

MINUTES OF THE 276th MEETING OF THE EXPERT APPRAISAL COMMITTEE FOR PROJECTS RELATED TO COASTAL REGULATION ZONE HELD ON 28th SEPTEMBER, 2021

The 276th meeting of the Expert Appraisal Committee for projects related to Coastal Regulation Zone was held on 28/09/2021 held through Video Conferencing due to prevalent pandemic situation. The list of members presents in EAC given at **Annexure-I**.

The deliberations held and the decisions taken are as under:

2.0 CONFIRMATION OF THE MINUTES OF THE LAST MEETING

The committee recommended that typographical errors, if any may be suitably amended. The rest of the note in the minute are in order and accordingly the minute have been confirmed.

3.0 CONSIDERATION OF PROPOSALS

FRESH PRAPOSALS:

3.1 Proposal for setting up of 70 MLD Seawater Desalination Plant of M/s Bhavnagar Desalination Private Ltd. (BDPL) for Gujarat Water Infrastructure Limited (CWIL) at Village Nava Ratanpar, District Bhavnagar, Gujarat-CRZ Clearance

[IA/GJ/CRZ/229032/2021] [F.No.11/28/2021-IA.III]

“The EAC noted that the Project Proponent has given undertaking that the data and information given in the application and enclosures are true to the best of his knowledge and belief and no information has been suppressed in the EIA/EMP report. If any part of data / information submitted is found to be false / misleading at any stage, the project will be rejected and Environmental and or CRZ Clearance given, if any, will be revoked at the risk and cost of the project proponent.”

The proposal of M/s Bhavnagar Desalination Private Ltd. (BDPL) for Gujarat Water Infrastructure Limited (CWIL), has submitted the proposal for setting up of 70 MLD Seawater Desalination Plant. The project proponent made a presentation and submitted the following information as under:

- (i) The proposed project is for 70 MLD Seawater Desalination Plant at Village Nava Ratanpar, District Bhavnagar, Gujarat.
- (ii) The Intermittent distance from LFP to pump house is 994 m.

(iii) The distance intake and outfall distance are as follows:

Distance	Intake	Distance	Outfall
LFP to Intake Head	3710 m	LFP to Outfall Head	4760 m
LFP to HHTL	230 m	LFP to HHTL	230 m
HHTL to LLTL	1558 m	HHTL to LLTL	1540 m
LLTL to Intake Head	1922 m	LLTL to Outfall	2990 m

- (iv) The proposed project pipeline falls in CRZ-IA, CRZ-IB, CRZ-III (NDZ) and CRZ-IVB area, Intermittent pump house is in CRZ-IB (intertidal-area) and the desalination plant facilities are in CRZ-II, CRZ-III (NDZ) and outside the CRZ area.
- (v) The proposed project layout was superimposed on the approved CZMP of the 1:4000 scale map, which was prepared by Institute of Remote Sensing, Anna University, Chennai without ground verification of CRZ classification.
- (vi) The proposed pipeline (intake and outfall) passing details in CRZ area. Pipelines to be buried below sea floor:

CRZ Classification	Intake pipeline	Outfall pipeline
Non CRZ	-	-
CRZ – IA	814.0 m	817.8 m
CRZ – IB	773.8 m	793.5 m
CRZ – III (NDZ)	230.5 m	231.5 m
CRZ – IVA	1891.7 m	2917.2 m
Total	3710.0 m	4760.0 m

- (vii) Cutting may be carried out using cutter suction dredger and no rock blasting is carried out. Marine work not to be done during ban period for breeding season.
- (viii) The details of desalination plant area fall in CRZ area (m²):

CRZ Classification	Desalination plant	Total
Non CRZ	177962.4	221451.4
CRZ – II	3997.7	
CRZ – III (NDZ)	39491.3	

- (ix) The sea water intake is 189 KLD, through 70 KLD water generate and 119 KLD brine generate. The brine water utilised for salt production, based on availability of land.

- (x) Nearest salt pans are available at 3950 km. distance at north of Desalination plant.
- (xi) BDPL and GWIL would collaborate with CSIR-CSMCRI to integrate purification of saline water with solar salt production and reuse the brine.
- (xii) During constructional phase total 25 KLD of water per day will be required at peak stage of construction and this will be provided by GWIL. While in operational phase: 189000 KLD of seawater intake will be extracted from Gulf of Khambhat and utilized for the production of 70000 KLD of Product water.
- (xiii) The power requirement is 25 MVA, which will be met from PGVCL.
- (xiv) During the proposed project approximately 110 persons will be employed. During construction phase about 100 workers and during operational phase 10 workers will be employed.
- (xv) The total cost of the project is ₹630.5 Crores.
- (xvi) The Gujarat Coastal Zone Management Authority has also recommended the proposal for clearance *vide* its letter No. ENV-10-2021-134-(T cell), dated 09/09/2021.

2. The Committee noted that the proposed map is prepared by IRS, Anna University, Chennai and in the IRS report it was mentioned that the map was prepared as the coordinates are provided by the PP for the project activities and field verification and survey was not done for the proposed activity and suggested to submit fresh 1:4000 maps after due ground verification of CRZ classification.

3. The Committee also noted the pipelines of the intake and outfall will cross through the intertidal zone (CRZ-IB) as well as CRZ-IA. The CRZ-IA is classified as ecologically sensitive zone of mudflats and as intimated by the PP, there is only mud flats area. However, the PP informed that to minimize destruction on the sub-tidal benthic community, the cutting may be carried out in a controlled manner confined to only the pipeline route.

4. The Committee further also noted during the presentation that the area adjacent to passing the intake and outfall pipeline defined in map is CRZ-1B (intertidal zone), however by Google image provided by PP and other evidence, the area shows CRZ-1A (mudflats), it needs clarification.

5. The Committee suggested to PP for a) compliance of GCZMA recommendation specially development of Bio-diversity Conservation Plan vetted by PCCF (WL); b) mangrove plantation plan with consultation with State Forest Department. Plan should be such that it will avoid mangrove plantation on non-vegetated mudflats which are vital for migratory birds; c) explore the feasibility for supplying brine water to authorized saltpan agencies after necessary treatment etc.

6. The Committee also suggested the PP to check the possibility of the alignment of pipelines to avoid non-vegetated mudflats.

7. Therefore, in view of the above, Committee desired the site visit and deferred the proposal for consideration at a later stage.

3.2 Proposal for development of Malanad Malabar River Cruise Project-Mangrove Cruise Route along Mahe River, Anjarakandi River & Kuppam River, in Kannur & Kasargod Districts by the Director, Department of Tourism, Government of Kerala-CRZ Clearance

[IA/KL/CRZ/228314/2021] [F.No.11/29/2021-IA.III]

“The EAC noted that the Project Proponent has given undertaking that the data and information given in the application and enclosures are true to the best of his knowledge and belief and no information has been suppressed in the EIA/EMP report. If any part of data / information submitted is found to be false / misleading at any stage, the project will be rejected and Environmental and or CRZ Clearance given, if any, will be revoked at the risk and cost of the project proponent.”

The proposal of M/s Department of Tourism, Government of Kerala proposed for development of Malanad Malabar River Cruise Project-Mangrove Cruise Route along Mahe River, Anjarakandi River & Kuppam River, in Kannur & Kasargod Districts in Kerala. The project proponent made a presentation and submitted the following information as under:

- (i) The proposed project is for of Malanad Malabar River Cruise Project-Mangrove Cruise Route along Mahe River, Anjarakandi River & Kuppam River, in Kannur & Kasargod Districts.
- (ii) The associated facilities for the cruise route are planned at four locations along the banks of Anjarakandy River, which falls in CRZ area.
- (iii) The proposed cruise route is passes from Dharmadam to Mambaram. Thus the boarding point will Dharmadam and the destination point will be Mambaram. The total length of route is about 9 Km.
- (iv) The objective of this proposed plan is to explore village life, inland fishing, serene riverine features. The programme will be operated through online registration through the branding and promotional activities.
- (v) The details of proposed location are given below:

Sl. No.	Location	Survey/ No	Taluk	Village	District
1	Dharmadam	88/3	Thalassery	Dharmadam	Kannur
2	Parapram	2/3	Thalassery	Pinarayi	Kannur
3	Cherikkal	2/7	Thalassery	Pinarayi	Kannur
4	Mambaram	2/7	Thalassery	Pathiriyad	Kannur

- (vi) The vessel details of proposed Pazhassiraja and Spices Cruise Route are as:

Vessel	Length (m)	Breadth (m)	Draft (m)	Passenger Capacity
Freedom	12.518	2.914	0.50	25
Marivillu	12.518	2.914	0.50	25
Kopravallam	12.000	2.500	0.27	10

(vii) The details of project facilities at different location along with Built up area:

S. No.	Location	Proposed facilities	Built up area (sqm)	CRZ area
1.	Dharmadam	Boat Terminal	318.42	CRZ-IB & CRZ-IV B
2.	Parapram	Boat Terminal with waiting area	417	CRZ-IB & CRZ-IV B
		Toilet Block	24	CRZ-III (NDZ)
3.	Cherikkal	Boat Terminal with waiting area	418.86	CRZ-IB & CRZ-IV B
4.	Mambaram	Boat Terminal	133.15	CRZ III (NDZ) & CRZ IVB

(viii) The proposed project layout was superimposed on the approved CZMP of the 1:4000 scale map, which was prepared by NCSCM, Chennai.

(ix) The total cost of the project is ₹11.09 Crores.

(x) The Kerala Coastal Zone Management Authority has also recommended the proposal for clearance vide its letter No. 1673/A2/20/KCZMA, dated 16/07/2021.

2. The Committee noted that the proposed project, which is recommended by KCZMA is for **Section 1.** Dharmadam to Mambram river (9 km), **Section 2.** from New Mahe to Peringathur (14.4 km), **Section 3.** from Pazhayangdi to Kattampallikadavu (30.18 km) and **Section 4.** (Handicraft and handloom Cruise Root Along Valiyaparamba Backwaters). However, **the M/s Department of Tourism, Government of Kerala presented only for the Section 1. i.e., from Dharmadam to Mambram river (9 km).**

3. The Committee noted that the instant proposal also includes toilet block in NDZ area, which is non-permissible activity as per the extant norms of CRZ Notification. The Committee also noted that Boat Terminal with waiting room / area proposed in CRZ-IB & CRZ-IV B. The Committee suggested that there shall be clear reflection of the proposed activity with particular proposed area, which should be as per extant norms of the CRZ Notification, 2011 and as amended from time to time.

4. The Committee also advised that number of pillars should be reduced, which interrupt water flow, without compromising safety and stability of the project. Based on these observations, the committee advised to proponent that the proposal need to be revised as per extant norms of CRZ Notification and accordingly, the proposal was deferred for the consideration at a later stage.

3.3 Proposal for additions, alterations and reconstructions of building Wing B of the existing Hospital Known as St. Elizabeth Nursing Home on plot bearing CS No. 192 and 1/193 of Malbar Cumala Hill Division in D Ward, Mumbai by St. Elizabeth Hospital -CRZ Clearance

[IA/MH/CRZ/229009/2021] [F.No.11/30/2021-IA.III]

“The EAC noted that the Project Proponent has given undertaking that the data and information given in the application and enclosures are true to the best of his knowledge and belief and no information has been suppressed in the EIA/EMP report. If any part of data / information submitted is found to be false / misleading at any stage, the project will be rejected and Environmental and or CRZ Clearance given, if any, will be revoked at the risk and cost of the project proponent.”

The proposal of M/s St. Elizabeth Hospital for additions, alterations and reconstructions of building Wing B of the existing Hospital Known as St. Elizabeth Nursing Home on plot bearing CS No. 192 and 1/193 of Malbar Cumala Hill Division in D Ward, Mumbai. The project proponent made a presentation and submitted the following information as under:

- (i) The proposed project is for reconstructions of existing hospital building, Wing B on plot bearing CS No. 192 and 1/193 of Malbar Cumala Hill Division in D Ward, Mumbai.
- (ii) The geo coordinates of the proposed location are 18°56'55.19"N and 72°47'43.60"E
- (iii) The total plot area is 2233.37 Sq. m and built up area is 8550.34 Sq.m
- (iv) The details of the building configuration are as follows:

Structure	Existing Status	MCGM BUA
Wing A	G + 3 Upper Floors	2411.15 Sq. m
Wing B Proposed Development as per DCR 1967	G + 4 Upper floors will be demolished. Proposed building is 2 basements + G + 9 Upper floors in lieu of plot potential + additional FSI (716.14 sq. m) (Proposed area)	2411.15 Sq. m 6139.19 sq. m (IOD approved area vide letter no. P-3591/2019/(192 And Other)/D Ward/MALABAR HILL/342/1/Amend dated 13.02.2021)

- (v) The proposed project involves reconstruction of Wing B. The proposed development of Wing B with 2 basements + Ground +1st to 9th Upper Floor.

- (vi) The total FSI of the proposed area is 3.52. The existing FSI of 2.16 and additional FSI of 1.36 (as per the town planning rules and regulations (DCR 1967).
- (vii) The proposed layout has been approved and the FSI to be utilized, which includes proposed area and existing structure to be retained within permissible limit of 8550.34 Sq. m as mentioned in the plans approved for concessions.
- (viii) The proposed area falls in CRZ-II. The total height of the proposed structure is about 38.10 m.
- (ix) The proposed project site falls under CRZ-II category as per approved CZMP of 2011.
- (x) The proposed project layout was superimposed on the approved CZMP of the 1:4000 scale map, which was prepared by Institute of Remote Sensing, Anna University, Chennai.
- (xi) In the existing provision of car parking total 5 cars & one ambulances in the project premises.
- (xii) The power requirement is 1101 KVA Maximum electrical demand., which will be met from BEST.
- (xiii) The total cost of the project is ₹47.65 Crores.
- (xiv) The Maharashtra Coastal Zone Management Authority has also recommended the proposal for clearance *vide* its letter No. CRZ-2020/CR-83/TC-4 dated 02/03/2021.

2. The Committee noted that the proposed reconstruction of the existing Hospital building, which falls in CRZ-II area and only Wing B will be demolished with the approved FSI. The Committee also noted that the proposed construction involved 2 basements + Ground +1st to 9th Upper Floor.

3. The committee further noted that schematic plans for STP and ETP are required including its final disposal. The Committee also noted that in the instant proposal information is lacking for details of total water requirement, fresh water requirement including its source, total power requirement including power back up, DG set details, solar power augmentation plan, rain water harvesting plan, waste generated during construction and its disposal, total wastes mainly bio-medical waste and its disposal, internal traffic circulation plan including exit and entry, detailed noise and air quality management plan during construction. The Committee suggested providing above mentioned information and deferred the proposal for consideration at a later stage.

4.0 Any other item with the permission of the Chair.

The meeting ended with a Vote of Thanks to the Chair.

List of the Expert Appraisal Committee (CRZ) Members participated during Video Conferencing (VC) Meeting

S. No.	Name of Members	Designation
1.	Dr. Deepak Arun Apte,	Chairman
2.	Dr. Manoranjan Hota	Member
3.	Shri S. Jeyakrishnan	Member
4.	Shri Manmohan Singh Negi	Member
5.	Shri Sham Wagh	Member
6.	Prof. Ashok Kumar Pachauri	Member
7.	Prof. Mukesh Khare	Member
8.	Dr. M.V. Ramana Murthy, Director, NCCR, Chennai	Member
9.	Dr. Niraj Sharma Senior Principal Scientist, Transport Planning, Planning & Environment(TPE) Division, Central Road Research Institute, New Delhi	Member
10.	Dr. H. Kharkwal Additional Director Ministry of Environment, Forest and Climate Change, New Delhi	Member Secretary
11.	Dr. Bhawana Kapkoti Negi Ministry of Environment, Forest and Climate Change, New Delhi	Technical Officer
