

**GOVERNMENT OF INDIA
MINISTRY OF ENVIRONMENT, FOREST AND CLIMATE CHANGE
IA-III SECTION (CRZ)**

**MINUTES OF THE 285th MEETING OF THE EXPERT APPRAISAL COMMITTEE FOR
PROJECTS RELATED TO COASTAL REGULATION ZONE HELD ON
28th DECEMBER, 2021**

The 285th meeting of the Expert Appraisal Committee for projects related to Coastal Regulation Zone was held on 28/12/2021 through Video Conferencing due to prevalent pandemic situation. The list of members present in the EAC are at **Annexure-I**.

The deliberations held and the decisions taken are as under:

2.0 CONFIRMATION OF THE MINUTES OF THE LAST MEETING

The Committee having noted that the Minutes of the 282nd meeting are in order and confirmed the same with suggestions that in case any typographical / grammatical errors are noticed in due course, the same may be corrected suitably.

3.0 CONSIDERATION OF PROPOSALS FOR CRZ CLEARANCE

RECONSIDERATION PROPOSALS:

Item No. 3.1

Setting up of 70 MLD Seawater Desalination Plant of M/s Bhavnagar Desalination Private Ltd. (BDPL) for Gujarat Water Infrastructure Limited (GWIL) at Village Nava Ratanpar, District Bhavnagar, Gujarat-CRZ Clearance regarding

[IA/GJ/CRZ/229032/2021] [F.NO.11/28/2021-IA.III]

“The EAC noted that the Project Proponent has given undertaking that the data and information given in the application and enclosures are true to the best of his knowledge and belief and no information has been suppressed in the EIA/EMP report. If any part of data / information submitted is found to be false / misleading at any stage, the project will be rejected and Environmental and or CRZ Clearance given, if any, will be revoked at the risk and cost of the project proponent.”

The proposal was earlier considered by the EAC (CRZ) in its 276th meeting held on 28th September, 2021. The additional information desired by the Committee and response submitted by the project proponent are as under:

S. No.	Observations of the EAC	Response of the PP
1	The Committee noted that the proposed map is prepared by IRS, Anna University, Chennai and in the IRS report it was mentioned that the map was prepared as the coordinates are provided by the	The site visit by IRS, Anna University was carried between on 22 nd October, 2021 and revised map is submitted.

	PP for the project activities and field verification and survey was not done for the proposed activity and suggested to submit fresh 1:4000 maps after due ground verification of CRZ classification.	
2	The Committee further also noted during the presentation that the area adjacent to passing the intake and outfall pipeline defined in map is CRZ-1B (intertidal zone), however by Google image provided by PP and other evidence, the area shows CRZ-1A (mudflats), it needs clarification.	IRS Anna University has conducted the site visit and issued the new CRZ map
3	The Committee suggested to PP for: (a) compliance of GCZMA recommendation specially development of Bio-diversity Conservation Plan vetted by PCCF (WL); (b) mangrove plantation plan with consultation with State Forest Department. Plan should be such that it will avoid mangrove plantation on non-vegetated mudflats which are vital for migratory birds; (c) explore the feasibility for supplying brine water to authorized saltpan agencies after necessary treatment etc.	Biodiversity Conservation Plan is submitted to Principal Chief Conservator of Forest, Wildlife. The project proponent has accepted to carry out mangrove plantation in consultation with the Gujarat Forest Department. Forest Department will ensure appropriate location for afforestation. The project proponent has already in discussion with CSIR – Central Salt & Marine Chemicals Research Institute in Bhavnagar to utilize the brine reject for the production of common salt (NaCl – Sodium Chloride).
4	The Committee also suggested the PP to check the possibility of the alignment of pipelines to avoid non-vegetated mudflats.	The detailed study on various alternatives is submitted. The most feasible possibility considering – Location, Availability of Water depth, Interference with Navigation channel and minimal impact corridor in CRZ area has been identified as option - 6.
5	The Committee desired the site visit and deferred the proposal for consideration at a later stage.	IRS Anna University has conducted the site visit and issued the new CRZ map

The project proponent M/s Bhavnagar Desalination Private Ltd. (BDPL) and their consultant made a detailed final presentation for re-consideration of project for CRZ Clearance and informed salient features of the project as:

- (i) The proposal is for CRZ clearance to the project for Setting up of 70 MLD Seawater Desalination Plant at Village Nava Ratanpar, District Bhavnagar, Gujarat by M/s Bhavnagar Desalination Private Ltd. (BDPL) for Gujarat Water Infrastructure Limited (GWIL).
- (ii) The Intermittent distance from LFP to pump house is 994 m.

(iii) The distance intake and outfall distance are as follows:

Distance	Intake	Distance	Outfall
LFP to Intake Head	3710 m	LFP to Outfall Head	4760 m
LFP to HHTL	230 m	LFP to HHTL	230 m
HHTL to LLTL	1558 m	HHTL to LLTL	1540 m
LLTL to Intake Head	1922 m	LLTL to Outfall	2990 m

- (iv) The proposed project pipeline falls in CRZ-IA, CRZ-IB, CRZ-III (NDZ) and CRZ-IVB area, Intermittent pump house is in CRZ-IB (intertidal-area) and the desalination plant facilities are in CRZ-II, CRZ-III (NDZ) and outside the CRZ area.
- (v) The proposed project layout was superimposed on the approved CZMP of the 1:4000 scale map, which was prepared by Institute of Remote Sensing, Anna University, Chennai.
- (vi) The proposed pipeline (intake and outfall) passing details in CRZ area. Pipelines to be buried below sea floor:

CRZ Classification	Intake pipeline	Outfall pipeline
Non CRZ	-	-
CRZ – IA	814.0 m	817.8 m
CRZ – IB	773.8 m	793.5 m
CRZ – III (NDZ)	230.5 m	231.5 m
CRZ – IVA	1891.7 m	2917.2 m
Total	3710.0 m	4760.0 m

- (vii) Cutting may be carried out using cutter suction dredger and no rock blasting is carried out. Marine work not to be done during ban period for breeding season.
- (viii) The details of desalination plant area fall in CRZ area (m²):

CRZ Classification	Desalination plant	Total
Non CRZ	177962.4	221451.4
CRZ – II	3997.7	
CRZ – III (NDZ)	39491.3	

- (ix) The sea water intake is 189 KLD, through 70 KLD water generate and 119 KLD brine generate. The brine water utilised for salt production, based on availability of land.
- (x) Nearest salt pans are available at 3950 km. distance at north of Desalination plant.
- (xi) BDPL and GWIL would collaborate with CSIR-CSMCRRI to integrate purification of saline water with solar salt production and reuse the brine.
- (xii) During constructional phase total 25 KLD of water per day will be required at peak stage of construction and this will be provided by GWIL. While in operational phase: 189000 KLD of seawater intake will be extracted from Gulf of Khambhat and utilized for the production of 70000 KLD of Product water.
- (xiii) The power requirement is 25 MVA, which will be met from PGVCL.

- (xiv) During the proposed project approximately 110 persons will be employed. During construction phase about 100 workers and during operational phase 10 workers will be employed.
- (xv) The total cost of the project is ₹630.5 Crores.
- (xvi) The Gujarat Coastal Zone Management Authority has recommended the proposal for clearance *vide* its letter No. ENV-10-2021-134-(T cell), dated 09/09/2021.

2. Deliberations in the EAC:

The Committee made a detailed deliberation on the proposal. The Committee noted that the project proponent has submitted the revised details and CRZ map prepared by the IRS Anna University, after ground truth verification. In view of the same, the Committee is of the view that the site visit is not required for the project as all the clarifications were addressed. The Committee also analysed the alternate site study and considered the site proposed by the project proponent. The Committee also deliberated on the Biodiversity Conservation Plan and Mangrove plantation plan and found to be satisfactory.

As committed, the project proponent shall assist in developing a prototype setup in consultation with CSIR- Central Salt and Marine Chemicals Research Institute (CSMCRI) Bhavnagar and Dr. V.K. Jain (Member EAC), wherein the brine discharge can be used for the beneficiation of metals, minerals and production of sodium hypochlorite (commonly known as disinfectant or a bleaching agent). Also reuse of desalination plants reject for saltpans as migratory bird habitat instead of discharging into sea, while ensuring that the treated brine is safe for the birds. Project proponent will provide the necessary funds to the implementing agency and shall submit a report within one year to this Ministry.

The Committee after detailed deliberations and considering the submissions made by the project proponent, recommended the proposal for CRZ Clearance, subject to following conditions:

- (i). All construction shall be strictly in accordance with the provisions of CRZ Notification, 2011 and as amended from time to time.
- (ii). As committed by the project proponent, appropriate Biodiversity conservation and Mangrove Management Plan in coordination with State Forest Department shall be undertaken.
- (iii). The PP shall explore the feasibility of supplying brine water to authorized saltpan agencies and / or further utilization of the brine solution.
- (iv). The project proponent shall assist in developing a prototype with CSIR- Central Salt and Marine Chemicals Research Institute (CSMCRI) as committed, to reuse the brine discharge for saltpans as migratory bird habitat instead of discharging into sea, while ensuring that the treated brine is safe for the birds and shall submit a report within one year to this Ministry. Necessary funds will be provided by the project proponent to the implementing agency.
- (v). The marine ecology at the outfall should be monitored and submitted as part of half yearly report.
- (vi). No storage reservoir for sea water shall be permitted and only pipelines conveyance system shall be installed.
- (vii). No groundwater shall be extracted within CRZ area to meet water requirements during the construction and / or operational phase of the project.
- (viii). The pipelines (intake and Outfall) shall be laid from plant to HTL using HDD methodology and from HTL to the intake & outfall point by cutting the rocks and burying the pipeline and replacing back the rocks appropriately.

- (ix). The water quality and marine ecosystem to be monitored around 500 m radius of the outfall location.
- (x). No excavated material during the construction shall be dumped in water bodies or adjacent areas. The site shall be restored to its near original condition after completion of construction.
- (xi). Any physical infrastructure setup during construction period shall be removed simultaneously with completion of laying of each segment of the project.
- (xii). All the conditions stipulated in the Gujarat Coastal Zone Management Authority letter dated 9th September, 2021.
- (xiii). All necessary clearance from the concerned authority, as may be applicable should be obtained prior to commencement of project or activity.

Item No. 3.2

Development of Mahindra Holiday Resort on Plot bearing Survey Nos. 32/1, 136/3, 32/2/2, 32/2/3, 32/2/5, 32/2/3, 32/2/7, 32/2/8, 32/2/9, 32/2/10, 32/2/11, 32/4/A, 32/4/B at Village Undi & Village Chapheri, Taluka & District Ratnagiri, Maharashtra by M/s. Mahindra Holidays & Resorts India Ltd - CRZ Clearance regarding

[IA/MH/CRZ/220442/2021] [F.NO.11/21/2021-IA.III]

“The EAC noted that the Project Proponent has given undertaking that the data and information given in the application and enclosures are true to the best of his knowledge and belief and no information has been suppressed in the EIA/EMP report. If any part of data / information submitted is found to be false / misleading at any stage, the project will be rejected and Environmental and or CRZ Clearance given, if any, will be revoked at the risk and cost of the project proponent.”

The proposal was earlier considered by the EAC (CRZ) in its 270th and 274th meeting held on 11th August, 2021 and 17th September, 2021 respectively.

The Committee in its last meeting held on 17th September 2021 noted the revised area / layout plan / construction plan and suggested that no construction shall be allowed in the NDZ area. The Committee also suggested that the required NOC shall be obtained from the State Ground Water Authority by M/s Mahindra Holidays & Resorts India Ltd. **before processing the file for final CRZ Clearance.**

After the approval of minutes by the EAC, it was observed that the construction plan approved by the Committee is not a permissible activity as per the CRZ Notification, 2011. It was noticed that the ADS reply submitted by the PP has changes in the earlier plan, which requires fresh approval by the EAC (CRZ).

The additional information suggested by the Committee while recommending the proposal and ADS raised by MoEFCC, the response submitted by the project proponent are as under:

S. No.	Observations of the EAC	Response of the PP
1	The required NOC shall be obtained from the State Ground Water	PP have received NOC from Regional Office CGWB, Nagpur for ground water extraction dt. 01.10.2021.

	Authority by M/s Mahindra Holidays & Resorts India Ltd. before processing the file for final CRZ Clearance.	PP have obtained confirmation from Regional Office, CGWB Nagpur via email dt. 08.12.2021 regarding basement construction, as follows: "The depth of excavation for proposed basement excavation/construction is 3.50 m i.e., from 108 to 104.50 m AMSL, whereas the water table elevation is ranging from 73.80 to 87.10 m AMSL, thus the intersection of water level will not be encountered during the basement construction of 3.50 m depth, thereby ruling out any dewatering possibility. Hence NOC for dewatering is not applicable in the present case".
2	The details of construction regarding Main Bldg & Buffet Restaurant under the Configuration was submitted Ground + Lower level, which is not a permissible as per CRZ Notification, 2011. The clarification along with document need to be submitted by PP as per extent norms of CRZ Notification. It is also advised upload same PPT presented before the EAC in its meeting held on 17/09/2021 on the Parivesh Portal to take further action on the project.	PP had earlier proposed Main Bldg & Buffet Restaurant of Ground + Lower level (comprising of Reception & Buffet Restaurant, Back of House (Hotel Support) Areas, Parking & Services). However as per suggestion of EAC, PP have now split the Main Bldg into 2 blocks i.e. Main Bldg -1.1 (comprising of Ground floor) & Main Bldg -1.2 (Comprising of Basement + ground floor). Restaurant & Buffet areas are maintained at ground floor of Main bldg. 1.1. Back of House i.e. Hotel Support Areas are proposed on ground floor of Main Bldg -1.2 and parking & services are proposed in basement of Main Bldg -1.2 following the extant norms of CRZ Notification (Maximum height of 9 mt.). Revised layout Plan is submitted. The comparative of project proposal and area statement presented in 274 th EAC meeting and revised as per ADS generated are submitted. There are no changes in number of studio room, 1 Bed room, 2 Bed cottages, Hotel rooms and environmental parameters on account of minor reconfiguration in Main building block. Revised presentation is submitted.

The proposal alongwith revised plan placed before the EAC in its meeting held on 28/12/2021. The Project Proponent M/s. Mahindra Holidays & Resorts India Ltd. and their consultant made a detailed presentation for re-consideration of project for CRZ Clearance and informed salient features of the project as:

(i) The proposal is for CRZ Clearance to the project for Development of Mahindra Holiday Resort on Plot bearing Survey Nos. 32/1, 136/3, 32/2/2, 32/2/3, 32/2/5, 32/2/3, 32/2/7, 32/2/8, 32/2/9, 32/2/10, 32/2/11, 32/4/A, 32/4/B by M/s. Mahindra Holidays & Resorts India Ltd at Village Undi & Village Chapheri, Taluka & District Ratnagiri, Maharashtra.

(ii) The total plot area is 114400.00 Sq.m out of which construction built-up area (FSI + NON FSI) is 28522.66 Sq.m. The proposed area statement is as under:

Description	Area (Sq. m)
Total Plot Area	114400.00
RG Area Provision	10504.90
Additional Green Area	11000.00

Amenity Area	5252.45
Built –up Area as per FSI	25283.28
Non FSI area	3239.38
Total Construction Built-up Area	28522.66

(iii) The project falls in CRZ III (200m to 500m)-93288.39 Sq. m, NDZ of CRZ III-17108.23 Sq. m and non CRZ area –4003.38 Sq. m with the details of construction area are as under:

Building	Height
Block A1 to A3 3 Nos. of Bldg: Ground + 1 floor each Studio Room: 12 nos. 1 Bed Room: 12 nos.	8.85 mt.
Block B1 & B2 2 Nos. of Bldg: Ground + 1 floor each Studio Room: 16 nos. 1 Bed Room: 8 nos.	8.85 mt.
Block C: 1 No. of Bldg: Ground + 1 floor Studio Room: 16 nos. 1 Bed Room: 4 nos.	8.85 mt.
Block D: 1 No. of Bldg: Ground + 1 floor Hotel Rooms: 16 nos.	8.50 mt.
Block E: 1 No. of Bldg: Ground + 1 floor Studio Room: 6 nos. 1 Bed Room: 10 nos.	8.85 mt.
Block F: 1 No. of Bldg: Ground + 1 floor Studio Room: 8 nos.	8.85 mt.
Block G: 1 No. of Bldg: Ground + 1 floor Studio Room: 18 nos.	8.85 mt.
Block J1: 1 No. of Bldg: Ground + 1 floor Studio Room: 12 nos.	8.85 mt.
Block L1 & L2: 2 Nos. of Bldg: Ground floor each 1 Bed Room: 4 nos.	3.30 mt.
Block M1 to M6: 6 Nos. of Bldg: Ground floor each Hotel Rooms: 24 nos.	3.30 mt.
Main Bldg 1.1: Ground floor: Reception & Buffet Restaurant	9.0 mt.
Main Bldg 1.2: Ground floor: Back of House (Hotel Support) Basement: Parking & Services	4.20 mt.

Holiday Activity: Ground: Admin areas 1 floor: Holiday activity areas	8.85 mt.
Banquet: Ground floor	9.00 mt.
Shack Restaurant (2 nos.): Ground floor	8.85 mt.
Block A4 to A6: 3 Nos. of Bldg: Ground + 1 floor each Studio Room: 12 nos. 1 Bed Room: 12 nos.	8.85 mt.
Block B3: 1 No. of Bldg: Ground + 1 floor Studio Room: 8 nos. 1 Bed Room: 4 nos.	8.85 mt.
Block J2: 1 No. of Bldg: Ground + 1 floor Studio Room: 12 nos.	8.85 mt.
Block K1 & K2: 2 Nos. of Bldg: Ground + 1 floor each 1 Bed Room: 16 nos.	8.85 mt.
Block N1 to N6: 6 Nos. of Bldg: Ground floor each 2 Bed Cottages: 6 nos.	4.85 mt.
SPA and Gym: 1 No. of Bldg: Ground + 1 floor	8.85 mt.

(iv) The proposed project layout was superimposed on the approved CZMP of the 1:4000 scale map, which was prepared by Institute of Remote Sensing, Chennai. No construction is proposed within 200 meters in the landward side of High Tide Line and within the area between Low Tide Line and High Tide Line. Excavation shall be done for the foundation of the blocks for various resort rooms, restaurants, activities etc. Excavation material shall be partly reused on site for backfilling (31242 cum) and partly for road levelling (505 cum). The plantation of 1664 nos. of trees and landscape development shall be done to create a pleasing aesthetic and visual impact.

(v) The total water requirement during non-monsoon season will be 278 KLD and sourced will be through Tankers.

Power requirement will be sourced from the Maharashtra State Electricity Distribution Company Limited (MSEDCL). The connected load will be 2847 KW and maximum demand will be 1844 KW. DG Sets of capacity 1 X 810 kVA, 1 X 625 kVA, 1 X 500 kVA shall be used during emergency.

During Operation phase 177kg/day biodegradable waste and 265kg/day non-biodegradable waste will be generated. Biodegradable waste will be treated through Treatment by Organic Waste Converter (OWC) and non-biodegradable waste will be treated by authorised recyclers. STP Sludge (Dry sludge) will be used as manure. Domestic hazardous wastes shall be stored separately and disposed to authorized waste pickers or waste collectors as per the direction or notification by the local authorities from time to time

(vi) During the proposed project approximately 386 persons will be employed and during construction phase about 150 persons will be temporary employed. While in

operation phase 236 persons will be permanently employed. The total cost of the project will be ₹72.39 crores.

(vii) The Maharashtra Coastal Zone Management Authority has recommended the proposal for CRZ clearance *vide* letter No. CRZ/2020/CR169/TC 4 dated 30th June, 2021.

2. Deliberations in the EAC:

The Committee made a detailed deliberation on the proposal. The Committee noted that the proposal was earlier recommended by the EAC, however, the project proponent has made certain changes considering the observations of the EAC.

The Committee noted that the project proponent has obtained NOC from the CGWA for ground water extraction which is valid from 01.10.2021 to 30.09.2026. The project proponent has also obtained clarification from the CGWA regarding NOC for basement excavation / construction as not applicable in the present case. The Committee also noted the changes in the building configuration. The Committee found the additional details and proposal submitted by the project proponent to be satisfactory and in order.

The Committee after detailed deliberations and considering the submissions made by the project proponent, reiterated its recommendation on the proposal as earlier for CRZ Clearance subject to conditions as earlier 274th meeting dated 17th September, 2021 and reproduced as:

- (i). The proposed construction should be as per extant norms given at Annexure-III of the CRZ Notification, 2011 and as amended from time to time.
- (ii). No construction shall be allowed in NDZ areas of the CRZ-III.
- (iii). No groundwater shall be extracted within CRZ area to meet the water requirements during the construction and / or operation phase of the project.
- (iv). Construction of basement may be allowed subject to the condition that no objection certification is obtained from the State Ground Water Authority to the effect that such construction will not adversely affect the flow of groundwater in that area.
- (v). The overall height of construction upto the highest ridge of the roof, shall not exceed 9 metres and the construction shall not be more than two floors (Ground Floor + one Upper Floor).
- (vi). No excavated material during the construction shall be dumped in water bodies or adjacent areas. The site shall be restored to its near original condition after completion of construction of work.
- (vii). Any temporary physical infrastructure setup during construction period shall be removed simultaneously with completion of laying of each segment of the project.
- (viii). No permanent labour camp, machinery and material storage shall be allowed in CRZ area.
- (ix). All necessary clearance from the concerned authority, as may be applicable should be obtained prior to commencement of project or activity.

4.0 Any other item with the permission of the Chair.

The meeting ended with a Vote of Thanks to the Chair.

List of the Expert Appraisal Committee (CRZ) Members participated during Video Conferencing (VC) Meeting held on 28th December, 2021

S. No.	Name of Members	Designation
1.	Dr. Deepak Arun Apte	Chairman
2.	Dr. Manoranjan Hota	Member
3.	Shri Manmohan Singh Negi	Member
4.	Shri Sham Wagh	Member
5.	Prof. Ashok Kumar Pachauri	Member
6.	Shri S. Jeyakrishnan	Member
7.	Prof. V.K Jain	Member
8.	Dr. M.V. Ramana Murthy	Member
9.	Shri. R.P.S Verma	Member
10.	Dr. Niraj Sharma	Member
11.	Dr. H. Kharkwal	Member Secretary
MoEF&CC		
11.	Dr. Abhilasha S. Mathuriya	Scientist 'D'
12.	Dr. Nobi E. P	Scientist 'B'
