x 20hi mill, 6 x 4hi mill and 6 bright annealing line in **Cold Rolling Mill Plant**.
- Existing capacity of the plant is -
 - 1) Refined Liquid Metal: 6250 MT/Month (By Using AOD Furnace).
 - 2) 2 X 8 T Induction Furnace (IF)
 - 3) Continuous Casting Machine (CCM) : 2 Strand
 - 4) 1 X 7.5 & 5 X 9 MVA Submerged Arc Furnace (SAF)

Salient Features of the Project:

- Salient features of the project as uploaded by the project proponent (PP) in the PARIVESH portal may be summed up as below –

Project Name	Proposed Installation of Hot & Cold Rolling Mill Plant
Project Location	Plot No.220 (Full), 221 (P) & 222 (P), Nachan Road, Mouza-Kamalpur, J.L No. 47, P.S & P.O.-Durgapur, District-Paschim Bardhaman, West Bengal.
Latitude & Longitude	23°35'25.18"N & 87°18'7.88"E
Production Capacity	1,50,000 MT /Annum (TMT Bars/Flats) & 1,20,000 MT/Annum of cold rolled sheet with 6 x 20hi mill, 6 x 4hi mill and 6 bright annealing line
Raw material requirements	Billets 162000 MT/Year
Total Land Area	20 Acre (Hot & Cold Rolling Mill Project will be installed & commissioned within the existing plant premises).
Green belt development area	6.6 Acres (33% of total land area)
Product	TMT Bars/Flats & Stainless Steel (cold rolled sheet with 6 x 20hi mill, 6 x 4hi mill and 6 bright annealing line)
Working Days	300
Manpower	140 (Exisitn-100 & Expansion-40 Persons)
Expected Cost of the Project	Total Project cost Rs. 30 Crore

Water Requirement	20 KLD (Source of Water: Durgapur Municipal Corporation)
Power Description	2.2 MW (Power Source: Damodar Valley Corporation)

Chronology of Events:

- The existing project has already obtained Consent to Operate from WBPCB
 - a) vide No. CO107590, Memo No. 608-dr-co-s/10/1184 dated 09.04.2019 for Induction Furnace and Ferro Alloys which was valid upto 31.01.2024.
 - b) vide No. CO131921, Memo No. 32-dr-co-s/10/1184 dated 19.02.2021 for refined liquid metal by using of AOD furnace (1x25 T/charge) of capacity 6250 MT which was valid upto 31.01.2024.
 - c) vide No. CO132027, Memo No. 88-7/WPBD-Cont(579)/98(Pt.II) dated 11.01.2012 for Briquettes of 5000 Tons, Ferro Chrome (recovered) of 250 Tons, Ferro Manganese (recovered) of 150 Tons and Silico Manganese (recovered) of 150 Tons which is valid upto 31.01.2024.
- The existing project has already obtained Consent to Establish from WBPCB vide NOC Sl. No. NO137515 Memo No. 525-dr-nc-r/18/0267 dated 27.07.2018 for Rolling Mill of 150000 TPA and AOD of 2x25 T/charge.
- The PP applied in prescribed format for Terms of Reference for the project and uploaded the application in the PARIVESH portal on 06.09.2023.
- The PP was called for the ToR presentation in the 15th meeting of SEAC, WB held on 20.09.2023 and the PP presented their proposal in this meeting.
- The SEAC observed that the PP has submitted the application for installation of Hot Rolling Mill of 1,50,000 MT /Annum (TMT Bars/Flats) & 1,20,000 MT/Annum of cold rolled sheet with 6 x 20hi mill, 6 x 4hi mill and 6 bright annealing line. However, the PP has already obtained CTE for Rolling Mill of 150000 TPA. Therefore, the entire application should be modified in that respect.

It is also observed that the industry is located in Severely Polluted Area (SPA).

- Based on the application made, documents uploaded / submitted, and the presentation made by the PP/Consultant, the SEAC made the following **observations/ additional conditions**:

Mandatory documents:

1. Existing and proposed units to be clearly demarcated..
2. PFR to be modified and uploaded.
3. Compliance of the points mentioned in O.M. issued by MoEF&CC dated 31.10.2019 should be strictly followed and submitted.
4. A certified copy of the report of the status of compliance of the conditions of the CTO for the existing operation of the project.
5. Configuration and production capacity of the existing and proposed project.
6. Photographs of the existing plant area and the area of proposed expansion.
7. Photographs of existing plantation, if there be any.

8. A list of raw materials mentioning quantity source and mode of transport of those required for proposed expansion.
9. Prediction of impacts on air quality and maximum predicted incremental rise in ground level concentration due to proposed expansion.

Land use and layout:

10. Site plan to be corrected clarifying greenbelt area. Both adjacent plots to be showed within same site plan. The minimum greenbelt area should be at least 40% of the total plot area. Action plan to a scale of 1:100 for the greenbelt development over 40% of the total land area with maintenance plan of the plantation is to be submitted.
11. Land use break up showing each facilities / unit operations both in sqm. and percentage adding upto 100% to be submitted.
12. Superimposed mouza map showing the plot area to be submitted.
13. Total land documents of 20 Acre, individual plot nos. showing the status of conversion and mutation in the name of PP should be submitted.

Water and wastewater

14. Permission from DMC for supply of 20 KLD of fresh water.
15. Justification for providing an ETP with wastewater analysis.

Solid waste

16. Clarification of 'refractory' and 'sludge' among solid waste.
17. MOU for disposal of slag and dust and analysis of slag and dust to be submitted.

Disaster risk reduction

18. Risk assessment, precautionary measures, and disaster management plan to be submitted.

Social part of EMP

19. EMP as per Office Memorandum of MoEF & CC vide F. No. 22-65/2017.IA.III dated 30.09.2020 to be submitted. Consents from the beneficiaries of the social part of EMP should be furnished. Any other local need should be identified.
- The project proponent uploaded their reply in PARIVESH Portal on 24.05.2024, which was considered in the 40th meeting SEAC, WB (2023-2026) held on 08.06.2024.
 - The SEAC scrutinized the documents submitted by the PP in the 40th meeting SEAC, WB (2023-2026) held on 08.06.2024. Based on the submission made by the PP, the SEAC observed that the PP has not submitted any reply to the query raised. Therefore, the PP is requested to submit specific point wise reply to the queries.
 - The project proponent uploaded their reply in PARIVESH Portal on 10.07.2024, which was considered in the 44th meeting SEAC, WB (2023-2026) held on 24.07.2024.

SEAC Observations and Recommendations:

- The PP along with the consultant appeared for presentation for their project based on the replies to the queries raised. The SEAC observed that the PP could not submit proper reply to the queries raised. The figures mentioned in the PFR of production of billets to 162000 MT/Year from 2 X 8 T Induction Furnaces could not be explained by the PP / consultant. Moreover, it was observed that the drone video and the site plan did not match with the KML view provided. This should be clarified. Also, the area

provided for greenbelt was found to be less. The tree plantation should be at least 40% of the total project area. Compensatory area for the plantation along with the documentation for land could not be shown by the PP.

Considering the above, the **PP should revise the project proposal and appear for a fresh presentation.**

2.2) Environmental Clearance :

2.2.1) Construction Sector :

- I. **Proposed development of a residential & resort complex project comprising of villas, guest rooms alongwith recreational and hospitality facilities at Dag No. - 155, 161 – 164, 210, 399 – 401, 403 - 414, 418 – 420, 422 – 442, 454, 455, 458 - 460, 462 – 505, 513, 578 – 580, 583 – 586, 588 – 597, 604, 605, Mouza - Somsara & Srirampur, P.S. - Dadpur, P.O. – Hanral, Dadpur Gram Panchayat, Dist.- Hooghly, PIN – 712149, West Bengal.**

Proposal No.:	SIA/WB/INFRA2/446647/2023
Project Proponent:	M/s. Purti Hotels And Resorts Private Limited.
Environmental Consultant:	M/s. Centre for Sustainable Development.

Activities:

- This is a proposal for development of a residential & resort complex project comprising of villas, guest rooms alongwith recreational and hospitality facilities. Total land area 1,81,704.01 sqm. (as per land deed) and 1,81,056.82 sq.m (As per physical survey). Total built up area is 57,792.93 sq.m.

Chronology of Events:

- The SEAC recommended the proposed project for Environmental Clearance in the 30th meeting of SEAC (2023-2026) held on 28.02.2024 and forwarded the proposal to SEIAA.
- SEIAA considered the recommendation of SEAC in its 45th meeting held on 05.07.2024 and ADS replies submitted by the PP on 29.04.2024 and 27.05.2024. PP could not justify in the ADS reply permission for extraction of 2160 KLD groundwater against its present requirement of 361 KLD. PP attended the hearing before the SEIAA and submitted a different justification (from ADS reply to SEIAA in PARIVESH portal) for having the preset permission of ground water extraction of 2160 KLD.
- PP has replied in ADS to do plantation in additional area however, approved plantation plan of DFO has not been submitted.
- SEIAA in its 45th meeting held on 05.07.2024 referred back the proposal to SEAC for reappraisal since the project has acquired ground water abstraction permission of 2160 KLD which is of industrial nature against requirement of 361 KLD. SEIAA observed that as per the present nature of the project, hence a detail assessment and justification of such huge abstraction permission of industrial nature need to be done.

SEAC observations and recommendations:

- The proposal was discussed in the 44th SEAC meeting held on 24.07.2024. Considering the decision taken by the SEIAA in its 45th meeting held on 05.07.2024,

the SEAC decided that the PP should submit reasoned justification to the observation made by SEIAA. The PP should also submit fresh DFO plantation plan for the project as mentioned by SEIAA in its meeting.

The SEAC recommended that the above documents may be submitted in the PARIVESH portal for further consideration of the application.

The SEAC will further consider the case on submission of satisfactory reply on the above-mentioned queries only through “PARIVESH” portal.

Table-1 : List of the projects which were placed before the SEAC, WB (2023-2026) in the forth-fourth meeting held on 24.07.2024 and the Summary Decisions / Recommendations thereon:

Sl. No.	Name of the unit and Project address	Summary Decision
1. Technical Presentation		
1.1) Terms of Reference		
1.1.1) Mining of Minerals		
I.	Shree Shiba Prosad Ghosh. Proposed Nekramara Sand Mine over an area of 4.99 ha (12.33 Acres) on Subarnarekha River at J.L. No.- 129, Plot No.- 230(P), 232(P), 229(P), 228(P), 176(P), 175(P), 183(P), 185(P), 187(P), 218, 182, 181(P), 178(P), 179(P), 180(P), 184(P), 174(P) & 177(P), Mouza – Nekramara, Police station- Keshiary, Dist – Paschim Medinipur, West Bengal. (Proposal No.: SIA/WB/MIN/73404/2022)	Rejected
2. Reconsideration proposals		
2.1) Terms of Reference		
2.1.1) Industry Sector		
I.	M/s. Sharp Ferro Alloys Limited. Proposed Expansion of Existing Plant by Installation of Hot & Cold Rolling Mill Plant at Plot No. - 220 (Full), 221 (P) & 222 (P), Nachan Road, Mouza - Kamalpur, J.L No. - 47, P.S & P.O. - Durgapur, District - Paschim Bardhaman, West Bengal. (Proposal No.: SIA/WB/IND1/443169/2023)	Additional Details Sought
2.2) Environmental Clearance		
2.2.1) Construction Sector		
I.	M/s. Purti Hotels and Resorts Private Limited Proposed Residential Complex and Resort Complex at Village - Dadpur Gram Panchayat, Dag No. - 155, 161 – 164, 210, 399 – 401, 403 – 414, 418 – 420, 422 – 442, 454, 455, 458 – 460, 462 – 505, 513, 578 – 580, 583 – 586, 588 – 597, 604, 605, Mouza - Somsara & Srirampur, P.S. - Dadpur, P.O. – Hanral, Dist.- Hooghly, Pincode – 712149, West Bengal. (Proposal No. SIA/WB/INFRA2/446647/2023)	Additional Details Sought

There being no other agenda the Chair thanked the members present for their fruitful participation and deliberations. The meeting ended with a vote of thanks to the Chair.

Sd/-

(Anirban Gupta)
Chairman
S E A C, West Bengal

Sd/-

(Pradip Kumar Sikdar)
Member
S E A C, West Bengal

Sd/-

(Suchandra Bardhan)
Member
S E A C, West Bengal

Sd/-

(Sampa Chakrabarti)
Member
S E A C, West Bengal

Sd/-

(Indranath Sinha)
Member
S E A C, West Bengal

Sd/-

(Aniruddha Mukhopadhyay)
Member
S E A C, West Bengal

Sd/-

(Shubhendu Bandyopadhyay)
Member
S E A C, West Bengal

Sd/-

(Rajesh Kumar, IPS)
Secretary
S E A C, West Bengal