

Minutes of the 34th meeting of the State Level Expert Appraisal Committee, West Bengal (2023-2026) held on April 03, 2024 at 14:00 hr at the Conference Room, Paribesh Bhawan, Bidhannagar.

The 34th meeting of the State Level Expert Appraisal Committee (SEAC), West Bengal (2023-2026) was held on Wednesday the 03rd April, 2024 at 14:00 hr at the Conference Room, Paribesh Bhawan, Bidhannagar. The following members participated:

1)	Dr. Rajesh Kumar, IPS	Secretary, SEAC	Present
2)	Prof. (Dr.) Anirban Gupta	Chairman, SEAC	Present
3)	Prof. Sampa Chakrabarti	Member, SEAC	Present
4)	Prof. Suchandra Bardhan	Member, SEAC	Present
5)	Prof. (Dr.) Pradip Kumar Sikdar	Member, SEAC	Present
6)	Prof. (Dr.) Indranath Sinha	Member, SEAC	Present
7)	Prof. (Dr.) Aniruddha Mukhopadhyay	Member, SEAC	Present
8)	Shri Shubhendu Bandyopadhyay	Member, SEAC	Present

1) Reconsideration proposals :-

1.1) Environmental Clearance :

1.1.1) Construction Sector :

- I. **Proposed expansion of residential complex – Bungalows with Club at L.R. Dag No. – 282, 218, 230, 280, 268, 267, 266, 269, 264, 263, 261, 257, 258, 256, 276, 277, 278, 279, 281, 283, 253, 260, 252, 240, 250, 248, 246, 251, 249, 242, 243, 262, 265, 247, 245, 241 & 244, JL No. – 74, Mouza – Raghampur & L.R. Dag No. – 212, 210, JL No. – 75, Mouza – Dhamaitala, PS – Sonarpur, under Poleghat Gram Panchayat, Dist. – 24 Parganas (South), West Bengal.**

Proposal No.: SIA/WB/INFRA2/448565/2023
Project Proponent: M/s. Raghampur Projects LLP.
Environmental Consultant: M/s. Ultra-Tech.

Activity:

- This is a proposal for expansion of a Residential Complex – Bungalows with Club comprising of the following configuration:-

Description	Existing as per EC dated 28.04.2023	Expansion Part	Total after Expansion
Land area (as per physical measurement)	39587.82 sqm	3679.89 sqm	43267.71 sqm
No. of Block & Storey	Bungalows - three (3) storied	Bungalows - three (3) storied	Bungalows - three (3) storied
No. of Units	Bungalows - 264 nos.	Bungalows - 31 nos.	Bungalows - 295 nos.
Total Built-up Area	40170.24 sqm	4716.96 sqm	44887.2 sqm

Salient Features of the project:

- Salient features of the expansion project as uploaded by the PP in the PARIVESH portal may be summed up as below –

Description	As per Environmental Clearance issued vide EC Identification No. EC23B038WB142770 dated 28.04.2023	Expansion Part	Total after Expansion
Land area (as per physical measurement)	39587.82 sqm	3679.89 sqm	43267.71 sqm
No. of Block & Storey	Bungalows - three (3) storied	Bungalows - three (3) storied	Bungalows - three (3) storied
No. of Units	Bungalows - 264 nos.	Bungalows - 31 nos.	Bungalows - 295 nos.
Expected population	2033 (permanent - 1848, temporary - 185) persons	244 (permanent - 217, temporary - 27)	2277 (permanent - 2065, temporary - 212)
Total Water requirement	280 KLD (non-monsoon season) 219 KLD (monsoon season)	50 KLD (non-monsoon season) 46 KLD (monsoon season)	330 KLD
Fresh Water requirement	170 KLD	25 KLD	195 KLD
Wastewater generated	175 KLD	25 KLD	200 KLD
Treated Wastewater reused	110 KLD (non-monsoon season), 49 KLD (monsoon season)	25 KLD (non-monsoon season), 21 KLD (monsoon season)	135 KLD (non-monsoon season)
Treated Wastewater discharged	65 KLD (non-monsoon season), 126 KLD (monsoon season)	Zero discharge (0 KLD) (non-monsoon season), 4 KLD (monsoon season)	65 KLD (non-monsoon season), 130 KLD (monsoon season)
Solid Waste disposal	945 kg/day	105 kg/day	1050 kg/day
Total Built-up Area	40170.24 sqm	4716.96 sqm	44887.2 sqm
Ground Coverage	16521.12 sqm (41.73%)	-	18461.10 sqm (42.67%)
Exclusive Tree Plantation Area	8193.94 sqm (20.70%)	-	8787.30 sqm (20.31%)
Service Area	931.57 sqm (2.35%)	-	824.07 sqm (1.90%)
Land Area for Future Expansion	201.50 sqm (0.51%)	-	201.50 sqm (0.47%)
Road/Paved Area	9194.76 sqm (23.23%)	-	10141.50 sqm (23.44%)
Other Green Area	2655.17 sqm (6.71%)	-	2740.83 sqm (6.33%)
Open Parking Area	1889.76 sqm (4.77%)	-	2111.41 sqm (4.88%)
Plantation proposed	580 nos.	-	720 nos.
Solar street light	50 nos.	-	50 nos. (Solar power of more than 1% will be installed and used within the project)
Nos. of Parking spaces proposed	264 nos.	31 nos.	295 nos.
Total Power requirement	1220 KVA (976 KW), WBSEDCL	145 KVA (116 KW), WBSEDCL	1365 KVA (1092 KW), WBSEDCL

Description	As per Environmental Clearance issued vide EC Identification No. EC23B038WB142770 dated 28.04.2023	Expansion Part	Total after Expansion
Back up power	1 no. 650 KVA DG set	1 no. 650 KVA DG set	2 nos. 650 KVA DG sets
Project Cost (Rs.)	Rs.81.3977 crores	Rs.11.1760 crores	Rs.92.5737 crores

Chronology of the Events:

- Earlier the Project Proponent (PP) had obtained Environmental Clearance from SEIAA vide EC Identification No. EC23B038WB142770 dated 28.04.2023 for total built up area of 39587.82 sqm. for 264 nos. of Bungalows and land area of 39587.92 sqm.
- The PP applied in prescribed format for Environmental Clearance for the expansion of existing project and uploaded the application in the PARIVESH portal on 05.10.2023.
- The PP was called for the EC presentation in the 18th meeting of the SEAC, WB (2023-2026) held on 08.11.2023.
- The PP did not appear before the SEAC for EC presentation. The SEAC decided that the PP should explain the reasons for its absence. If the reasons are found to be acceptable and satisfactory, the PP may be allowed to present its case in a subsequent meeting.
- The PP uploaded their reply in PARIVESH Portal on 06.01.2024, requesting for presentation of their proposal in the SEAC meeting. The PP was once again called for EC presentation in the 25th meeting of SEAC, WB (2023-2026) held on 17.01.2024.
- Based on the application made, documents uploaded / submitted, and the presentation made by the PP/Consultant, the SEAC made the following observations:

Mandatory documents:

- 1) The concurrences from Poleghat Gram Panchayet regarding storm water discharge, treated water discharge, solid waste disposal etc. is given to M/s. Aadhira Nirman Pvt. Ltd. & Others for construction of the project only on LR Dag Nos. 234, 236, 237 and 238. However, the other Dag Nos. are not included by the Poleghat Gram Panchayet.
- 2) The Development Agreement uploaded in the portal mentions the land area to be of 1232 decimals (49852.67 sqm.) while the land summary document shows the land area to be of 1121 decimals (45361.08 sqm.). However, as per sanction plan the plot area (as per physical measurement) is 43267.71 sqm. Reasons for the discrepancies should be submitted.
- 3) Permission from WBF&ES for the project.
- 4) The expansion part should be demarcated on the relevant drawings for better understanding.

Water & waste water

- 5) Arsenic test report of groundwater should be submitted.
- 6) Litholog including the local ground water levels in wells. The depth of the wells should also be provided. Proposal for installation of piezometer with automatic water level meter. The design of the piezometer should also be provided.
- 7) Details of raw water treatment plant should be submitted with flowsheet.

- 8) Water balance diagram for the project both for the monsoon and non-monsoon periods should be submitted. The disparity in the presented slides should be clarified/ explained. Water meters with totalizers should be installed at inlet of freshwater, and inlet, recycling and discharge lines of STP. The totalizer readings should be submitted along with periodical compliance reports.
- 9) Water balance for the whole project, including STP should be submitted and the net wastewater discharge should be mentioned.
- 10) SWID permission for the total water requirement of the project.
- 11) Since it is a bungalow-project with distributed points of consumption and discharge, the detailed distribution plan of water and wastewater should be provided.

Need based EMP

- 12) Compliance of earlier need-based activities given in the EC issued vide EC Identification No. EC23B038WB142770, dated 28.04.2023. Evidence should be provided by photograph and/or certificate from the beneficiaries.
- 13) Specific need-based activities for the proposed expansion part of the project indicating the beneficiaries involved.

The SEAC recommended that the above documents may be submitted in the PARIVESH portal for further consideration of the application.

- The project proponent uploaded their reply in PARIVESH Portal on 19.03.2024, which was considered in the 34th meeting of SEAC, WB (2023-2026) held on 03.04.2024.

SEAC observations and recommendations:

- The SEAC scrutinized the documents submitted by the PP in the 34th meeting of SEAC, WB (2023-2026) held on 03.04.2024. After careful consideration and detailed deliberation, the committee **recommended the proposed project for Environmental Clearance.**

1.1.2) Mining of Minerals (other than sand)

- I. **Proposed Upardanga Granite Stone Quarry over an area of 1 ha (2.471 Acres) of capacity 19564.36 MT/year at Mouza - Talsankra, J.L. No. - 163, Plot No. – 3310, P.S. - Raghunathpur, Dist. – Purulia, Pin – 723101, West Bengal.**

Proposal No.:	SIA/WB/MIN/442652/2023
Project Proponent:	M/s. Todi Minerals Private Limited.
Environmental Consultant:	M/s. Ultra-Tech.

Activities:

- This is a proposal for Upardanga Granite Stone Quarry over an area of 1.0 ha (2.471 Acres) at Mouza - Talsankra, J.L. No. - 163, Plot No. – 3310, P.S. - Raghunathpur, Dist. – Purulia, Pin – 723101, West Bengal.
- As required under the West Bengal Minor Mineral Concession Rules, 2016, the PP got a composite 'Mining Plan' prepared for proposed Granite Mine at the site by an RQP. The Plan has been approved by the State Government on 07.02.2023 and the approved plan has been uploaded at the PARIVESH portal by the PP. It is mentioned in the approved Plan that there is total mineable reserve is 99,760 m³ while the total geological reserves is 248704 m³.

- The PP has uploaded pre-feasibility report for the proposed project.

Chronology of the Events:

- The project proponent had already obtained Environmental Clearance vide No. 966/EN/T-II-1/008/2013 dated 17.04.2015 issued by SEIAA and Consent to Operate from WBPCB vide No. CO134679, Memo No. 290-WPBA/Red/Pol/Cont/192/05 dated 17.07.2023 which is valid upto 31.05.2028.
- The PP applied in prescribed format for Environmental Clearance for the expansion of production capacity and uploaded the application in the PARIVESH portal on 14.09.2023.
- The PP was called for the EC presentation in the 17th meeting of SEAC, WB (2023-2026) held on 18.10.2023 and the PP presented their proposal in this meeting.
- Based on the submission and presentation made by the PP, the committee made the following **observations/ additional conditions:**

1. The PP should submit Certified Compliance Report (CCR) from the MoEF&CC as directed in the Notification issued vide F No. IA3-22/10/2022-IA.III[E 177258] dated 08.06.2022.
2. The geo-coordinates of the project plot as mentioned in the Mine Plan and PFR does not match.
3. Site layout plan with green belt does not show the road access into the quarry area, while the existing road is clearly visible in the Google map. Thus, green belt area needs to be adjusted accordingly. The waste dump site connectivity w.r.to the quarry site is not clear. Is it the adjacent one? But then the profile does not match. Needs to be marked in a single Google map image with accessibility shown. Will there be another road at the back for waste dumping? Then greenbelt area will be further reduced. Haul road layout, storage area, Garland drain layout settling tank, and Rainwater harvesting Tank should be shown in a map/diagram. A revised map with the roads need to be shown.
4. 'Road side green area' as shown in plantation plan- not clear if PP is committing to implement this. If yes, agreement with local body (panchayat?) for protection after mine closure and specific management plan to be proposed. Compliance report should also include on the progress of all in-situ and ex-situ plantation health/ progressive plantation.
5. Need-based activities to be more specific. Consents from the beneficiaries should be furnished.
6. Photographs of existing condition of the site (geotagged with date) should be submitted.

The SEAC recommended that the above documents may be submitted in the PARIVESH portal for further consideration of the application.

- The project proponent uploaded their reply in PARIVESH Portal on 19.03.2024, which was considered in the 34th meeting of SEAC, WB (2023-2026) held on 03.04.2024.

SEAC observations and recommendations:

- The SEAC scrutinized the documents submitted by the PP in the 34th meeting of SEAC, WB (2023-2026) held on 03.04.2024 and after careful consideration and detailed

deliberation the committee noted that the PP has not submitted any specific and proper reply to the query raised. The PP is requested to submit specific and proper reply to the above and the documents may be submitted in the PARIVESH portal for further consideration of the application.

All the documents should be duly signed both by the project proponent and the environmental consultant.

The SEAC will further consider the case on submission of satisfactory reply on the above-mentioned queries only through "PARIVESH" portal.

1.1.3) Mining of Minerals

- I. **Proposed Mirik Riverbed Sand Mine (MIN_DJ_27) over an area of 4.80 ha (11.86 Acres) in the Chenga River at Mouza – Manjha, JL No. 4, Plot No. 132 & 141 and Mouza – Panighata, JI No. 5, Plot No. 06 & 07, PS – Mirik, Dist – Darjeeling, West Bengal.**

Proposal No.	SIA/WB/MIN/435925/2023
Project Proponent -	M/s. West Bengal Mineral Development & Trading Corporation Limited.
Environmental Consultant -	M/s. Indian Mine Planners and Consultants.

Activities:

- This is a proposal for Mirik Riverbed Sand Mine (MIN_DJ_27) over an area of 4.80 ha (11.86 Acres) in the Chenga River at Mouza – Manjha, JL No. 4, Plot No. 132 & 141 and Mouza – Panighata, JI No. 5, Plot No. 06 & 07, PS – Mirik, Dist – Darjeeling, West Bengal.
- **The project is falling within the potential zone code DR_MR_CG_01.**
- The PP has obtained Provisional Grant Order for Sand Blocks vide Memo No. 261-ICE-12011(99)/27/2022-MINES Dated 20.04.2023.
- As required under the West Bengal Minor Mineral Concession Rules, 2016, the PP got a composite 'Mining Plan with Progressive Mine Closure Plan' for riverbed sand mining at the site prepared by an RQP. The Plan has been approved by the State Government on 27.06.2023 and the approved plan has been uploaded at the PARIVESH portal by the PP.
- The production details as mentioned in the revised Mining Plan dated 18.03.2024 is given below :-

Considerations for resource and reserve calculation of the area :

Total Area (ha)	Safety Zone (ha)	Production area (ha)	Thickness (m)
4.80	1.25	3.55	1.00

Geological reserves of the sand deposit

Year	Total Area (ha)	Total Area (m ²)	Thickness (m)	Replenishment Rate (%)	Geological Resource (cu.m)
1 st	4.80	48,000	100	100	48,000
2 nd	4.80	48,000	0.78	78.0	37440.00
3 rd	4.80	48,000	0.78	78.0	37440.00
4 th	4.80	48,000	0.78	78.0	37440.00
5 th	4.80	48,000	0.78	78.0	37440.00
Total Geological Reserve (Cu.M)					197760.00
Total Geological Reserve (C.Ft.)					0.698 Cr

Mineable Reserves of the sand deposit

Year	Total Area (ha)	Total Area (m ²)	Thickness (m)	Replenishment Rate (%)	Mineable Reserve (cu.m)
1 st	3.55	35,500.00	1.00	100	35500.00
2 nd	3.55	35,500.00	0.78	78.0	27960.00
3 rd	3.55	35,500.00	0.78	78.0	27960.00
4 th	3.55	35,500.00	0.78	78.0	27960.00
5 th	3.55	35,500.00	0.78	78.0	27960.00
Total Mineable Reserve (Cu.M)					146340.00
Total Mineable Reserve (C.Ft.)					0.517 Cr.

The Mineable Reserves separately for sand and gravels/pebbles is furnished below:

Year	Mineable Reserve (cu.m)	Percentage of Gravel & Pebbles (%)	Volume of Gravel & Pebbles (Cu.M)	Volume of Sand (Cu.M)
1 st	35,500.00	40	14200.00	21300.00
2 nd	27960.00	40	11184.00	16776.00
3 rd	27960.00	40	11184.00	16776.00
4 th	27960.00	40	11184.00	16776.00
5 th	27960.00	40	11184.00	16776.00
Total Mineable Reserve (Cu.M)			58936.00	88404.00

- The PP has uploaded pre-feasibility report for the proposed project.
- The PP has uploaded non-cluster certificate from the competent authority. **The sand block does not form a cluster with any adjacent sand block.**
- The PP has submitted an undertaking regarding need-based EMP.
- The PP has submitted the requisite EC processing fees as required under Notification No 924/T-II-1/021/2022 dated 23.05.2022 issued by Department of Environment, Government of West Bengal.

Chronology of Events

- The PP applied in prescribed format for Environmental Clearance and uploaded the application in the PARIVESH portal on 07.07.2023.

- The PP was called for the EC presentation in the 9th meeting SEAC, WB held on 26.07.2023 and the PP presented their proposal in this meeting.
- Based on the submission and presentation made by the PP, the SEAC observed that **the entire plot area** for the proposed project as per the geo-coordinates mentioned in the approved Mining Plan with Progressive Mine Closure Plan **falls within the potential mining zone** recorded in the approved District Survey Report (DSR) of Darjeeling district.
- However, the SEAC observed that Mouza – Panighata is designated as hilly area according to the West Bengal Act XIII of 1988. Hence, the mine working depth should be limited to 1.0 metre below the riverbed level. Revised reserves based on the above, approved by the competent authority, should be submitted.
- The project proponent uploaded their reply in PARIVESH Portal on 07.11.2023, which was considered in the 19th meeting SEAC, WB (2023-2026) held on 22.11.2023.
- Based on the submission made by the PP, the SEAC observed that the PP has not submitted specific replies to the query raised. Therefore, the PP is requested to submit the revised documents as mentioned above.
- The project proponent uploaded their reply in PARIVESH Portal on 20.02.2024, which was considered in the 30th meeting SEAC, WB (2023-2026) held on 28.02.2024.
- The SEAC after careful consideration and detailed deliberation the committee recommended that the revised reserves should be incorporated in the approved Mine and Mine Closure Plan and the PP should upload the same in the portal.
- The project proponent uploaded their reply **along with the revised Mine Plan dated 18.03.2024 in cancellation of the earlier Mine Plan dated 27.06.2023** in PARIVESH Portal on 19.03.2024, which was considered in the 34th meeting of SEAC, WB (2023-2026) held on 03.04.2024.

SEAC observations and recommendations:

- The SEAC scrutinized the documents submitted by the PP in the 34th meeting of SEAC, WB (2023-2026) held on 03.04.2024 and after careful consideration and detailed deliberation the committee **recommended the proposed project for Environmental Clearance** with the conditions that the following should be submitted along with the six monthly compliance report :-
 - 1) Monthly monitoring of base flow level at four points of the project should be conducted by installing piezometer and to be reported in the six monthly compliance report.
 - 2) Stipulated plantation should preferably be done adjacent to the project. If not possible due to unavailability of suitable land, plantation may be done at other location in the same block. The particular plantation area should be dedicated and marked for the particular project and to be certified by the respective BDO.
 - 3) Sieve analysis report for grain size distribution should be provided along with six monthly compliance report.
 - 4) Status of the need-based activities to be reported during six monthly progress report.
 - 5) Transportation plan should be provided in six monthly compliance report.

- 6) Basic amenities, safety and occupational health examinations for labourers to be provided along with six monthly compliance reports.
- 7) To enhance success/ survival rate the plantation shall be attempted during the first two years of the project life and the plantation so done shall be taken care of during the rest of the project life. Species of the plant selected should be self-sustaining in that particular region. Geotagged photographs of actual plantation done to be submitted along with six monthly compliance reports. Credible document regarding plantation by the Forest department on behalf of the project proponent should be submitted.
- 8) The project cost may include the auction bid value, estimated royalty to be paid, cost of any infrastructure built like office space, stockyard, etc. The calculation/documents to estimate the project cost should be submitted. The planned expenditure for components like need-based activities may be derived based on the project cost. Proper documents should be submitted along with the six-monthly compliance report.
- 9) Studies on the biotic components of the river and the impact of sand mining on these components should be submitted.
- 10) Bank line monitoring report should be submitted along with the six-monthly progress reports.

Table-1 : List of the projects which were placed before the SEAC, WB (2023-2026) in the thirty-fourth meeting held on 03.04.2024 and the Summary Decisions thereof:

Sl. No.	Name of the unit and Project address	Summary Decision
1. Reconsideration proposals		
1.1) Environmental Clearance		
1.1.1) Construction Sector		
I.	M/s. Raghampur Projects LLP Proposed expansion of residential complex – Bungalows with Club at L.R. Dag No. – 282, 218, 230, 280, 268, 267, 266, 269, 264, 263, 261, 257, 258, 256, 276, 277, 278, 279, 281, 283, 253, 260, 252, 240, 250, 248, 246, 251, 249, 242, 243, 262, 265, 247, 245, 241 & 244, JL No. – 74, Mouza – Raghampur & L.R. Dag No. – 212, 210, JL No. – 75, Mouza – Dhamaitala, PS – Sonarpur, under Poleghat Gram Panchayat, Dist. – 24 Parganas (South), West Bengal. (Proposal No.: SIA/WB/INFRA2/448565/2023)	Recommended for Environmental Clearance
1.1.2) Mining of Minerals (other than sand)		
I.	M/s. Todi Minerals Private Limited. Proposed Upardanga Granite Stone Quarry over an area of 1 ha (2.471 Acres) at Mouza - Talsankra, J.L. No. - 163, Plot No. – 3310, P.S. - Raghunathpur, Dist. – Purulia, Pin – 723101, West Bengal. (Proposal No.: SIA/WB/ MIN/442652/2023)	Additional Details Sought
1.1.3) Mining of Minerals		

Sl. No.	Name of the unit and Project address	Summary Decision
I.	M/s. West Bengal Mineral Development And Trading Corporation Limited Proposed Mirik Riverbed Sand Mine (MIN_DJ_27) over an area of 4.80 ha (11.86 Acres) in the Chenga River at Mouza – Manjha, JL No. 4, Plot No. 132 & 141 and Mouza – Panighata, JI No. 5, Plot No. 06 & 07, PS – Mirik, Dist – Darjeeling, West Bengal. (Proposal No. SIA/WB/MIN/435925/2023)	Recommended for Environmental Clearance

There being no other agenda the Chair thanked the members present for their fruitful participation and deliberations. The meeting ended with a vote of thanks to the Chair.

Sd/-

Sd/-

(Prof. (Dr.) Anirban Gupta)
Chairman

State Expert Appraisal Committee, West Bengal

(Dr. Pradip Kumar Sikdar)
Member

State Expert Appraisal Committee, West Bengal

Sd/-

Sd/-

(Prof. (Dr.) Suchandra Bardhan)
Member

State Expert Appraisal Committee, West Bengal

(Prof. (Dr.) Sampa Chakrabarti)
Member

State Expert Appraisal Committee, West Bengal

Sd/-

Sd/-

(Prof. (Dr.) Indranath Sinha)
Member

State Expert Appraisal Committee, West Bengal

(Prof. (Dr.) Aniruddha Mukhopadhyay)
Member

State Expert Appraisal Committee, West Bengal

Sd/-

Sd/-

(Shri Shubhendu Bandyopadhyay)
Member

State Expert Appraisal Committee, West Bengal

(Dr. Rajesh Kumar, IPS)
Secretary

State Expert Appraisal Committee, West Bengal