

**MINUTES OF THE 257th MEETING OF THE EXPERT APPRAISAL COMMITTEE
FOR PROJECTS RELATED TO COASTAL REGULATION ZONE HELD ON
5th MARCH, 2021**

The 257th meeting of the Expert Appraisal Committee for projects related to Coastal Regulation Zone was held on 05/03/2021 through Video Conferencing due to prevalent pandemic situation. The members present are:

1.	Dr. Deepak Arun Apte	-	Chairman
2.	Dr. Manoranjan Hota	-	Member
3.	Shri S. Jeyakrishnan	-	Member
4.	Shri Manmohan Singh Negi	-	Member
5.	Shri Sham Wagh	-	Member
6.	Prof. Ashok Kumar Pachauri	-	Member
7.	Dr. M.V. Ramana Murthy	-	Member
8.	Dr. V.K. Jain	-	Member
9.	Dr. R.P.S. Verma	-	Member
10.	Dr. H. Kharkwal	-	Member Secretary

Prof. Mukesh Khare and Ms Bindhu Manghat were absent.

In attendance: Dr. Bhawana Kapkoti Negi, Technical Officer, MoEF&CC. The deliberations held and the decisions taken are as under:

2.0 CONFIRMATION OF THE MINUTES OF THE LAST MEETING

The Committee having noted that the Minutes of the 255th meeting are in order, confirmed the same with suggestions that in case any typographical / grammatical errors are noticed in due course, the same may be corrected suitably.

3.0 CONSIDERATION OF PROPOSALS

FRESH PROPOSALS

3.1 Proposed Temporary Working Space required at Pongi Balu for placement of HDD rig and other ancillary equipment's and at Rutland for fabrication of pipe string and placement of related equipment's to complete the laying of sub-marine pipeline between Rutland and Pongi Balu across MacPherson's strait in A&N Islands by M/s Andaman Public Works Department(APWD), Port Blair, Andaman & Nicobar-CRZ Clearance reg. [IA/AN/CRZ/188544/2020] [F.No.11/2/2021-IAIII]

The above said proposal was not deliberated as Project Proponent was not present and no documents were circulated to the Expert Committee Member for its consideration. Accordingly; the proposal was deferred for reconsideration at a later stage.

3.2 Proposal for construction of infiltration galleries and connecting pipeline in the bank of Rushikulya river and sourcing of surface water from the Rushikulya river through the existing pipeline at Ganjam in Odisha by M/s Grasim Industries Limited - CRZ Clearance reg. [IA/OR/CRZ/195447/2021] [F.NO.11/3/2021-IAIII]

The proposal of M/s Grasim Industries Limited is for construction of infiltration galleries and connecting pipeline in the bank of Rushikulya river and sourcing of surface water from the Rushikulya river through the existing pipeline at Ganjam in Odisha. The project proponent made a presentation and provided the following information:

- (i) Proposed to construct the Infiltration Galleries and connecting pipeline in the bank of Rushikulya river and sourcing of surface water from the Rushikulya river.
- (ii) The main source of water for the manufacturing plant are bore wells. The proponent proposed to set up Infiltration Galleries to obtain surface water of 3.5 MLD for the chemical manufacturing plant to minimize the drawl of ground water.
- (iii) Received approval from Water Resources; Government of Odisha vide letter no 29485/wr dated 18/12/2019.
- (iv) The pipeline will pass through CRZ III (215.62 m) and CRZ IVB (184.99 m) thus total length of pipeline will be 400.61 m.
- (v) The proposed facilities are at a distance of 6.5 km from the river mouth and from the GIL plant.
- (vi) The length of pipeline will be about 331 m, which will be connected from Intake well to Infiltration well and the existing pipe line is about 70 m, which is connected from Infiltration well.
- (vii) DG set will be provided as per Odisha State Pollution Control Board norms.
- (viii) The project site is near the turtle nesting ground.
- (ix) Mangroves are not present near the project site.
- (x) The solid waste shall be collected and disposed as per Solid Waste Management rule 2016.
- (xi) The CRZ map of 1:4000 has been prepared by Indian Institute of Remote Sensing, Anna University, Chennai, as per approved CZMP and CRZ Notification 2011.
- (xii) The total cost of the project is ₹3.22 Cr.
- (xiii) Approval from Department of Water Resources; Government of Odisha vide Letter No. 29485/wr dated 18/12/2019.
- (xiv) No Objection Certificate from State Pollution Control Board vide Letter No. 12843-IND-II-CTE-6220 dated 18/12/2020
- (xv) The Odisha Coastal Zone Management Authority has recommended the proposal for clearance vide their letter No. OCZMA/53/2020 39/OCZMA, dated 1st February, 2021.

2. The Committee noted that Rushikulya river is a perineal river, which could be dry during the monsoon season. The Committee therefore suggested that onsite water flow monitoring may be ensured, for one year. Further the Committee also noted that as per EMP, the project proponent should clean the beach annually with joint venture of the State Forest Department. The project site is near the turtle nesting ground; plantation should not do near turtle nesting area. Based on the deliberations held and submissions made, the Committee recommended the proposal for CRZ clearance subject to following conditions:

- (i) No groundwater shall be extracted to meet with the water requirements during the construction and / or operation phase of the project.
- (ii) Beach clean programme shall be carried out periodically, however plantation should not be done near turtle nesting area.
- (iii) Onsite water flow monitoring mechanism shall be installed.
- (iv) The groundwater levels to be monitored on existing or proposed wells within 3 km radius of infiltration gallery in terms of ground water levels with reference to MSL, water quality including salinity immediately after commencement of infiltration wells to assess the impact of these wells on adjoin villages. Quarterly report should submit to RO of the Ministry for next two years.
- (v) No excavated material during the construction shall be dumped in water bodies or adjacent areas. The site shall be restored to its near original condition after completion of construction of work.
- (vi) Any physical infrastructure setup during construction period shall be removed simultaneously with completion of laying of each segment of the project.
- (vii) As per the provision of EMP appropriate cost should be provided for the restoration of habitat after the construction is over in consultation of Chief Wildlife Warden.
- (viii) All conditions/recommendations stipulated by the Odisha Coastal Zone Management Authority (OCZMA) has recommended the project vide its letter No. OCZMA/53/2020 39/OCZMA, dated 1st February, 2021, shall strictly be complied with.

3.3 Proposal for Installation of Crude Oil Terminal (COT) at Sandhakud Village Jagatsinghpur District, Odisha and crude oil pipeline from IOCL COT to NRL COT by M/s Numaligarh Refinery Limited- CRZ Clearance reg. [IA/OR/CRZ/197305/2021] [F.NO.11/4/2021-IAIII]

The proposal of M/s Numaligarh Refinery Limited is for Installation of Crude Oil Terminal (COT) at Sandhakud Village Jagatsinghpur District, Odisha and crude oil pipeline from IOCL COT to NRL COT. The project proponent made a presentation and provided the following information:

- (i) Numaligarh Refinery Limited (NRL) was set up as a developmental project under the “Assam Accord” signed in the year 1985. NRL is a central government Public sector undertaking and a subsidiary of Bharat Petroleum Corporation Ltd operates a 3.0 MMTPA refinery at Numaligarh in the district of Golaghat, Assam. Present share holding pattern of NRL is as follows: Bharat Petroleum Corporation Limited (BPCL) 61.65%, Oil India Limited (OIL) 26% and Govt. of Assam (GoA) 12.35%.
- (ii) The 3.0 MMTPA Refinery was commissioned in 2000 to process indigenous Assam crude. The present crude oil requirement is met from Assam crude supplied by Oil India Limited (OIL). Over The years, NRL has not been able to operate at 100% capacity due to inadequate availability of crude oil.
- (iii) Government of India has given approval in January, 2019 for capacity expansion of Numaligarh Refinery from 3.0 MMTPA to 9.0 MMTPA at an estimated project cost of ₹22594 Crore. The project is integrated with a 1630 km crude oil pipeline from Paradip (Odisha) to Numaligarh (Assam) and a product pipeline from Numaligarh to Siliguri where NRL has its own Marketing Terminal for distribution of product.

- (iv) Installation of Crude Oil Terminal (COT) at Sandhkuda Village and 4.5 Km Crude Oil Pipeline from nearby IOCL-COT at Paradip to proposed NRL-COT.
- (v) The proposed Crude oil storage tanks are 10 and each tank capacity is 60,000 KL each.
- (vi) The length of discharge pipeline from the COT area to shore will be of 800 m and from shore to the outfall point will be 400 m (Total 1200 m).
- (vii) The outfall discharge point will have multiport diffuser arrangement in order to obtain better dilution of effluent released into the sea.
- (viii) Depth of outfall point from surface of water will be 2 m.
- (ix) The proposed treated effluent pipeline will be routed through Casuarina plantation. Approximately, 30 nos. Casuarina trees will be cut for project.
- (x) Capacity of STP will be 11 KLD and the total 384 KLD Quantity of effluent generated/treated. The effluent will be treated in Effluent Treatment Plant and ETP treated effluent will be disposed off to sea suitably.
- (xi) During operational period, 40 KLD water is required for proposed COT project. The water will be made available by Paradip Port Trust (PPT) sourced from nearby Taldanda canal.
- (xii) Estimated energy requirement is 3MVA during Construction Phase & 10 MVA during Operation Phase which shall be sourced through TPCODCL (Tata Power Central Odisha Distribution Ltd).
- (xiii) The CRZ map of 1:4000 has been prepared by Indian Institute of Remote Sensing, Anna University, Chennai, as per approved CZMP and CRZ Notification 2011.
- (xiv) The employment potential of the project is 95(45 persons permanently employed during operational phase and 50 nos during construction phase).
- (xv) The total cost of the project is ₹1420 Cr.
- (xvi) Odisha Coastal Zone Management Authority (OCZMA) has recommended the project vide its letter No. OCZMA/54/2020/37/OCZMA, dated 01/02/2021.

2. The Committee noted that utmost care needs to be taken to avoid untoward incident / fire hazards while all statutory regulations by PESO are implemented in true spirit with adequate infrastructure to deal with any kind of disaster.

3. Based on the deliberations held and submissions made, the Committee recommended the proposal for CRZ clearance subject to following conditions:

- (i) No groundwater shall be extracted to meet with the water requirements during the construction and /or operation phase of the project.
- (ii) Construction camps (if any) shall be located outside the CRZ areas and any physical infrastructure setup during construction shall be removed with a month of completion of the project.
- (iii) 'Consent to Establish' and /or 'Consent to Operate' shall be obtained from State Pollution Control Board under the provisions of Air (Prevention and Control of Pollution) Act, 1981 and / or the Water (Prevention and Control of Pollution) Act, 1974, as may be applicable.
- (iv) Construction shall be strictly in accordance with the provisions of CRZ Notification, 2011 and as amended from time to time.
- (v) No permanent labour camp, machinery and material storage shall be allowed in CRZ area.

- (vi) Temporary toilets will be provided for all construction labour. Suitable toilet fixtures for water conservation shall be provided. Fixtures for showers, toilet flushing and drinking should be of low flow either by use of aerators or pressure reducing devices or sensor based control.
- (vii) All conditions/recommendations stipulated by the Odisha Coastal Zone Management Authority (OCZMA) has recommended the project vide its letter No. OCZMA/54/2020/37/OCZMA, dated 01/02/2021, shall strictly be complied with.

3.4 Proposal for widening and desilting the Adyar River from mouth to d/s of Thiru Vi Ka Bridge, Chainage om to 1963 m (42,600m to 40,637m) in Thiruvallur, Tamil Nadu, Chennai by Public Works Department -CRZ Clearance reg. [IA/TN/CRZ/199027/2021] [F.NO.11/5/2021-IAIII]

The proposal of M/s Public Works Department is for widening and desilting the Adyar River from mouth to d/s of Thiru Vi Ka Bridge, Chainage om to 1963m (42,600m to 40,637m) in Thiruvallur, Tamil Nadu, Chennai. The project proponent made a presentation and provided the following information:

- (i) Adyar river starts from adanur lake in Manimangalam village, Sriperumbudur Taluk at about 15 kilometers (9 m) from west of Tambaram near Chennai, flows through Kancheepuram, Tiruvallurand Chennai District for about 42.5 kilometers (26.4 mi) before joining the Bay of Bengal in Adyar, Chennai.
- (ii) The total area is 231.07 acres. Desilting will be carried over on 176.35 acres in Adyar River. The islands in the river covering an area of 54.72 acres is exempted from desilting.
- (iii) The project site falls in CRZ-IA (50m Buffer from Mangroves) (27077.92 sq.m.), CRZ-IB (2054.87 sq.m) and CRZ-IVB (684542.98 sq.m) area, as per the approved CZMP of Tamil Nadu. Total desilting area is 713675.77 sq.m.
- (iv) The proposed desilting activity project will be carried out in Adyar estuary water body and will not be executed in the mangroves area
- (v) The CRZ map of 1:4000 has been prepared by Indian Institute of Remote Sensing, Anna University, Chennai.
- (vi) Desilted material will be sent to corporation of Chennai approved dumping yards namely Kodungaiyur and OSR areas of GCC
- (vii) The need of the project is, to improve the water carrying and holding capacity of the Adyar river.
- (viii) Widening will be carried out using earth moving machineries for excavating the earth and will be conveyed by means of tippers for forming embankment wherever required for both sides of river for entire reach.
- (ix) The desilted material will be stored inside the river banks for a short period, without disturbing the mangroves.
- (x) A temporary road will be formed and will be used for transporting the desilted material from adyar river.
- (xi) This Desilting of the riverbed will remove silt and sand from the mouth to Thiru. Vi. Ka Bridge a total of 486100 m³ of silt that will be diverted to the Corporation dumpsites.
- (xii) Permission letter for disposing the desilted materials (1,90,458 m³) from Adyar river in the vacant OSR lands of GCC is obtained from GCC vide Ir.No.P.D.C.NO.

P2/1099/2020 and Ir.No.S.W.M.C.No. A8/1889/2020 for dumping of 2,43,050 m³ silt at Kodangaiyur Dumping ground.

- (xiii) The remaining silt of 52592 m³ will be used for bund strengthening along the river stretch.
- (xiv) The proposed activities will restore the silted watercourse that would improve the channel flow capacity of the river. Overall, the desiltation of Adyar River would improve the water storage capacity, soil texture and water holding capacity which would mark a greater significance to the people of Chennai.
- (xv) The employment potential of the project is 35 persons.
- (xvi) The total cost of the project is ₹21.6 Cr.
- (xvii) Tamil Nadu Coastal Zone Management Authority (TNCZMA) has recommended the project vide its letter No. 1216/EC.3/2021-1, dated 10/02/2021.

2. On perusal of the recommendation of CRZ clearance by the Tamil Nadu CZMA, the Committee observed that the project was recommended by the TNCZMA and accordance with CRZ Notification, 2011. During examination EAC noted that Adyar estuary is highly polluted due to sewage and domestic effluents while the baseline report mentioned DO levels very high, which is not correct. Other parameters such as COD, Coliform, PAC, metals, etc. are also reported below the detectable level based on the data was collected in January 2020. The authenticity of data has to be ascertained by an independent and nationally credible institute with compliance from TNPCB and submit. Further, the NIOT/NCCR study is also going on and it will take 6 months to be completed. The Committee observed that the observations made in the study report would be crucial and awaiting its findings, it may be not advisable to recommend the project for CRZ clearance at this stage. Accordingly, the proposal was deferred.

RECONSIDERATION

3.5 Amendment in CRZ Clearance for Coastal Road(South) from Princess Street Flyover to Worli end of Sea Link in Mumbai by M/s Municipal Corporation of Greater Mumbai(MCGM)-CRZ Clearance - reg.

[IA/MH/CRZ/194000/2021] [19-74/2016-IAIII]

Chairman Dr. Deepak Apte declared conflict of interest in the case and requested Dr. Hota to Chair the meeting and left the meeting for the specific agenda

The proposal by M/s Municipal Corporation of Greater Mumbai (MCGM) is for an amendment in CRZ Clearance accorded for the project 'Coastal Road (South) from Princess Street Flyover to Worli end of Sea Link in Mumbai'. The Ministry had accorded CRZ Clearance vide letter No.19-74/2016-IA.III, dated 11/05/2017.

2. The Municipal Corporation of Greater Mumbai presented that MCGM is seeking the amendment in the CRZ clearance dated 11th May 2017 granted by the MoEF&CC, New Delhi. The amended layout plan is submitted to show design and functional changes. As per earlier CRZ clearance, total reclamation area considered was about 90 Ha. Now, the MCGM has proposed total reclamation area of 111 Ha. out of which, 96.51 Ha. is a reclamation and remaining 14.49 Ha. is meant as sea wall toe for protection. The area of 14.49 Ha. was not factored earlier. Thus, the resultant increase in area of reclamation is 6.51 Ha. Total coverage is 111 Ha. and also intimated that from safety point of view reclamation of 0.2 Ha. which is part

of total 111 Ha. is absolutely necessary in lagoon area, which will establish connectivity to pedestrians from Priyadarshani park to promenade. It was also informed by the project proponent that this issue was mentioned in the Hon'ble Supreme Court in the matter of special leave to Appeal (C) Nos.17471-17476 of 2019 and other related SLPs and IAs. The summary of orders of the Hon'ble High Court and Hon'ble Supreme Court intimated by PP as:

Sr. No	Date	Particulars	Brief Proceedings & Order
1.	16/04/2019	Various petitions were grouped together before the Hon'ble High Court [BOMBAY HC]	Hon'ble Court granted an interim order restraining the MCGM / contractors from continuing the work
2.	06/05/2019	SLP (C) 10916/2019 (Arising out of impugned final judgement 86 order dated 16/04/2019 in PIL no.44/2019 passed by High Court at Bombay) filed by MCGM [SUPREME COURT]	The interim order of the Hon'ble High Court of 16/04/2019 was modified by the Hon'ble Supreme Court allowing MCGM / contractors to continue with the works which have already commenced . The said order was to remain in force till the High Court decided the matters.
3.	16/07/2019 (Judgement pronounced)	All the matters heard together i.e. WP (L) No.560, PIL (L) No.36,39,40, 44 & 25 [BOMBAY HC]	High Court up-held the Notification dated 30 th December 2015 amending CRZ-2011 CRZ Clearance of 11 th May, 2017 was set aside. E.C. required Wildlife Permission would be required
4.	26/07/2019	SLP (C) 17471-76/19 (Arising out of impugned final judgement & Order dated 16/07/2019 passed by the High Court at Bombay) [SUPREME COURT]	Permission to file the special leave petition is granted. Issue notice on the prayer for interim relief
5.	17/12/2019	SLP (C) 17471-76/19 [SUPREME COURT]	After hearing the learned counsel for both sides Hon'ble Supreme Court held that "We are of the considered view that the judgment of the High Court needs to be stayed having regard to the factor of balance of convenience; prima facie case and irreparable damage / injury.

			The petitioners are free to reclaim the land, build the road thereon and secure the road. They shall however not carry out any other development work until further orders of this Court.“
6.	09/06/2020	PIL-CJ-LD-VC-9 OF 2020 [BOMBAY HC]	Since issues were pending before the Hon'ble Supreme Court, PIL was not entertained and dismissed by the High Court & Interim Applications disposed off
7.	07/10/2020	Interim Applications were filed by the some of the PIL petitioners - seeking stay on the work / reclamation [SUPREME COURT]	Hon'ble Supreme Court allowed to carry out reclamation upto 90 Ha. The Court was informed that for area in excess of 90 Ha. an application was made and pending before the MCZMA, the said application is likely to be processed by the end of this month i.e. October, 2020 and an early decision is likely to be rendered by the respondent - Maharashtra Coastal Zone Management Authority (MCZMA). The Court directed that, representative of the original writ petitioners before the High Court shall be allowed to remain present and be heard by MCZMA before taking a decision. The Court further observed that no work in excess of 90 Ha should be carried out till amended CRZ Clearance is obtained
The Special Leave Petition filed by the MCGM against the judgment of the Hon'ble High Court of Bombay is pending before the Hon'ble Supreme Court. By way of the orders dated 17/12/2019 & 7/10/2020 referred above, the Hon'ble Supreme Court has permitted the MCGM to reclaim the land up to 90 hectares, construct and secure the road, and if any additional reclamation is required, to only carry out such work after obtaining said requisite Clearance from the authority.			

3. The Committee noted the chronology of events submitted by the PP. Based on the deliberation held the Committee desired that the project proponent, as explained to the Committee, shall submit a self-contained information / note on request on reclamation and other

issues placed before the Hon'ble Supreme Court and details of action plan for reclaimed surfaces shall be explored for promotion / growth of the marine biodiversity / intertidal habitats mangrove replantation, coral translocation including other ecological implications arising due to implementation of the project for record.. The Committee further decided that information shall be provided in a tabular format on activities planned in the CRZ area (item wise) and details of amendment desired alongwith justification for the record of the MoEFCC.

4. The Committee after detailed deliberations and submissions made by the PP recommended for granting the CRZ clearance with the following conditions:

- i. All the conditions stipulated by the State CZMA be adhered to and implemented.
- ii. The PP shall intimate the Hon'ble Supreme Court and Hon'ble High Court with regard to the revised CRZ clearance and necessary approval as may deemed fit.
- iii. Construction and reclamation activities shall be strictly in accordance with the provisions of CRZ Notification, 2011 and as amended from time to time.
- iv. Conservation of corals shall be done as per the biodiversity management plan prepared.
- v. Reclaimed surfaces shall be monitored for the growth of the marine life / intertidal habitats and explore establishment of Artificial Reefs to promote the marine biodiversity with consultation of Mangrove Foundation of Maharashtra through the 2% CER funds provided by MCGM to Mangrove Foundation.
- vi. The shoreline of entire project site and sea levels atleast four locations along the coastal road to be monitored annually using automated gauges.

3.6 Proposal for Expansion of Hotel & Resort at Baad & Gudeangadi Village, Karwar District, Karnataka by M/s DRN Hospitalities Pvt. Ltd.- CRZ Clearance - reg.
[IA/KA/CRZ/182366/2020] [F.No. 11-50/2020-IA III]

The proposal of M/s DRN Hospitalities Pvt. Ltd. is for expansion of Hotel & Resort at Baad & Gudeangadi Village, Karwar District, Karnataka. It was earlier discussed in the 248th Meeting of the EAC (CRZ) held on 25/11/2020. Based on the deliberations held, the Committee observed that the issue of addressing the procedural lapse and other concerned issues may be decided in accordance with the policy decisions on violation guidelines.

The PP has submitted the Damage Assessment Plan and Remediation Plan and project placed before the EAC for its consideration. The EAC discussed Damage Assessment Plan and Remediation Plan and noted that the plans are not submitted with the specific recommendation of SCZM and in line of O.M dated 19/02/2021 "Procedure for dealing with violations arising due to not obtaining a prior CRZ clearance for permissible activities" issued by MoEFCC. Accordingly, the proposal was deferred.

3.7 Proposal for Construction of residential houses at Plot No.52, Sector 17, Kalamboli, Roadpali, Navi Mumbai, Maharashtra by M/s Pruthvi Builders & Developers- CRZ Clearance - reg.
[IA/MH/CRZ/119934/2019] [F.No 11-51/2020-IA III]

The proposal of M/s Pruthvi Builders & Developers is for Construction of residential houses at Plot No.52, Sector 17, Kalamboli, Roadpali, Navi Mumbai, Maharashtra was earlier

placed in the 250th Meeting of the EAC (CRZ) held on 15/12/2020. Based on the deliberations held, the Committee observed that the issue of addressing the procedural lapse and other concerned issues may be decided in accordance with the policy decisions on violation guidelines.

The PP has submitted the Damage Assessment Plan and Remediation Plan and project placed before the EAC for its consideration. The EAC discussed Damage Assessment Plan and Remediation Plan and noted that the plans are not submitted with the specific recommendation of SCZMA and in line of O.M dated 19/02/2021 “Procedure for dealing with violations arising due to not obtaining a prior CRZ clearance for permissible activities” issued by MoEFCC. Accordingly, the proposal was deferred.

4.0 Any other item with the permission of the Chair.

There being no agenda item left, the meeting ended with a vote of thanks to the Chair.
