

MINUTES OF THE 340th MEETING OF EXPERT APPRAISAL COMMITTEE FOR PROJECTS RELATED TO COASTAL REGULATION ZONE HELD ON 26/09/2023.

The 340th meeting of the Expert Appraisal Committee (EAC) for projects related to Coastal Regulation Zone was held on 26/09/2023 at IBP, MoEF&CC, New Delhi through Video Conferencing. The list of Members presents in the EAC (CRZ) is at **Annexure**.

The deliberations held and the decisions taken are as under:

1.0 OPENING REMARKS OF THE CHAIRMAN

At the outset, Dr. Deepak Arun Apte, Chairman, EAC (CRZ) welcomed the Members of the EAC and requested Dr. H. Kharkwal, the Member Secretary, EAC to initiate the proceedings of the meeting with a brief account of the activities undertaken by the Ministry under CRZ Division.

2.0 CONFIRMATION OF THE MINUTES OF THE LAST MEETING

The Committee having noted that the Minutes of the 339th meeting held on 05/09/2023 are in order and confirmed the same with suggestions that in case any typographical/grammatical errors are noticed in due course, the same may be corrected suitably.

3.0 CONSIDERATION OF PROPOSALS:

The EAC (CRZ) considered proposals as per the agenda adopted for the 340th meeting. The details of deliberations held and decisions taken in the meeting are as follows:

AGENDA 3.1: RECONSIDERATION OF PROPOSALS:

Proposal for Establishment of a new Lighthouse Tower and allied buildings at Chaumukh (Narayanpur Village), Baliapal, District-Balasore by Directorate General of Lighthouse and Lightship, Ministry of Port, Shipping and Waterways –Reconsideration for CRZ Clearance (IA/OR/CRZ/413840/2023; F.NO.11/10/2023-IA.III)

“The EAC noted that the Project Proponent has given undertaking that the data and information given in the application and enclosures are true to the best of his knowledge and belief and no information has been suppressed in the EIA/EMP report. If any part of the data/information submitted is found to be false / misleading at any stage, the project will be rejected and Environmental and or CRZ Clearance given, if any, will be revoked at the risk and cost of the project proponent.”

The proposal was earlier examined by EAC in its 320th meeting held on 07/02/2023 and 331st meeting held on 21/06/2023; wherein the Project Proponent (**M/s Directorate of Light Houses and Lightships, Kolkata**) along with his EIA consultant made a presentation on above said proposal. The EAC

took note of following key parameters and salient features of the project as presented during the meeting as well as the details provided in the brief and application for this project:

- (i) The proposal is for Establishment of a new Lighthouse Tower and allied buildings at Chaumukh (Narayanpur Village), Baliapal, District-Balasore by Directorate General of Lighthouse and Lightship, Ministry of Port, Shipping and Waterways to provide visual navigational aids for the safety of the Mariners and local fisherman of the area.
- (ii) The development proposed over plot no. 3531/3543 and Khata No.735. The kissam of the land is Gharabari. The total area is 1.10 ac. Construction involves setting up of a new lighthouse tower of 113 Sq. m of base area with 12.0 m circle and 45m height, staff buildings, internal road, pathways, water supply and sanitary arrangements and a compound wall which are required for the operation of light house.
- (iii) The proposed lighthouse project site as reported by IRS, Anna University Chennai under various CRZ are as:

Sl. No.	Description	CRZ-Classification	Area in Sq. m	Total area in Sq. m
1.	Proposed Project Site Boundary	CRZ-III (NDZ)	1321.44	4000.00
		CRZ-IVB	2678.56	
2.	Proposed Road	CRZ-III (NDZ)	152.57	375.00
		CRZ-IVB	222.43	
Total			4375.00	4375.00

- (iv) The fishermen community, within a radius of 18 nautical miles, will be benefited by establishment of Lighthouse at Narayanpur Village also be of economic boost for the local people who are involved in the fishing and marine activities.
- (v) The estimated cost of project is ₹9.0 Crores.
- (vi) The Odisha Coastal Zone Management Authority has recommended the proposal for CRZ clearance *vide* its Letter No. OCZMA/25/2022/149/OCZMA dated 06/09/2022 and Letter No. 175/OCZMA, dated 07/09/2023 as the activities are permissible *vide* Para 5.3 CRZ-III (i) of the CRZ Notification 2019.

2. After detailed deliberation, the Committee in its 320th meeting held on 07/02/2023 deferred the proposal and noted that the proposed project area falls in CRZ-III (NDZ) and CRZ IVB creek area. However, as per submitted map of 1:4000 scale prepared by IRS, Anna University Chennai, the project location falls in water body i.e. CRZ-IVB creek. Thus revised maps were sought showing correct geographical location of the lighthouse site with CRZ classification and resubmit to the Ministry for reconsideration in next meeting.

3. Accordingly, proponent has submitted the followings through PRIVIESH portal and the same is deliberated by EAC in its 331st meeting held on 21/06/2023.

- (i) As per the advice of EAC, the observation was taken up with IRS-Chennai, Anna University who have prepared the CRZ map and report for the project.

- (ii) IRS-Chennai submitted their report stating that there was no water stagnation in the area and as per approved CZMP map, LTL line is in the seaward side of proposed project boundary and goes parallel to the Coast. But as per approved CZMP of CRZ Notification 2019, it is indicated as CRZ IVB.
- (iii) As per CRZ notification 2019, CRZ-IVB areas shall include the water area and the bed area between LTL at the bank of the tidal influenced water body to the LTL on the opposite side of the bank, extending from the mouth of the water body at the sea up to the influence of tide, i.e., salinity of five parts per thousand (ppt) during the driest season of the year. But in this case, the CRZ-IVB category is towards landward side of LTL.
- (iv) The geographical location of Lighthouse mentioned on CRZ map is shown as per DGPS survey of IRS-Chennai.

4. After detailed deliberation, the Committee in its 331st meeting has noted that as per the CRZ 1:4000 scale map submitted, the project location fall in water body i.e., CRZ-IVB creek. Since, the proposed activity is not permissible in water areas, the Committee informed the Project Proponent to revise the project location which is permissible as per notification. Project Proponent agreed to revise the project sites as opined by EAC. The Committee also noted the PP not taking any serious efforts in addressing essential clarifications sought by the Ministry and project is getting delayed. Hence, suggested attention from higher authority of PP side to submit the proposal as per notification. Accordingly, the Committee deferred the proposal.

5. In view of above, proponent has submitted revised project location as suggested by the EAC through PRIVIESH portal and the same has been deliberated by EAC in the present meeting.

6. After deliberation, the Committee has noted that as per the revised project location, proposed project activities are fall within the CRZ-III area and same also recommended by OCZMA *vide* Letter No. 175/OCZMA, dated 07/09/2023 that the activities are permissible as per CRZ Notification, 2019. However, as project location includes CRZ-IVB area also that Committee has noted that no activity will be undertaken in CRZ IVB area and all the project activity should be restricted to CRZ-III area as undertaking submitted by PP *vide* letter dated 26/09/2023. Accordingly, the Committee recommended the proposal for CRZ Clearance subject to following specific conditions in addition to standard conditions:

- (i) All construction shall be strictly in accordance with the provisions of the CRZ Notification, 2019, as amended from time to time.
- (ii) As undertaking submitted *vide* latter dated 26/09/2023 that no activity will be undertaken in CRZ IVB area and all the project activity should be restricted to CRZ-III area.
- (iii) Any temporary physical infrastructure setup and excavated material during construction shall not be dumped in water bodies or adjacent areas and the site shall be restored to its original condition after completion of construction of work.

- (iv) No storage reservoir for sea water shall be permitted.
- (v) No groundwater shall be extracted within the CRZ area to meet the water requirements during the construction and /or operation phase of the project.
- (vi) Permanent labour camp, machinery and material storage shall not be set up in the CRZ area.
- (vii) There will be no construction activity during the turtle nesting season, if any from 1st January to 30th April of every year.
- (viii) All the conditions stipulated by the Odisha Coastal Zone Management Authority for CRZ clearance under CRZ Notification, 2019 *vide* its letter no OCZMA/25/2022/149/OCZMA dated 06/09/2022 and Letter No. 175/OCZMA, dated 07/09/2023 and commitments made by the PP before the OCZMA and EAC shall be followed in letter and spirit.
- (ix) All necessary clearance from the concerned authority, as may be applicable should be obtained prior to commencement of project or activity.

AGENDA 3.2

Proposal for four laning of Honnavara Port Connectivity road from 0 km to 2.58 km connecting Honnavara Port with NH-66 at km 195.986 and improved NH-66 from 195 km to 197 km to integrate port connectivity on EPC Mode under Bharatmala Phase-1 in Kasarakoda Village of Honnavar Taluk of Uttara Kannada District by Assistant Executive Engineer, Port Sub-Division, Honnavara, Karnataka – Reconsideration for CRZ Clearance (IA/KA/CRZ/404527/2022; F. NO.11/22/2023-IA.III)

“The EAC noted that the Project Proponent has given undertaking that the data and information given in the application and enclosures are true to the best of his knowledge and belief and no information has been suppressed in the EIA/EMP report. If any part of the data/information submitted is found to be false /misleading at any stage, the project will be rejected and Environmental and or CRZ Clearance given, if any, will be revoked at the risk and cost of the project proponent.”

The proposal was earlier considered by EAC in its 335th meeting the held on 07/08/2023 and 339th meeting held on 05/09/2023; wherein the Project Proponent (**M/s Ports and Inland Water Transport, Baithkol, Karwar**) along with his EIA consultant (**M/s Mantras Green Resources Ltd**) made a presentation on above said proposal. The EAC took note of following key parameters and salient features of the project as presented during the meeting as well as the details provided in the brief and application for this project:

- (i) The proposal is for four Laning of Honnavar Port connectivity road from km 0.00 (Kasarkod side of Honnavar port) to km 2.580 (towards NH – 66) connecting Honnavar Port with NH - 66 at km 195.986 and to improve NH – 66 from km 195.00 to km 197.00 to integrate port connectivity on EPC Mode under Bharatmala Phase-I.

- (ii) The total project area is 14.9 ha at Honnavar Port, Kasarkod village, Honnavar Taluk, Uttar Kannada District.
- (iii) The proposed four lane port road connectivity, Kachha road connectivity, Kachha road (service road for 4 lane), and associated infrastructure falls under coastal regulation zone area such as CRZ IA, CRZ IB, NDZ and CRZ III. Area break-up details as follows:

Sl. No	Proposed project activities	Areas in hectare				
		CRZ IA	CRZ-IB	NDZ	Within the port Limit	CRZ-IIIB
1.	Four lane NHAI road Connectivity	6.16	2.96	1.44	5.09	2.53
2.	Underpass	-	0.03	0.05	0.08	-
3.	Culvert Bridge	0.31	-	-	0.07	
4.	Kachha Road (Service Road for NHAI)	-	0.06	2.01	2.07	-

- (iv) The proposed road (4.58 km) has 4 sections:
- km 0.000 (Port Boundary) to km 0.400 (20.6 m width) -
 - km 0.400 to km 2.100 (4 lane road with service road, 30.8 m width)
 - km 2.100 to km 2.580 (NH 66 Side) (20.6 m width)
 - Improvement in NH 66 (km 195.00 to km 197.00) for flyover addition
- (v) The 4-lane road (km 0.400-2.100 stretch) has a width of 30.8 m, including 5 m for service road and 3.2 m for drainage and shoulders.
- (vi) The proposed 4 lane road from NH 66 passes through 0.76 ha of forest land (km 2.100 to km 2.580) for which Forest Clearance has been obtained from MoEF&CC.
- (vii) Total water requirement of the project is 37.05 (m³/day).
- (viii) Total power requirement of the project is 220V.
- (ix) A total of 250 individuals will get employment by the project.
- (x) Total cost of the project is ₹138.12 Crores. Budget proposed for implementation of EMP is ₹191.396 Lakhs.
- (xi) Ecological sensitive areas like mangroves, sand dunes and turtle nesting ground are present in the vicinity of project site.
- (xii) A total of 527 trees are estimated to be removed due this project and the same will be compensated through the proposed plantation programme.
- (xiii) The solid waste generated from the proposed project will be of non-hazardous in nature consisting of biodegradable and non-biodegradable wastes. The domestic solid wastes will be segregated into organic and inorganic wastes at the source itself in which organic waste will be treated in organic convertor and inorganic wastes will be given to the recyclers.
- (xiv) Benefits of the project: This Road project will be beneficial for development of Port and also to the local people Employment Generation to local inhabitants -Skilled and Unskilled; Socio-economic development of the region; Provide an impetus to industrial activities in the hinterland.
- (xv) The Karnataka State Coastal Zone Management Authority (KSCZMA) has recommended the proposal for CRZ clearance under para 4(ii)(f) of CRZ Notification, 2011 *vide* its Letter No. FEE 78 CRZ 2023 dated 24/03/2023.

2. The EAC has deliberated on the proposal and noted that the project activity is permissible under CRZ Notification, 2011 and recommended by KSCZMA *vide* letter dated 24/03/2023 under para 4(ii)(f) of CRZ Notification, 2011. Further, Committee has noted that the project site includes sand dune areas and major portion of the road fall along the HTL on sandy beach. However, proponent has not submitted detailed Marine Conservation Plan and not provided proper justification for the need of this road on seaward side rather than the landward side of existing village road.

3. After detailed deliberation, Committee in its 335th meeting the held on 07/08/2023 deferred the proposal and asked the project proponent to submit the followings information for further consideration in forthcoming meeting:

- Detailed Marine Conservation Plan
- Details of alternate road alignment considered and their SWOT analysis

4. Furthermore, the Committee recommended the site inspection by Sub-Committee of EAC to under the factual status of the project.

5. Accordingly, with approval of Competent Authority in the Ministry site inspection has been held on 18/08/2023. The site inspection report briefed by Sub-Committee and also place before the EAC for comments from other Members in its 339th meeting held on 05/09/2023. After deliberation, the EAC requested more time to provide their comments. Accordingly, the Committee decided to deliberate the matter in forthcoming EAC meeting.

6. In view of above, the proposal has been deliberated by EAC in the present meeting. However, Project Proponent has intimated during the presentation that the road alignment has been shifted within port limit area from CRZ-1A to CRZ-III and road project is now integrated part of Port given clearance on 21/09/2012 by SEIAA Karnataka and desired amendment in combined EC+CRZ clearance from SEIAA. The PP accepted the same and EAC returned the project to KCZMA /PP.

AGENDA 3.3

Proposal for Underground laying of Natural Gas Transportation Pipeline Passing through Uppanar River approximately a length of 0.255 kms out of the total length of 29.197 km from Palayapalayam village, Sirkali Taluk to Memathur Village Tharangambadi Taluk, Nagapattinum District by M/s GAIL (India) Ltd, Karaikkal, Tamil Nadu- CRZ Clearance (IA/TN/CRZ/269326/2022; F. No. 11/19/2022-IA.III)

“The EAC noted that the Project Proponent has given undertaking that the data and information given in the application and enclosures are true to the best of his knowledge and belief and no information has been suppressed in the EIA/EMP report. If any part of the data/information submitted is found to be false /misleading at any stage, the project will be

rejected and Environmental and or CRZ Clearance given, if any, will be revoked at the risk and cost of the project proponent.”

The proposal was earlier considered by EAC in its 299th meeting held on 14/06/2022 and 334th meeting held on 31/07/2023. The Committee in its 299th meeting has noted that the proposal is a case of violation and project proponent did not disclose this proposal is for already constructed prior CRZ Clearance 2011.

2. The Committee also observed that the issue of addressing such procedural lapse and other concerned issues may be decided in accordance with the MoEFCC O.M dated 19/02/2021 which states that “Procedure for dealing with violations arising due to not obtaining a prior CRZ clearance for permissible activities”. Further, the Committee has noted that the said OM is under Sub-judice and has been stayed by Hon’ble High Court of Bombay in the PIL (L) No. 8540 of 2021 by which Ministry is restrained from granting a permission / clearance on the basis of the office memorandum under challenge till August 31, 2021 or until further orders, whichever is earlier. Also, the Hon’ble Court directed that if an application for permission is received hereafter, the receiving authority shall bring the fact of pendency of this PIL petition and the interim order passed thereon to the notice of the applicant. Accordingly the proposal has been deferred by the Committee in its 299th meeting.

3. Thereafter, the proposal was placed before the EAC (CRZ) in its 334th meeting held on 31/07/2023 for re-consideration as per direction of the Hon’ble Supreme Court *vide* order dated 25/07/2023, wherein directed as:

“...we find that at this stage a direction ought to be issued to the third respondent to consider the application made by the appellant for grant of clearance for the pipeline already laid by the appellant herein, more particularly, with regard to 255 meters which is stated to be in the CRZ zone out of a total 29 kms. The said consideration of the application shall be made within a period of two weeks from today. In the circumstances, list this matter after two weeks.”

4. Accordingly, the project proponent made a detailed presentation on salient features of the project and informed that during cleaning of pipeline by compressed air as a part of construction stage, the air released out with dust & sound due to presence of mud, heavy dust inside the pipe on 22/07/2020 without damage to any person/property/environment. This event/incident was reported in Dinamalar Tamil news paper as “panic due to natural gas released...” Subsequently, Suo-Motu case was registered by Hon’ble NGT on the basis of newspaper report.

5. With reference to above said case in Hon’ ble NGT, TNPCB has submitted its factual report mentioning that the pipeline was under establishment and no natural gas was carried in the pipeline. Only venting of air was carried out under GAIL supervision. Further, TNPCB submitted to the Hon’ble NGT that GAIL to obtain necessary clearance from authority and to stop the pipeline laying activity.

6. The said Suo-Motu case was disposed of vide order dated 05/08/2022 with direction to GAIL/TNPCB to initiate proceedings as per notice issued to GAIL by giving applicable opportunity to GAIL

7. Since the proposal has already been recommended by the District Coastal Zone Management Authority vide letter dated 18/07/2019 and Tamil Nadu State Coastal Zone Management Authority vide letter dated 21/03/2022, the proponent filled appeal Civil Appeal No. 18853/2023 in Hon'ble Supreme Court.

8. The matter was listed for hearing on 25/07/2023; wherein Hon'ble Supreme court vide order dated 25/07/2023 has issued direction to consider the application made by the appellant for grant of clearance.

9. The EAC took note of following key parameters and salient features of the project as presented during the meeting as well as the details provided in the brief and application for this project:

- (i) The name of the project is Madanam-Memathur Natural Gas Pipeline (MMPL)
- (ii) Total length of the pipeline is 29.197 km.
- (iii) Diameter & thickness of the pipeline is 24" & API5L Gr 70, Th 10.3 mm
- (iv) Pipeline capacity is 0.85 MMSCMD
- (v) The method of laying pipeline is under-ground (min 1.2 mtr) pipeline and HDD crossings. No storage.
- (vi) Total cost of the project is ₹114 Crores
- (vii) Pipeline Laying and terminal work has been completed and Pipeline system is ready for operation
- (viii) The proposal has already been recommended by the District Coastal Zone Management Authority vide letter dated 18/07/2019 and Tamil Nadu State Coastal Zone Management Authority vide letter dated 21/03/2022. But CRZ Clearance from Ministry is not yet received.
- (ix) Detailed chronology of the proposal is as follows:

Sr. No	Date/ Month of Event	Description of Event
1	08/02/2017	MoPNG advised GAIL to work out requisite infrastructure considering the peak availability of 0.66 MMSCMD and take necessary approvals from PNGRB and other concerned authorities.
2	24/10/2017	GAIL had requested Department of Town and Country Planning (DTCP) regarding CRZ confirmation along pipeline route.
3	01/12/2017	DTCP has confirmed vide his letter dated 01.12.2017 that as per MoEF map 1996, the pipeline route survey numbers are falling out of CRZ
4	21/12/2017	PNGRB Authorized GAIL to lay the pipeline

5	18/08/2018	Pipeline laying / construction contract awarded
6	14/11/2018	The application for CTE was submitted by GAIL on 14.11.2018 to TNPCB and same was returned in view of applicability of CRZ Regulation 2011.
7	12/04/2019	Subsequently, on various communication with DTCP and TNPCB, GAIL has been informed by DTCP that 255 meter of pipeline is falling under CRZ as per CRZ Regulation 2011.
8	08/05/2019	GAIL has applied for CRZ clearance vide dated 08.05.2019 to District Level Coastal Zone Management Authority (DCZMA).
9	18/07/2019	After site review / committee meeting, DCZMA has forwarded the project recommendations to the State Level Coastal Zone Management Authority (SCZMA) subject to the fulfilment of certain conditions.
10		Meanwhile GAIL awarded the contract and started the construction activities.
11	11/10/2019	SCZMA asked GAIL to submit further details and revised HTL (High Tide Line) demarcation map superimposing GAIL's project and scrutiny fee of Rs.5.0 Lakhs.
12	18/11/2019	GAIL submitted the requisite fees and documents.
13	29/11/2019	SCZMA intimated GAIL to submit the demarcation map prepared by authorized institute (NCSCM) approved by Government of India.
14	15/04/2020	GAIL had placed work order to NCSCM. However, due to Covid-19 pandemic, NCSCM were unable to make field investigation and submission of map delayed. Finally, GAIL has submitted the desired demarcation map to SCZMA on 28.01.2021.
15		Construction activities were continued considering the flaring of gas from Madanam, continuous follow up with CRZ / TNPCB, availability of other permissions/ clearances.
16	May 2020 – Mar 2022	Parallel Follow ups were continued with SCZMA for CRZ clearance. Presentation / review by TNSCZMA committee on 08.10.2021 at Chennai.
17	06/04/2022	SCZMA intimated vide letter No. R.C. No. P1/2024/2019 dated 06.04.2022 that the application has been recommended and forwarded to National Level Coastal Zone Management Authority (NCZMA), New Delhi for CRZ Clearance on 21.03.2022
18	14/06/2022	As per Minutes of 299 th meeting of Expert Appraisal Committee (CRZ- NCZMA @ Delhi) held on 14.06.2022, and GAIL's proposal for CRZ Clearance was deferred considering post-facto case and related MOEF OM dated 19.02.2021 is sub-judice.
19	Till date	GAIL requested at numerous times to Chairperson-TNPCB, Secretary –MoEF&CC, Addl. Chief Secretary- MoEF&CC at Chennai and Delhi for considering the CRZ clearance.
20	22/07/2020	During cleaning of pipeline by compressed air as a part of construction stage, the air released out with dust & sound due to presence of mud, heavy dust inside the pipe on 22.07.2020 without damage to any person/property / environment.

21	23/07/2020	This event / incident was reported in Dinamalar Tamil news paper as “panic due to natural gas released...” Subsequently, Suo-Motu case was registered by NGT on the basis of newspaper report.
22	20/08/2020	TNPCB has submitted its factual report mentioning that the pipeline was under establishment and no natural gas was carried in the pipeline. Only venting of air was carried out under GAIL supervision. Further, TNPCB submitted to the Hon’ble NGT that GAIL to obtain necessary clearance from authority and to stop the pipeline laying activity.
23	05/08/2022	The Suo-Motu case was disposed with direction to GAIL / TNPCB to initiate proceedings as per notice issued to GAIL by giving applicable opportunity to GAIL.
24		GAIL has taken up with TNPCB, TNCZMA, NCZMA, MoEF&CC and other state level secretaries for consideration of clearances.
25		Considering the facts that <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • the national resource of Natural gas wastage due to flaring from Madanam field for more than 3 years • Environment damage due to the continues flaring • Pipeline system safety & integrity • Gas demand from power and CGD sectors • Revenue loss in the tune of Rs. 8.0 Crs per month • No impact / damage due to underground laid pipeline to the environment
26	May 2023	GAIL approached Supreme Court to consider GAIL’s request
27	25/07/2023	SC has given direction to CRZ-NCZMA to consider the clearance.
		In view of above facts GAIL humbly request NCZMA to consider CRZ clearance to our MMPL project.

10. After detailed deliberation, the Committee has noted that project activity is permissible as per CRZ Notification 2011. However, the project proponent has already completed the pipeline laying in CRZ area of 255m without prior CRZ Clearance from the Ministry. So this is the case of violation of CRZ Notification 2011 and can be appraised as per Ministry’s OM dated 19/02/2021, prescribes the "Procedure for dealing with violations arising due to not obtaining a prior CRZ Clearance for permissible activities”.

11. The Committee has also noted that the said OM is Sub-judice and has been stayed by Hon'ble High Court of Madras (WP (MD)-8866/2021 and High Court of Bombay PIL (L) No. 8540 of 2021. Since, the Ministry is restrained from granting a permission/clearance on the basis of the Office Memorandum dated 19/02/2021 under challenge till further orders. The Committee thus requested Ministry to provide further guidance considering that the Hon'ble Supreme Court has directed to consider the proposal under dealing with violations arising due to not obtaining a prior CRZ clearance for permissible activities.

12. In the mean time the Ministry has filed SLP (C) No.33840 of 2023 before the Hon’ble SC challenging the stay of Hon'ble Madras High Court and SLP (C)

No.33838 of 2023 challenging the stay by Hon'ble Bombay High Court w.r.t. Ministry's OM dated 19/02/2021.

13. The Hon'ble Supreme Court has heard the SLP (C) No.33840 of 2023 and directed *vide* order dated 04/09/2023 for the interim stay of the impugned stay order by Hon'ble High Court of Madras.

14. That, *vide* order dated 06/09/2023 the Hon'ble Supreme Court filed against impugned stay of Hon'ble High Court of Bombay, in SLP (C) No.33838 of 2023 has decided to hear the petition on merits and issued notice to the respondents returnable on 25/09/2023. However, the matter is still pending to be heard on merits before Hon'ble Supreme Court.

15. Thereafter, Hon'ble Supreme Court *vide* order dated 05/09/2023 has directed that the application filed by the Petitioner (M/s GAIL India Ltd.) could be reconsidered by the Authority concerned and steps would be taken for seeking a reconsideration of the application in view of the interim order dated 04/09/2023 by the Hon'ble Court in SLP (C) No.33840 of 2023. The order dated 05/09/2023 is reproduced as under:

“Learned Solicitor General appearing for the petitioner has brought to our attention order dated 04.09.2023 passed by a coordinate Bench of this Court staying the impugned order passed by the Madras High Court. Consequently, the application filed by the petitioner herein could be reconsidered by the authority concerned. That steps would be taken for seeking a reconsideration of the application in view of the interim order dated 04.09.2023 by this Court in SLP (C) No.33840 of 2023.”

16. Accordingly, the proposal has been examined by EAC (CRZ) in the present meeting. After detailed deliberation, the Committee suggested the proponent to submit the environmental or ecological damage assessed, Compensatory Conservation Plan (CCP) and Community Resource Augmentation Plan (CRAP) with the recommendation of TNSCZMA as per OM dated 19/02/2021. Accordingly, the Committee deferred the proposal for want of essential documents required as per as per OM dated 19/02/2021 issued under CRZ Notification.

AGENDA 3.4

Proposal for Construction of Coastal Road from Amra Marg to MTHL junction including the Airport Link at Navi Mumbai by M/s City And Industrial Development Corporation Of Maharashtra Ltd (CIDCO)-CRZ Clearance. (IA/MH/CRZ/441829/2023; F.No.11/37/2023-IA.III)

“The EAC noted that the Project Proponent has given undertaking that the data and information given in the application and enclosures are true to the best of his knowledge and belief and no information has been

suppressed in the EIA/EMP report. If any part of the data/information submitted is found to be false /misleading at any stage, the project will be rejected and Environmental and or CRZ Clearance given, if any, will be revoked at the risk and cost of the project proponent.”

The Project Proponent (M/s CIDCO) along with his EIA consultant (M/s Aditya Environmental Services Pvt. Ltd.) made a presentation on above said proposal. The EAC took note of following key parameters and salient features of the project as presented during the meeting as well as the details provided in the brief and application for this project:

- (i) The proposal is for seeking CRZ Clearance under CRZ Notification, 2011 for the Construction of Coastal Road from Amra Marg to MTHL junction including the Airport Link at Navi Mumbai by M/s City And Industrial Development Corporation Of Maharashtra Ltd.
- (ii) The Collector of Raigad has issued the FRA Certificate dated 16/05/2023 w.r.t. FRA Act 2006
- (iii) Earlier the project was granted CRZ Clearance by SEIAA *vide* letter dated 09/08/2019. However, when the PP approached the Mumbai High Court for the Cutting of mangroves, the Hon'ble High Court *vide* order dated 25/04/2023 directed CIDCO to seek fresh Clearance from MCZMA/SEIAA.
- (iv) Accordingly, CIDCO submitted a fresh application to MCZMA on 10/07/2023, and the same has been considered by MCZMA in its 168th meeting held on 10/08/2023 and recommended to Ministry *vide* letter dated 23/08/2023.
- (v) As per para 4(i) (g) of the CRZ amendment Notification dated 30/12/2015 to the original CRZ Notification, 2011, the proposal requires clearance from MoEF&CC, Delhi.
- (vi) CRZ Maps and CRZ report has been prepared by IRS, Anna University Chennai.
- (vii) The proposed road alignment falls within CRZ IA (Mangroves and its 50 m buffer zone area), CRZ IB (intertidal area), CRZ II and CRZ IV (B) area (Moha creek).
- (viii) The proposed Ulwe Coastal Road (UCR) starts from Amra Marg to junction of MTHL including airport link. It is a part of the approved Navi-Mumbai Development Plan. The entire alignment is about 7 Km (5.8 Km main alignment + 1.2 Km Airport link) and lies in Panvel taluka of Raigad district of Maharashtra state. CRZ Area Classification of Coastal Road is given in the table below:

Category	Area (Sq. m)
CRZ IA (Mangrove)	95499.12
CRZ IA (50 m Mangrove Buffer Zone)	153042.89
CRZ IB	60750.98
CRZ II	70969.31
CRZ IVB	6657.88
Total CRZ Area	386920.19
Non-CRZ	33079.81
Total Area of Alignment	420000

- (ix) Construction of the proposed Ulwe Coastal Road will lead to generation of about 20,000 m³ excavated material, which will be used for onsite filling/levelling etc. Filling material required about 7,92,722 m³ sourced from government approved quarries located at Pale Budruk, and Kundevahal. To maintain free flow of water cross drainage structures are proposed within alignment. Details of Cross Drainage Structures are given in the table below:

Sl. No.	Structure	Number
1.	Box Culvert/ Cross Drainage	06
2.	Flyover	03
3.	Minor Bridge	01
4.	Major Bridge	01
5.	Viaduct (Airport Link Road)	01
6.	VUP	03

- (x) Estimated cost of project is ₹681.63 Cr. EMP budget allocated for the proposed coastal road is ₹963 Lakhs; recurring cost is ₹58 lakhs/annum.
- (xi) Total 3728 numbers of mangroves are required to be cut or under direct impact. For which Stage-I Forest Clearance and FRA Certificate (dated 16/05/2023) has already been obtained.
- (xii) Further w.r.t diversion of 32.6921 ha. of Reserve Forest land, Stage-I Forest clearance *vide* letter dated 19/10/2022 has been attained and in this regard's identification of compensatory land at Village Nhave, Tal Panvel, Dist Raigad has been identified and handed over to Forest Department. In lieu of this compensatory mangrove plantation; plantation of suitable native species will be planted at degraded forest land in compartment 343 at Village Shevare Khurd, Tal Parola, District Jalgaon.
- (xiii) The project location does not fall in ESA and thus not required prior NBWL Clearance.
- (xiv) Total area of damage will be 6.57 ha. out of which 1.00 ha. due to construction of a 7m wide temporary road for construction purpose, which will be restored to near original state after completion of work in-situ and 5.57 ha. will get permanently damaged by construction of piers. Owing to loss of trees and mangroves, corresponding nesting/perching sites of birds in the area will be lost.
- (xv) Employment: Manpower requirement during construction phase is 100 numbers. There will be indirect manpower requirement by way of services, suppliers etc. Total implementation time/construction phase post obtaining all prerequisite permissions/clearances etc. of this project will be about 36 months.
- (xvi) Benefits: The coastal road will provide a new transportation route for the people. This will reduce traffic on existing roads like Palm Beach Road, Amra Marg, NH 348 highway and decrease travel time becoming seamless connectivity between MTHL, NMIA, NMSEZ and other regional traffic along with additional connectivity to Ulwe node.
- (xvii) The Maharashtra Coastal Management Authority has recommended the proposal *vide* letter No. CRZ 2023/CR 151/TC 4 dated 23/08/2023.

2. The Committee deliberated the proposal and noted that the project activity is permissible as per CRZ Notification, 2011 and MCZMA has recommended the project *vide* letter dated 23/08/2023. However, the Committee opined that conservation and management plan of Mangroves and impact assessment of Bird Management Plan, Flora and Fauna, though has been prepared, it has not been presented appropriately in the EIA report showing the important bird congregation areas *vis-a-vis* road alignment. The PP thereafter showed the same. However, EAC suggested the same to be integrated in the EIA and submit to IRO of MoEFCC. The PP has submitted commitment for the same on 26/09/2023. Accordingly, the Committee recommended the proposal for CRZ Clearance subject to following specific conditions in addition to standard conditions:

- (i) All construction shall be strictly in accordance with the provisions of the CRZ Notification, 2011, as amended from time to time.
- (ii) The road across CRZ-IA and CRZ-IB areas should be on stilts as per CRZ Notification 2011.
- (iii) Any temporary physical infrastructure setup and excavated material during the construction of project shall not be dumped in water bodies or adjacent areas, construction material and structures/scaffoldings erected for construction at site shall be cleared immediately after finishing construction and it shall be ensured that no construction waste, garbage and machinery or equipment are left post construction.
- (iv) Prior clearance under Forest (Conservation) Act, 1980 for diversion of mangrove forests as may be applicable shall be obtained before the start of mangrove area and mangrove buffer.
- (v) Prior approval of the High Court of Mumbai shall be obtained in view of the direction issued in connection with the felling of Mangrove and its conservation before execution of the project.
- (vi) Mangrove afforestation shall be undertaken in consultation with the State Forest Department.
- (vii) All livelihoods related activities should be done by Mangrove Foundation. Accordingly, financial assistance should be provided to Mangrove Foundation.
- (viii) No groundwater shall be extracted to meet the water requirements during the construction and/or operation phases.
- (ix) Permanent labour camp, machinery and material storage shall not be set up in the CRZ area.
- (x) The Project Proponent should comply order/direction, if any, issued by Hon'ble Court/tribunal on the project.
- (xi) There will be no construction activity during the turtle nesting season, if any from 1st January to 30th April of every year.
- (xii) No excavated material during the construction shall be dumped in water bodies or adjacent areas. The site shall be restored to its near original condition after completion of construction of bridge.
- (xiii) Detailed muck disposal plan with transportation details should be submitted to IRO.
- (xiv) The PP stated during the presentation, the bridge has no impact on adjacent fishing community and the movement of fishing boats.

- Accordingly, report should be submitted on the actual situation to the IRO, MoEFCC and take necessary measures to ensure the same, if required.
- (xv) PP should undertake bird monitoring through a national reputed academic institute such as Jhunjhunwala College, University of Mumbai during the construction and at least 2 years after the commission of the project and submit same to IRO of the Ministry.
 - (xvi) The project proponent shall ensure the flow of natural tidal water to mangroves should remain un-affected and thus adequate measures to be provided to maintain un-interrupted tidal water to mangroves.
 - (xvii) Temporary toilets will be provided for all construction labour. Suitable toilet fixtures for water conservation shall be provided. Fixtures for showers, toilet flushing and drinking should be of low flow either by use of aerators of pressure reducing devices or sensor based control.
 - (xviii) Topsoil excavated during construction activities shall be stored for use in horticulture/landscape development etc. within the project site.
 - (xix) Water quality of the entire creek should be monitored regularly to see the impact of construction and reclamation activities and submit the report to IRO of the Ministry.
 - (xx) All the conditions stipulated by the Maharashtra Coastal Zone Management Authority for CRZ clearance under CRZ Notification, 2011 *vide* its letter no. CRZ 2023/CR 151/TC 4 dated 23/08/2023 and commitments made by the PP before the MCZMA and EAC shall be followed in letter and spirit.
 - (xxi) All necessary clearance from the concerned authority, as may be applicable should be obtained prior to commencement of project or activity.

AGENDA 3.5

Proposal for development of Balkum Gaimukh Road by M/s Thane Municipal Corporation, Maharashtra-CRZ Clearance [IA/MH/CRZ/419811/2023; F. No.11/38/2023-IA.III]

“The EAC noted that the Project Proponent has given undertaking that the data and information given in the application and enclosures are true to the best of his knowledge and belief and no information has been suppressed in the EIA/EMP report. If any part of the data/information submitted is found to be false /misleading at any stage, the project will be rejected and Environmental and or CRZ Clearance given, if any, will be revoked at the risk and cost of the project proponent.”

The Project Proponent (**M/s Thane Municipal Corporation, Maharashtra**) along with his EIA consultant (**M/s Tandan Urban Solution Private Limited and Centre for Envotech & Management Consultancy Private Limited**) made a presentation on above said proposal. The EAC took note of following key parameters and salient features of the project as presented during the meeting as well as the details provided in the brief and application for this project:

- (i) The proposal is for seeking CRZ Clearance under CRZ Notification, 2011 for the Proposed Development of the Balkum to Gaimukh Road by M/s Thane Municipal Corporation.
- (ii) The project alignment is part of Development Plan (DP) prepared for Thane City. The alignment of the project road generally passes parallel to Ulhas River crossing it at Khargoan.
- (iii) The proposed road Right of Way (ROW) is 40 Meter to 45 m as per Development Plan of TMC. The Proposed Road is to be constructed with concrete pavement. The total road length is 13.215 km.
- (iv) The proposed road is 6 lane divided with additional lane on each side for emergency use. To facilitate efficient drainage of storm water, 3m wide storm water drain (SWD) cum utility duct is proposed at either end of ROW.
- (v) The proposed alignment starts from Kharegaon Toll Naka of NH-3 and continue through village Balkum, Kolshet, Waghbil, Ovala, Kasarvadavali, and Mogharpada.
- (vi) In the proposed alignment, land belonging to the Government of Maharashtra, Municipal Corporation and Maharashtra Forest Dept. (Mangrove Cell) is required to be acquired for the execution of the project.
- (vii) The proposed road passes through the CRZ-IA, CRZ-IB, 50 Meter Mangroves Buffer Zone, CRZ II, CRZ-IVB and outside the CRZ area. The Detail CRZ area Classification is as below:

CRZ Classification	Length (m)
CRZ-IA	1832.28
50m Mangrove buffer Zone	1957.43
CRZ-IB	407.63
CRZ-II	2028.78
CRZ-IVB	15.22
Outside the CRZ Area	6865.66
Total	13107.00

- (viii) No territorial Forest land is required for the proposed project. The alignment being the parallel to Ulhas Creek predominately mangroves forest land is affected due to project.
- (ix) The Alignment proposed is outside the wildlife area and Eco Sensitive Zones. The DP Road is 1.5 Km Aerial distance from Tungreshwar Wildlife Sanctuary. The End Point of the Balkum Gaikmukh DP Road is 200 from Eco Sensitive Zone of Sanjay Gandhi National Park (SGNP) and 300 from Wildlife Boundary of the SGNP. The project alignment 3.86 Km from the Thane Creek Flamingo Sanctuary (TCFS).
- (x) The proposed road to be developed in phases. For immediate need of the city, Phase 1 with development of only 40m wide corridor costing Rs. 1316.76 Crores including Underpass near Gaimukh on Ghodbunder Road. The development of additional link as per original DP Demarcation from NH-3 to Old Agra Road may be taken up in Phase 1. The Phase 2 costing is ₹244.12 Crores which include interchanges for DP roads such as Old Agra

Road, Kolshet Road, Reti Naka Road near Wagbill and Kharbao Road (New Thane) connected to project road for future needs.

- (xi) The alignment has been designed on Slit and Underground tunnel at Kolshet at Air force station (Akbhar Camp) in accordance of NOC issued by the Ministry of Defence.
- (xii) The Impact on Mangroves proposed during the construction as below:

Name of the Village	Total area (sq. m)	Impact on Mangroves	
		Temporary	Permanent
Balkum	31332	2193	439
Kharigaon	5532	387	77
Kolshet	53543	3748	562
Kavesar	2407	168	34
Wadavli	110	15	9
Bhayandarpada	7453	522	104
Total	100377	7034	1407

- (xiii) The Proposed alignment requires 12.026 ha. diversion of Notified (6.6952 ha.), Un-notified (2.9242 ha.) and Private (2.6413 ha.) Mangroves land for the Project. The Proposed alignment requires cutting of the 1531 mangrove trees and 15 mangroves associated species.
- (xiv) For portion on Road on Slit required total 10 ha. Mangroves Land to be diverted for Road on Stilt which will be temporary during construction. The post construction out of 10 ha. Mangroves land 8 ha. of mangroves land will be reclaimed.
- (xv) For Cut and Cover Tunnel at Kolshet total 2 ha. land required out of which 1.5 ha. can be restored post construction by plantation of the Mangroves or mangroves associated species as per guidance of Mangroves Cell. The actual impact on the Mangrove land will be only 2.5 ha. of Mangroves Land will be affected in the Project.
- (xvi) IRS, Anna University, Chennai prepared the CRZ Report and Maps.
- (xvii) The alignment is passing near the Naval area and due to security reasons, Naval establishment provided NOC for the road only by using cut and cover near the establishment. The area falls under CRZ 1A.
- (xviii) MCZMA has recommended the proposal for CRZ Clearance vide letter no. CRZ 2022/CR 108/TC4 dated 14/02/2023 and noted that project activity is permissible as per para 8.I (i)(c) & (e) and para 8.I (ii) (g) of CRZ Notification, 2011 vide letter dated 08/09/2023.
- (xix) Employment: The construction and operation of the proposed DP Road will have some beneficial impact due to increase in incomes as local unskilled, semiskilled and skilled persons as they will gain some direct and indirect employment.
- (xx) Benefits: It will divert traffic currently on the Ghodbunder road coming from the Gujarat and North India.

2. The Committee deliberated the proposal and noted that the project activity is permissible as per CRZ Notification, 2011 and MCZMA has recommended the project *vide* letter dated 14/02/2023. Further, EAC has noted that Cut and

Cover Tunnel method is proposed due to the conditional NOC provided by Navy. However, it is not a permissible activity in CRZ-IA area. The Committee, thus requested the proponent to consider the road on stilt or via tunnel in discussion with Ministry of Defence. Proponent agreed to explore the options as suggested by the EAC. Accordingly, the EAC has deferred the proposal.

AGENDA 3.6

Proposal for laying of Product Operating Line (POL) Pipeline from Kamarajar Port at Ennore to CPCL at Manali via IOCL, Vallur Terminal Proposed by M/s Indian Oil Corporation Limited, Chennai-CRZ clearance (IA/TN/CRZ/444117/2023; F. No.11/39/2023-IA.III)

“The EAC noted that the Project Proponent has given undertaking that the data and information given in the application and enclosures are true to the best of his knowledge and belief and no information has been suppressed in the EIA/EMP report. If any part of the data/information submitted is found to be false /misleading at any stage, the project will be rejected and Environmental and or CRZ Clearance given, if any, will be revoked at the risk and cost of the project proponent.”

The Project Proponent (**M/s Indian Oil Corporation Limited, Chennai**) along with his EIA consultant (**M/s Mantec Consultants Private Limited**) made a presentation on above said proposal. The EAC took note of following key parameters and salient features of the project as presented during the meeting as well as the details provided in the brief and application for this project:

- (i) The proposal seeks CRZ Clearance under CRZ Notification, 2011 for the Laying of the Product Operating Line (POL) Pipeline from Kamarajar Port at Ennore to CPCL at Manali via IOCL, Vallur Terminal.
- (ii) Total length of the proposed pipeline is 19610.32m. The proposed pipeline crossing 7.44 Km in CRZ areas. The classification of CRZ area as follows:

CRZ Category	Length (m)
CRZ-IA	191.53
CRZ-IA (50m Mangrove Buffer Zone)	456.20
CRZ-IB	2798.28
CRZ-II	1924.73
CRZ-III(NDZ)	1695.46
CRZ-IVB	374.02
Outside CRZ	12170.10
Total	19610.32

- (iii) The pipeline is proposed to be installed by Horizontal Directional Drilling (HDD) technique across major perennial rivers/canals, National/State Highways; whereas across minor rivers /canals, pipeline would be laid by

submerged crossing method. Pipeline across railway crossings would be laid by using bored cased crossing method.

(iv) Design parameter of Main Pipeline:

Particulars	Specification
Product to be transported	ATF, HSD, Motor Spirit & SKO
Material of Construction	MS Type
Line Size	2 X 30" Multi-Product Pipeline & 3 X 24" MultiProduct PL
Length in km	30" OD x 0.406 about 10.5 km from Kamarajar (Ennore) to Vallur Terminal. 24" OD X 0.375 of about 8.9 km Upcoming Vallur Station to CPCL Refinery
Thickness	30" ODx 0.406 WT; 24" ODx 0.375 WT
Pipeline operating life	30 years approx
Design Pressure of Station Facilities	ANSI 150# (19.1 kg/cm ² at 65° C)
Design Pressure of Pipelines	For 30" Pipeline= 71 kg/cm ² For 24" Pipeline= 82kg/cm ²
Design Temp.	65° C
Operating Pressure	Operating Pressure 30"- 7 kg/cm ² 24"- 6kg/cm ² (MS), 8kg/cm ² (HSD), 6.5kg/cm ² (ATF)

- (v) As per Para 4(ii) d, the project activity requires CRZ Clearance from the Ministry based on the recommendation of concern SCZMA.
- (vi) IRS, Anna University, Chennai has prepared the CRZ Report and Maps.
- (vii) Rapid EIA for terrestrial components is prepared by M/s Mantec Consultants Private Limited.
- (viii) No trees are to be cut/ uprooted during laying of the pipeline.
- (ix) Power requirement for laying of pipeline will be met through 5-6 no.'s of mobile DG sets having capacity 62.5 KVA during construction phase. Mobile DG set will be diesel operated 40L/day diesel will be required for D.G set operation. During operation phase total power requirement is approx. 4452.41 KVA for Vallur Terminal.
- (x) Manpower requirement will be approx. 50-75 in number of workers will be met through contractors. Approx. 10-15 No.s manpower will be required during operation phase.
- (xi) The estimated to cost of the project is ₹789.86 crore.
- (xii) There is no ecologically sensitivity (Reserved Forest/Protected Forest/ National Park /Wildlife Sanctuary and Corridor) area in the 500m width both side of the pipeline and 15 Km radius of the stations.
- (xiii) Employment: The project shall provide employment potential under unskilled, semi-skilled and skilled categories. The employment potential shall increase with the start of construction activities, reach a peak during construction phase and then reduce with completion of construction activities. During operation phase also there will be employment opportunities, mainly in service sector

- (xiv) Benefits: There will be a beneficial effect from pipeline project that will directly and indirectly boost the living standards of the people, save foreign exchange and with increase in industrial activities, create more jobs in the local economy.
- (xv) TNSCZMA has recommended the proposal *vide* letter no.P1/899/2023 dated 07/09/2023. TNSCZMA has mentioned that the project activity is permissible as per Para 8 I (b), 8 II (iv), 8 III A (e) and para 8 III B (ii).

2. The Committee deliberated the proposal and noted that the project activity is permissible as per CRZ Notification, 2011 and TNSCZMA has recommended the project *vide* letter dated 07/09/2023. Further, the Committee has noted that the proposed pipeline in CRZ area by HDD method is in order. Accordingly, the Committee recommended the proposal for CRZ Clearance subject to following specific conditions in addition to standard conditions:

- (i) All construction shall be strictly in accordance with the provisions of the CRZ Notification, 2011, as amended from time to time.
- (ii) The pipeline where the crossing of water body/river/creek areas should be laid through the Horizontal Directional Drilling (HDD) method.
- (iii) There will be no construction activity during the turtle nesting season, if any from 1st January to 30th April of every year.
- (iv) Any temporary physical infrastructure setup and excavated material during the construction of project shall not be dumped in water bodies or adjacent areas, construction material and structures/scaffoldings erected for construction at site shall be cleared immediately after finishing construction and it shall be ensured that no construction waste, garbage and machinery or equipment are left post construction.
- (v) No storage reservoir for sea water shall be permitted and only pipelines conveyance system shall be installed.
- (vi) No groundwater shall be extracted within the CRZ area to meet the water requirements during the construction and/or operation phase of the project.
- (vii) Permanent labour camp, machinery and material storage shall not be set up in the CRZ area.
- (viii) The project proponents certify that there is no legal restriction on the proposed project activities at the proposed site. However, Project Proponent shall comply order/direction, if any, issued by Hon'ble Court/tribunal on the project.
- (ix) The project proponent shall ensure the flow of natural tidal water to mangroves should remain un-affected and thus adequate measures to be provided to maintain un-interrupted tidal water to mangroves.
- (x) All the conditions stipulated by the Tamil Nadu State Coastal Zone Management Authority for CRZ clearance under CRZ Notification, 2011 *vide* letter no. P1/899/2023 dated 07/09/2023 and commitments made by the PP before the OCMA and EAC shall be followed in letter and spirit.
- (xi) All necessary clearance from the concerned authority, as may be applicable should be obtained prior to commencement of project or activity.

Annexure

List of the Expert Appraisal Committee (CRZ) Members participated during Video Conferencing (VC) Meeting held on 26th September, 2023.

S. No.	Name of Members	Designation
1.	Dr. Deepak Arun Apte	Chairman
2.	Dr. M. V. Ramanamurthy	Member
3.	Dr. Manoranjan Hota	Member
4.	Shri S. Jeyakrishnan	Member
5.	Shri M. S. Negi	Member
6.	Prof. V. K. Jain	Member
7.	Prof. A. K. Pachauri	Member
8.	Shri Sham Wagh	Member
9.	Prof. Mukesh Khare	Member
10.	Dr. H. Kharkwal	Member Secretary
11.	Dr. Ragavan P, Scientist B	MoEF&CC
